### REFORM OF TVET IN VIET NAM PROGRAMME Activity: "Consultancy on TVET policy and system" (Project Code: 17.2058.0-001.00)

Research to enhance the institutional capacity of the Directorate of Vocational Education and Training (DVET) in promoting the industry engagement in TVET

### **RESEARCH REPORT**

### INDUSTRY-LED TVET SYSTEM AND SECTOR SKILLS COUNCIL MODEL

**DECEMBER 2021** 

### **RESEARCH REPORT**

### INDUSTRY-LED TVET SYSTEM AND SECTOR SKILLS COUNCIL MODEL

Published under a cooperation agreement between the Directorate of Vocational Education and Training (DVET) and the Vietnamese-German Cooperation Programme "Reform of TVET in Viet Nam" implemented by the Deutsche Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit (GIZ) on behalf of Germany's Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development (BMZ).





### **QR Code**

#### FOREWORD

Vocational Education and Training (VET) plays an important role in the development of skilled human resources in each country. In order for VET to meet the needs of the labour market, governments of many countries have developed TVET according to the "industry-led approach", which focuses on the role of sector skills bodies/councils (hereinafter collectively referred to as industry skills councils or SSC). Many countries have established SSCs; although these councils have different names and legal frameworks from country to country, what they have in common is that they represent the voice of a particular industry and act as a bridge among enterprises, employers, the Government, training institutions and other stakeholders in vocational training and skills development.

In Viet Nam, industry engagement is identified as one of the key solutions in TVET development. Since 2016, SSC model has been piloted and established in a number of projects funded by the Governments of Germany, Australia, Denmark and the Russian Federation. The Labour Code 2019 reserves a separate Chapter on the development of TVET and occupational skills, which for the first time stipulates that the state shall adopt a policy to encourage employers to provide vocational training and develop occupational skills for their own employees and for the society through "joining the sector skills council". This is also the first time that the regulation related to the sector skills council has been included in a legal document.

In recent past, the considerations related to the establishment of SSC have attracted a lot of attention from the society, which is expected as a breakthrough solution to enhance the quality of TVET in the coming period. The VET development strategy for the period 2021-2030, with a vision to 2045, approved by the Prime Minister on December 30, 2021, has identified the solution "Pilot setting up a number of sector skill councils for key (groups of) industries in the 2021-2025 period, on the basis of assessment and reflections of which to expand to others in the 2026-2030 period".

This consulting report aims to support DVET in studying and piloting the establishment of SSC to implement the said Strategy. The report was produced in a short time, from October to December 2021, within the framework of the "Reform of TVET in Viet Nam" Programme authorized by the German Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development (BMZ) and implemented by the Deutsche Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit (GIZ) in collaboration with DVET, Ministry of Labour, Invalids and Social Affairs. This is an activity to strengthen the institutional capacity of DVET in promoting the industry engagement in TVET, hence contributing to realizing the goal of open and flexible TVET, meeting the labour market requirements and the economy.

#### The report consists of three main parts:

- Part I. International experience on the industry-led TVET system and the SSC model, which presents models of three developed countries, i.e., Denmark, Australia and Germany; provides a brief overview of the SSC model of two developing countries, i.e., Cambodia and Jordan; and summarizes the key research results of some recent international documents on the SSC model.

- Part II. Current status on the pilot establishment and operation of SSC in Viet Nam

- Part III. Recommendations on the SSC model for Viet Nam in the 2021-2025 period.

**Research procedure:** The study was carried out according to the following steps:

- Researching and synthesizing legal documents and related research papers by domestic and foreign authors;

- Conducting interviews with relevant stakeholders to confirm observations and gather more information;

- Producing draft report;

- Conducting consultations with 16 experts including representatives of line ministries and agencies (Ministry of Finance, Ministry of Industry and Trade, Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development, Ministry of Culture, Sports and Tourism), VCCI, associations, enterprises, vocational colleges on the draft report using questions outlined by the Research Team (that is, experts read the draft report and provided their comments according to the questions provided).

- Gathering consultation opinions as inputs for finalizing the draft report.

The Research Team would hereby like to express it sincere gratitude to the Directorate of Vocational Education and Training (DVET), leaders of the "Reform of TVET in Viet Nam" Programme (GIZ), partner organizations and experts for their support and contributions or the Research Team to finalize this Report. The Research Team welcomes further comments from the readership.

Research Team:

- Formal Training Department, DVET:

Dr.Vu Xuan Hung - Director

Msc. Pham Thi Minh Hien - Officer

- Independent consultants:

Assoc.Prof.Dr. Mac Van Tien – Team Leader

Dr. Le Thanh Nhu - Member

Dr. Nguyen Ngoc Trang - Member

### TABLE OF CONTENTS

| TABLE OF CONTENTS   | 5                 |
|---|-------------------|
| PART I: INTERNATIONAL EXPERIENCE ON THE INDUSTRY-LED VET SYSTEI<br>MODEL  |                   |
| <ol> <li>INDUSTRY-LED TVET SYSTEM AND SSC MODEL OF DENMARK, AUSTRALIA AND O<br/>The model in Denmark</li></ol>  | 7<br>             |
| PART II: CURRENT STATUS ON THE PILOT ESTABLISHMENT AND OPERATI IN VIET NAM  |                   |
| <ol> <li>OVERVIEW OF RESEARCH AND PROMULGATION OF REGULATIONS, GUIDELINES AN<br/>RELATED TO SSC</li> <li>II. SUMMARY OF SSC PILOT MODELS THAT HAVE BEEN UNDER IMPLEMENTATION IN</li> <li>1. Tourism and Hospitality SSC in Viet Nam Model</li></ol> |                   |
| IV. LESSONS LEARNED<br>PART III: RECOMMENDATIONS ON THE SSC MODEL FOR VIET NAM IN THE 2<br>PERIOD   |                   |
| I. RECOMMENDATIONS:<br>II. KEY DETERMINANTS FOR THE SUCCESSFUL PILOTING:<br>III. SUGGESTED CONTENTS FOR FURTHER RESEARCH TO ACCOMMODATE THE DEVE<br>IMPLEMENTATION OF THE PILOT MODEL   | 61<br>LOPMENT AND |

| ANNEX 1: INDUSTRY REFERENCE COMMITTEES (IRCS) IN AUSTRALIA | 63 |
|--|----|
| REFERENCES   | 66 |

### PART I: INTERNATIONAL EXPERIENCE ON THE INDUSTRY-LED VET SYSTEM AND SSC MODEL

# I. Industry-led TVET system and SSC model of Denmark, Australia and Germany

The prominent feature of an industry-led TVET system is that the "industry" is the centre of the TVET system, the "sector" plays the role of "notifying" or initiating the development of new training programmes and building occupational skills standards for the training. This feature is clearly reflected in the VET system and the SSC model of the three countries presented below.

### 1. The model in Denmark

### **1.1. Brief introduction of Denmark:**

Denmark's area is 43,000 km<sup>2</sup> (ranked 130<sup>th</sup> in the world).

Its population is more than 5.8 million people (ranked 113<sup>th</sup> in the world) (data in 2021).

Denmark is a constitutional monarchy with a parliamentary system in which the executive branch of the government depends on the direct or indirect permission of the parliament. It has a state-level government and local governments and 98 municipalities.

GDP (in 2019) was \$350 billion (ranked 52<sup>nd</sup> in the world) and GDP per capita was \$55,900 (ranked 20<sup>th</sup> in the world).

### 1.2. Danish VET system:

**1.2.1. Streaming into VET:** 38% of students at the upper secondary level participate in VET programmes (2018).

#### 1.2.2. Number of VET trainees: 108,605 (in 2019).

**1.2.3. Number of TVET institutes:** a total of 107 institutions (of which 26 are private).

### **1.2.4. Training programme:**

The vocational education and training system (VET system) offers more than 100 different types of vocational training programmes. Each of the training programmes can lead to a number of vocational specializations. All VET programmes provide opportunities for learners to progress to higher levels, including further study in higher education at levels 5 and 6 of the EQF.<sup>1</sup>

"Eux Programme" is a VET-programme which combines a general upper secondary education and vocational education and training – eux. Eux qualifies students for a job as well as giving them direct access to higher education in a wide range of programmes, i.e. leading to a journeyman's certificate as well as the general upper secondary diploma.

"Euv Programme" is the one for people above 25 years. They have access to VET programmes designed especially for adults on the basis of recognition of prior learning and relevant work experience, which leads to the same vocational qualifications.

#### Structure of the VET programme:

Training programmes include basic programmes and main programmes. The basic programme takes the first year, ending with an exam and then the main programme. The basic programme is a school-based course, while the main programme is built on a dual principle, in which learners alternate between school and workplace apprenticeship.

*Basic programmes* include basic programme 1 and basic programme 2 with a total length of 20 weeks each. VET-students enrolled directly after finishing compulsory general education will start on the basic programme 1, while adult learners (over 25 years old) will begin basic programme 2. Basic programme 1 will give learners a broad vocational knowledge and competencies. They will get an overview of the different programmes in order to choose the appropriate basic programme 2. Basic programme 2 is the one that learners choose, ending with a test before entering the main programme.

#### Main programme

The main programme of the Danish VET is based on the alternating principle of school-based education and training at the workplace. The learners must therefore have a training agreement with an approved company which offers training. The main programme typically takes 3 to 3½ years, but can be shorter or longer for certain programmes. Main programmes are offered at EQF level 3 (1.5 years), at EQF level 4 (3 years) and some programmes at EQF level 5 (5 years).

In the main programme, learners have to take a number of tests, depending on the training discipline and occupation, in which the learners who finish the programme must complete a final professional exam to assess their vocational knowledge, skills and competencies in the actual work environment. The final

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The European Qualifications Framework (EQF) consists of 8 levels from level 1 to level 8, where level 5 of EQF is equivalent to college qualification and level 6 equivalent to university qualification in Viet Nam.

exam has a structure that combines theory and practice. There are final exams organized by the Trade Committees. These Committees make regulations regarding final exams.

### New Apprenticeship

Students who prefer practical training to school can set their vocational education in a company which offers practical training, also referred to as the "New Apprenticeship": The student enters a training agreement with a company and during the first year the student is expected to acquire the same knowledge and qualifications as the students who have followed the basic programme at a VET college. This requires flexibility on the part of the student, the company and the college.

### 1.2.5. VET Governance

The Danish VET governance model is shown in the diagram below:



Source: Ministry of Children and Education

(i) The Advisory Council for Initial Vocational Education and Training (IVET Council): The Advisory Council for Initial Vocational Education and Training (Rådet for de Grundlæggende Erhvervsrettede Uddannelser – REU) is the one with representatives from all stakeholders in the VET system, comprises 25 members from the social partners, the school leader and teacher associations as well as a number of members appointed by the Ministry of Children and Education. The chairperson is appointed by the Minister of Children and Education. REU is responsible for the following:

- Providing advice to the Ministry of Children and Education on policy and quality issues related to TVET;

- Monitoring labour market trends and on this basis recommending the establishment of new VET qualifications, the adaptation of existing ones or discontinuation.

- Monitoring existing programmes and, based on its findings, for making recommendations for better coordination between programmes or the merging of programmes.

The establishment and mandate of REU are specified in Articles 34 and 35 of the Danish Law on Vocational Education, of which Item 9, Article 34 stipulates that the Danish Ministry of Children and Education provides secretarial support for REU including human resources and working location. Except the chairperson who is appointed by the Minister of Children and Education and receives a monthly fee, other members of the Council are appointed by other organizations and receive no fees. The appointment of the Council members takes into account organizational and political interests.

(ii) Ministry of Children and Education: The Parliament sets out the overall framework for VET, which is administered by the Ministry of Children and Education. The Ministry is furthermore responsible for:

- The Ministry has overall parliamentary, financial and legal responsibility for VET, laying down the overall objectives for programmes and providing the legislative framework within which stakeholders, social partners, colleges and enterprises are able to adapt curricula and methodologies to the needs of both learners and the labour market.

- Approving new VET qualifications on the basis of recommendations from the Advisory Council for Initial Vocational Education and Training, and for approving the colleges that are to provide the basic and main programmes in VET.

- Laying down the overall rules for VET – in cooperation with the REU – and drawing up the regulations on each VET programme – in cooperation with national trade committees. The regulations are supplemented with guidelines drawn up by

the trade committees and issued by the Ministry (please see Facts about the national legislative framework, page 26).

- Quality assurance and efficient use of resources.

- Identifying the institutional framework for the educational, economic and legal management of TVET institutes and provide funding for the training portion of the TVET institutes (the basic programme and the training portion at the VET institutes in the main programme).

(iii) National trade committees. National trade committees (faglige udvalg) constitute the backbone of the VET system. Approximately 50 trade committees are responsible for more than 100 main programmes. The committees are formed by labour market organisations (with parity of membership between employer and employee organisations). Article 37 of the Law on Vocational Education stipulates that organizations shall establish a trade committee and do secretarial work of the committee. Therefore, trade committees (also known as social partners) self-finance their activities. They can apply for funding from ministries through educational development activities, surveys and can receive funding directly through a tripartite agreement among the Government, the employer and workers.

The responsibilities of the National trade committees are as follows:

- The trade committees are responsible for the main training programmes (main programmes), specializations, durations, structures, exams, entrance qualifications of the main programmes, etc.; for the continuous adaptation and development of the VET programmes; the committees monitor the skills development in the labour market and, on that basis, recommend changes to existing programmes; they may also recommend the establishment of new VET programmes or the discontinuation of outdated VET programmes.

- Another important aspect of the trade committees' scope of work is the approval of training places. In order to be approved, an enterprise must have a certain level of technology and a variety of tasks to be performed that will ensure the trainee a full range of activities and tasks corresponding to the qualification requirements of a skilled worker.

- Finally, the trade committees are responsible for the journeyman's test and for issuing certificates to trainees (technical training).

(iv) Local training committees: Local training committees ensure close contact between vocational colleges and the local community, improving responsiveness to particular local labour market needs. They consist of representatives of organizations which are members of the National trade committees, appointed by national trade committees at the request of localities/organizations, as well as representatives of staff, management and students appointed by college. The local training committees acts as an advisor to the colleges in all matters relating to VET programs within their jurisdiction and

promotes cooperation between colleges and local labor market for with a particular industry. There is a (traditional) division of labor between the Ministry of Education and Children and the social partners: The ministry is responsible for the school-based training while the social partners are in charge of work-based training program.

(v) VET providers: As self-governing institutions, vocational colleges are led by a governing board with overall responsibility for the administrative and financial running of the college and educational activities in accordance with regulations. Colleges assume everyday responsibility for teaching and examination.

The colleges are independent public institutions with their own board of governors. The majority of the members must reflect the working areas of the college. Employers' and employees' organisations in the colleges' board of governors must be represented in equal numbers and must represent the geographical area or the sectorial areas of the college's VET provision. In addition, the teachers and trainees of the college are represented on the board. The colleges have relative autonomy vis-à-vis the budgeting, organisational and pedagogical strategies and the local planning of the VET programmes...

The colleges are responsible for the local planning of the VET programmes in cooperation with the local training committees. The content of the training is laid down in a local education plan, corresponding to the general regulations and guidelines for the specific VET qualification. The overall elements of the local education plan are laid down in the Act on Vocational Education and Training, which stipulates, for example, that the local education plan must include a description of the pedagogical, didactical and methodological principles for the training, including a description of how the trainees are involved in the planning and implementation of teaching. The local education plan must also include descriptions of teacher qualifications, technical equipment, cooperation between the college, the learners and the enterprises, the personal education plan and logbook, etc.

### (vi) Enterprises in Denmark

Enterprises are at the heart of the Danish VET system, with two-thirds of TVET programmes being implemented in enterprises. All enterprises that are approved by the National Trade Committees can enrol apprentices. The enterprises can be approved to take up the whole training period or for part of the training period. In order to be approved, an enterprise must have a certain level of technology and must be able to offer the trainee a variety of tasks, which ensures him/ her qualifications corresponding to those of a skilled worker in the chosen occupation. To comply with these requirements and support the training process, enterprises can seek support from the relevant national trade committees, local training committees or local VET colleges. In fact, industry-specific local training

committees make decisions during the approval process as they often have more insight into local enterprises than national trade committees do. Enterprises can obtain support from local training committees and VET colleges on matters such as the recruitment process, dealing with legal aspects and the process of introducing occupational standards into training.

## **1.2.6.** Responsibilities of relevant stakeholders regarding national qualification standards and curriculum

(National) Trade Committees in an industry or sector are responsible for initiating new qualifications and curriculum proposals based on skills assessments and forecasts. A template/framework for describing qualifications and proposing curriculum is provided by the Ministry of Children and Education. Competency standards are required to adhere to the objectives and general rules of knowledge, skills and competency requirements, etc. to ensure that all VET programmes meet the needs of the labour market, ensure post-training employability and serve economic development.

- Regarding the curriculum:

The learning objectives (competency objectives) proposed by the (National) Trade Committees include both learning at school, in companies, learning in the basic programme and in the main programme. This also includes the proposed duration and structure of the main VET programme, including the corresponding study load at school and in the workplace. On this basis, the Ministry of Children and Education and the National Trade Committees will have close dialogues to finalize the proposal. This proposal will be submitted to the Advisory Council for Initial Vocational Education and Training for consultation and then approved by the Minister of Children and Education.

The national curriculum is approved by an executive regulation. To launch a new training programme, TVET institutes will have to apply for accreditation and trade committees will consult on the number of training institutions needed to deliver a new programme.

On the part of training institutes, they cooperate with local training committees (each occupation in a locality has a local training committee) to develop a local curriculum for each programme they train to ensure that the programme meets local realities.

The diagram that illustrates the process of approving national curriculum, developing and adjusting local curriculum is as follows:



- Coordinate with local training committees to develop local curriculum (TVET institutes and enterprises may adjust curriculum)

## Summary and analysis of the key features of the Danish industry-led VET system and the SSC model are as follows:

1. Industry/enterprises participate in all levels of governance of the Danish TVET system including (i) the Advisory Council for Initial Vocational Education and Training at central level, (ii) national trade committees, local training committees and (iii) board of governance at vocational institutions.

2. Industry/enterprise plays a pivotal role in developing skill standards and training programmes. Specifically, industry/enterprise initiates new training occupations as well as stops outdated training programmes and supplements the current programme for adaptation, propose occupational skills standards and national curriculum for approval by the Ministry of Children and Education; Enterprises and training institutions can decide to adjust the training programme, and determine the local curriculum.

3. Unlike Germany where, in addition to dual training, there are also fulltime school-based training programmes, 100% of the training programmes in Denmark follow the dual training model (in Denmark, the programmes consist of the basic programmes and the main programmes, with the former offered at the school while the latter both at the school and at the workplace in an alternate manner). Enterprises can undertake part or all of the training programme. The training part in companies is regulated by the National Trade Committees and quality is controlled through procedures for permitting training, stipulating and implementing the end-of-term examination and assessment, stipulating training objectives and conditions... Thus, the role of the industry/enterprise in VET is very large; enterprises directly make regulations for the training part at the enterprise.

4. Regarding the SSC composition: There are three levels of councils: (i) the Advisory Council for Initial Vocational Education and Training (which can be seen as the "umbrella" council) is the focal point to gather opinions from the national trade committees to advise the Government; (ii) national trade committees (50 industry-specific committees) and (iii) local training committees. The National Trade Committees are the backbone with an equal number of members between employers and workers. The National Trade Committees are affiliated with the local training committees because the latter consists of members representing the organisations represented on the former and they are appointed by the former upon recommendation from the local branches/affiliates of the organisations.

The National Trade Committees of Denmark take on both advisory responsibilities (advice on skill standards, training programmes, number of training institutions in an industry, etc.) and legal responsibilities (approval of enterprises which are allowed to provide training, regulate and organize the final exam of the main programme in the curriculum, etc.).

Membership of the National Trade Committees is bipartite (workers and employers), whereas the membership of local training committees are multipartite (enterprises, colleges, teachers and trainees).

With regard to the operating budget, the National Trade Committees selffinance their activities

### 2. The model in Australia

#### 2.1. Brief introduction of Australia:

Area: 7,741,330 km<sup>2</sup> (ranked 7th in the world)

Population: nearly 25.8 million people (ranked 55th in the world)

The Australian Government, also known as the Commonwealth Government, is the national government of Australia, a federal parliamentary constitutional monarchy. There are three levels of government within the country, namely the Commonwealth (federal), state or territory, and local level. The Commonwealth of Australia consists of eight states and territories, namely the Australian Capital Territory, New South Wales, the Northern Territory, Queensland, South Australia, Tasmania, Victoria and Western Australia.

Australia's GDP (in 2019): 1.390 billion USD (ranked 18<sup>th</sup> in the world)

GDP per capita: 49,500 USD (ranked 30<sup>th</sup> in the world)

### 2.2. Australian TVET system:

**2.2.1. VET participation rate:** the VET participation rate in 15 to 19 age group is 46.1% (in 2017).

**2.2.2. Number of VET students:** 4.2 million students build and sharpen their skills through the VET system each year – that's one in four working age Australians.

2.2.3. Number of registered training organisations:

There are six main types of registered training organisations or RTOs in the Australian VET system: (i) Private RTOs — There are more than 3,000 private RTOs in Australia, and they attract over 55% of all VET enrolments, (ii) TAFE Institutes — There are a small number of TAFE institutes in Australia, but they attract more than 25% of all VET enrolments, (iii) Community RTOs — Community-owned, not-for-profit RTOs attract around 5% of all VET enrolments, (iv) Schools — More than 400 Australian secondary schools also operate as RTOs, and they attract around 5% of all VET enrolments, (v) Enterprise RTOs — mainly deliver training to their own employees, and they attract less than 5% of all VET enrolments, (vi) Universities — a small number of Australian universities also operate as RTOs, and they attract less than 5% of all VET enrolments.

### 2.2.4. Training programmes

The Australian Qualifications Framework (AQF) has ten levels with 14 qualification types. Seven of the 10 AQF levels and eight qualification types apply to the Australian VET system, of which:

- six levels under university level (Certificate I to IV, with duration from 0.5 to 2 years), Diploma (level 5), Advanced Diploma (level 6, with duration from 1.5 to 2 years)
- one level above university (level 8), i.e., Graduate Certificate (0.5 1 years); and Graduate Diploma (1-2 years).

Students can choose from more than 1,450 qualifications, which are built on the basis of training packages and accredited courses. Currently, there are 68 training packages which contain more than 17,000 units of competency, 1,450 qualifications and 1,300 skill sets; 750 accredited courses which contain more than 3,550 units of competency and modules.

Training packages describe the skills and knowledge that individuals need to perform effectively in the workplace. They are developed through a process of

national consultation with industry, and they contain nationally recognised qualifications required for particular occupations.

Training packages contain a set of nationally endorsed components and a collection of non-endorsed components as follows:

| Nationally endorsed components       |  |  |
|--------------------------------------|--|--|
| Component                            | Description  |  |
| Units of competency                  | Standards of performance required in the workplace   |  |
| Assessment evidence and requirements | Evidence and required requirements conditions for assessment associated with each unit of competency         |  |
| Qualifications                       | Packaging rules for qualifications that are consistent with the Australian Qualifications Framework (AQF)    |  |
| Credit arrangements                  | Existing arrangements between the training package qualifications and higher education qualifications        |  |
| Non-endorsed components              |  |  |
| Skill sets                           | Single units of competency (or logical groupings of units) which meet an identified need or industry outcome |  |
| Quality assured                      | Implementation guidance to assist RTO's interpret<br>and understand the nationally endorsed<br>components    |  |

Training packages are developed with public funds and are available in the public domain for relevant stakeholders to search and freely download for use.

Training packages do not prescribe how an individual should be trained. RTOs use training packages to design learning programmes and strategies that assist people to gain – or to demonstrate that they possess – the skills and knowledge specified in units of competency. Accredited courses are developed to address the skill needs and requirements of an industry, enterprise or a community where these are not covered in a nationally endorsed training package. They have the capacity to address changes in skill needs in a responsive manner. A course can be accredited in one of two ways in Australia's VET system: (1) as a short course (the title of this type of course starts with the words 'Course in...' as opposed to 'Certificate in...' or 'Diploma of...', and graduates receive a statement of attainment) or (2) as a qualification recognised within the AQF.

An accredited course can be based on a combination of the following:

- Nationally endorsed units of competency (imported from training packages);

- Enterprise units of competency (developed as part of the course if there are no available training package units of competency.

Accredited courses are generally developed with private funds and are privately owned. The copyright owner of an accredited course can impose fees or conditions on its use. While the content of accredited courses is not publicly available, contact details of the copyright owner are listed on the National Register of VET. When a course has been accredited, it means it is nationally recognised and that an RTO can issue a nationally recognised qualification or statement of attainment following its full or partial completion.

#### 2.2.5. VET Governance

Federal Minister covering VET is the Minister for the Department of Education, Skills and Employment.

Skills Ministers comprise Federal, State and Territory Ministers with responsibility for VET/Skills; are responsible for delivering a shared vision for Australia's VET system and constitute the highest level of VET governance.

The Australian vocational education and training (VET) system is nationally regulated. Every course and training organisation is risk-assessed against nationally approved quality standards by one of the following independent statutory agencies – also known as VET regulators:

• The Australian Skills Quality Authority (ASQA) is the national regulator for Australia's VET system. 90% of RTOs and 69% of accredited courses are regulated by ASQA. Established in 2011, ASQA is the regulatory body for VET in the following states and territories, namely: Australian Capital Territory; New South Wales; Northern Territory; Queensland; South Australia and Tasmania. • Victorian Registration and Qualifications Authority (VRQA). 5% of RTOs and 19% of accredited courses are regulated by VRQA; VRQA is the regulatory body for VET in Victoria.

• Training Accreditation Council (TAC) Western Australia. 5% of RTOS and 12% of accredited courses are regulated by TAC; TAC is the regulatory body for VET in Western Australia.

Registered Training Organisations (RTO): To become an RTO, an organisation must meet a range of mandatory requirements to ensure its training and assessment services are delivered to the high standards expected by students and employers. The applied standards will depend on the state or territory in which the RTO operates. The three above-mentioned regulators are responsible for managing RTO against the applicable quality standards.

### 2.2.6. Australian Apprenticeships/Traineeships

Australian Apprenticeships (often referred to as apprenticeships or traineeships) provide opportunities to train, study and earn an income in a wide range of occupations and trades. Apprentices and trainees are usually employed under a federal or state award or agreement. Their wage depends on a number of factors, including the year of training they are in (e.g. first year, second year etc.), the type of apprenticeship or traineeship they are undertaking and the industry they are working in. Australian Apprenticeships can take between one and four years to complete, depending on the type of programme and the qualification involved. Training pathways and durations for apprenticeships and traineeships are set by each state and territory in consultation with industry. They are available at all qualification levels up to Advanced Diploma (equivalent to college level in Viet Nam). Australian Apprenticeships combine time at work with training, and they can be undertaken full-time, part-time or school-based. Those who complete their training receive a nationally recognised qualification that that is held in high regard in many overseas countries.

# 2.2.7. Responsibilities of relevant stakeholders relating to training packages:

A new model for developing and maintaining training packages came into effect on the 1st of January 2016, according to which the Industry Skills Councils (11 ISCs<sup>2</sup>) were replaced with new Australian Industry and Skills Committee

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> The 11 national Industry Skills Councils (ISCs), namely: (Agri-Food Industry Skills Council; Innovation & Business Skills Australia; Community Services & Health Industry Skills Council; Manufacturing Skills Australia; Construction and Property Services Industry Skills Council; Skills DMC Industry Skills Council; EE-Oz Training Standards; Services Skills Australia; Government Skills Australia; Transport & Logistics Industry Skills Council; ForestWorks), cover the skills needs of most Australian industry. In general terms these organisations work to involve industry with the development of nationally applicable vocational education and training. ISCs are privately registered companies run by industry-based boards of directors, but whose funding is provided

(AISC) model. The new Australian Industry and Skills Committee (AISC) will work closely with Skills Service Organisations (SSOs) and Industry Reference Committees (IRCs) to develop training packages to closely align them with current industry practices and people.

In May 2020 the Prime Minister announced that the former Council of Australian Governments (COAG) ceased and a new architecture for federal relations was established. The new architecture includes the following:

(i) Skills National Cabinet Reform Committee, a time-limited committee supporting ongoing reforms and the Skills Ministers' Meeting (SMM), which provides an ongoing forum for national cooperation on the VET sector.

(ii) The Australian Industry and Skills Committee (AISC). AISC is responsible for developing training packages in the Australian TVET system and recommends national training package products to the Skills Ministers for endorsement. Endorsed products are then listed on the National Register (training.gov.au) for implementation by Registered Training Organisations. The Australian Skills and Industry Council provides advice to Commonwealth, and State and Territory Governments on the training needs of industry and gives industry a formal voice in the Australian VET system and coordinates, manages the development and approval of qualifications/training programmes.

The AISC operates in a partnership arrangement across the national training system. This includes the Australian Government, Industry Reference Committees (IRCs), Skills Services Organisations (SSOs), state and territory governments and regulators within the VET sector. This makes the AISC the key conduit for industry advice to Government on the quality, relevance and responsiveness of Australia's VET sector. Industry engagement is crucial to the work of the AISC to ensure the VET sector delivers high quality, relevant and responsive training to meet the needs of industry, employers and students.

Each member of the AISC is nominated by the Australian Government or state and territory ministers responsible for skills and training. The AISC also has a rotating member from Australia's key peak industry associations, as well as two ex-officio members, currently senior Australian Government officials. This combination of skills, leadership and expertise ensure the AISC operates with strong partnerships, bringing together the diverse range of stakeholders that makes up Australia's VET sector. It will decide on needs with qualifications, which training programmes to offer and when they are required.

(iii) Industry Reference Committees (IRC): IRCs, with support from the Skills Services Organization (SSO), advise the Australian Skills and Industry Council (AISC). The Committees are made up of people with experience, skills and

substantially by the Australian Government through the Department of Education, Employment and Workplace Relations.

knowledge of particular industry sectors which will ensure that training packages meet the needs of employers. Members includes leaders in their own sectors from big business to small enterprise and peak bodies to unions, who understand the skills needs of their sector, industry or occupation. IRCs ensure training packages meet the needs and concerns of employers, employees, training providers, and people seeking training qualifications. *(The list of all IRCs can be found in the Annex).* 

(iv) Skills Service Organisations (SSOs) are independent, professional service organisations that support IRCs in their work developing and reviewing training packages. SSOs provide this supporting role while remaining independent from industry and the training sector, and each SSO provides support services to several IRCs. There are six SSOs funded by the Australian Government Department of Education and Training, namely: Artibus Innovation; Australian Industry Standards; Innovation & Business Skills Australia, ; PWC's Skills for Australia; Skills Impact; and Skills IQ.



Australian VET governance and SSC model Diagram

## Summary and analysis of key features of the Australian industry-led VET system model SSC (with comparison with Denmark):

1. Industry and enterprises participate in consulting at (i) Australian Industry and Skills Committee (AISC) (which can be seen as an "umbrella" body similar to Denmark's Advisory Council for Initial Vocational Education and Training (IVET Council). AISC provides advices to the Government on industry skills needs and develops training packages; (ii) Industry Reference Councils (IRCs) advise the AISC and obtain support from Skills Service Organisations (SSOs) (organizations specializing in developing training packages).

The Australian Industry Reference Councils (IRCs) have much in common with the Danish (National) Trade Committees.

2. Similar to Denmark, Australian industry/enterprises play a decisive role on skills standards and training programmes by proposing training packages for approval by Skills Ministers.

3. With regard to the implementation of training programmes: Industry/enterprises directly train apprentices in **the Australian Apprenticeship Programme** - which provides the opportunity to study and earn income while studying (similar to the new internship programme of Denmark).

4. Regarding the SSC structure/composition: there are two levels including (i) the Australian Industry and Skills Council (AISC) (the "umbrella" body), (ii) the Industry Reference Councils (IRCs) that assist the AISC. The IRC is supported by Skills Service Organizations (SSOs). Only a few states have state-level SSCs that are not part of the federal structure.

The tasks of AISC and IRC are advisory in nature, with the main task of consulting on training packages, without the legal responsibility of the National Trade Committees of Denmark (the Danish National Trade Committees approve the enterprises to participate in training, regulates and implements the end-of-term examinations).

AISC membership is bipartite including enterprises and government members. The AISC also has a rotating member from Australia's key peak industry associations. Membership of the IRC is multipartite, including leaders in their own sectors from big business to small enterprise and peak bodies to unions.

Budget for Australia's SSCs is funded by the Government.

### 3. The model in Federal Republic of Germany:

### 3.1. Brief introduction of the Federal Republic of Germany:

The area is 357,022 km<sup>2</sup> (ranked 64th in the world).

The population is more than 83 million (ranked 18<sup>th</sup> in the world and second in Europe (after Russia).

Germany is a federal republic, parliamentary and representative democracy - a form of democratic state run by representatives of the people on the principle of exercising democracy by the people. Germany consists of 16 states, each of which is a sovereign entity, has its own constitution, parliament, government, and courts.

GDP in 2021 reached estimated 4,843B USD (ranked 5th in the world) and GDP per capita 58,150 USD (ranked 15th in the world).

### 3.2. German VET system

### 3.2.1. Streaming into VET

More than a third of secondary school graduates in Germany choose to participate in vocational training programme, of which one-third continue to study in full-time schools (school-based VET) and the other two-thirds follow a dual VET programme (1/3 of the time spent at school, the other 2/3 in companies).

**3.2.2. Number of trainees:** 225,590 full-time vocational students, 490,267 apprentices/trainees studying dual training system (data as of 2017).

# 3.2.3. Number of vocational training institutions and enterprises participating in vocational training

Vocational training schools(full-time vocational training at the school): a total of 1,494 schools, of which 195 are private schools (accounting for 13%). Vocational schools cooperate with about 430,000 enterprises and more than 80% of large enterprises enrol apprentices.

### 3.2.4. VET programmes

VET programmes include upper secondary school and post-secondary and tertiary levels.<sup>3</sup> The upper secondary school programmes are of two types: full-time school-based VET and dual VET (with a focus on work-based learning) in which dual VET is considered the main pillar of the German VET system. In addition, there are additional training programmes (additional qualifications) that

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> The revised Vocational Training Act 2020, promotes higher VET by underlining the equivalence to academic education through new designations of bachelor professional and master professional, equivalent to levels 5 to 7 of EQF.

allow learners and graduates to respond to the changing needs of the labour market.

### - School-based VET programmes

Entry requirement is the grade 9 or 10 graduation; there programmes are EQF level 4, with duration from one to three years. The duration differs depending on the occupational field and the level of qualification. School-based VET programmes are offered at full-time at vocational schools (Berufsfachschule). Work-based learning is offered directly in schools or/and in form of traineeships. School-based VET programmes are decided by the state government.

### - Dual VET (apprenticeship)

Entry requirement is the completion of compulsory education, without a school leaving certificate (nine years or ten years in five Federal States) young people have low prospects of finding a training company (in 2018, only 3.5% of the new apprentices had no school leaving certificate). Apprenticeship programmes (EQF level 3-4, duration two to three and a half years) are the main pillar of the German VET system. High-school graduates can reduce training duration to about 12 months, which makes it an attractive alternative to higher education. They take place in at least two learning venues: companies and vocational schools. The training content offered in companies is set according to the training regulations for in-company training and the training content at the vocational schools is decided by the state government. The content of training programmes in companies and vocational schools must be suitable and complement each other.

Enterprises and public institutions offer apprenticeship places and sign a contract with apprentices. They bear the costs of the in-company training and pay the apprentice remuneration. To guarantee a uniform standard, learning is completed by final exams that are regulated by law and executed by the chambers. This point is similar to that in Denmark, where the national vocational council regulates and implements the final exam for learners who complete the main programme.

### 3.2.5. VET Governance

In line with the Constitution, the responsibility for the education system belongs to the Federal States, but the Federal Government has the jurisdiction for the regulation of in-company training, as follows:

### - National level:

The federal government is responsible for the non-school part of VET and ensures that vocational training is always up to date. The Federal Ministry of Education and Research (BMBF) is responsible for general VET policy issues; it coordinates and guides VET policy development for all training occupations. It implements strategies and programmes to promote and improve VET. BMBF is responsible for monitoring developments in VET and presenting their findings in annual reports. It is supported in this by the Federal Institute for Vocational Education and Training (BiBB), which publishes the accompanying VET data report. BIBB's four-party board, consisting of representatives of employers, trade unions, Federal States and the Federal Government, is an executive body and acts as the statutory advisory organ of the Federal Government. BIBB's mandated tasks include developing VET, identifying future challenges in VET, conducting research and providing advice and services to the Federal Government (for example supporting the BMBF in setting up standards).

### - Regional/State level

At regional/state level, the State ministries of education and cultural affairs are in charge of training contents in vocational institutions. To ensure a certain degree of uniformity among the Federal States in aspects such as programme names, duration and curricula of certain programmes, the State ministers participate in the standing committee (Standing Conference of the Ministers of Education and Cultural Affairs, Kultusministerkonferenz, KMK), where recommendations are brought forward; these need to pass individual State parliaments before becoming legally binding. Vocational training committees, in which members equally represent employers, employees and the highest State authorities, advise the State government on vocational training issues.

### - Competent bodies:

Competent bodies (zuständige Stellen) are mainly represented by professional chambers; where no chamber exists for a certain professional field, the Land defines the competent body. Each competent body sets up a tripartite vocational training committee, composed of representatives of employers, trade unions and teachers. These committees must be informed and consulted on all important VET issues and decide on regulations for implementing VET. Competent bodies are responsible for vocational training in the industrial sector and region they represent. In dual training, competent bodies:

- (a) ensure the suitability of training centres;
- (b) monitor training in enterprises;
- (c) advise apprentices, vocational trainers and enterprises;
- (d) establish and maintain lists of training contracts;
- (e) organise exams.
- Social partners

Social partner representatives are members of the BIBB's main board, of the vocational training committees at Federal States level and in the competent bodies. Social partner contributions at different levels are important, as they ensure that vocational training responds to labour market needs. The social partners are involved in:

- (a) collectively defining agreed training allowances;
- (b) drafting occupational standards requirements;
- (c) developing new training regulations and framework curricula;
- (d) assuring quality of initial VET;
- (e) referencing process of German qualifications framework (DQR) to EQF.

## 3.2.6. Responsibilities of relevant agencies for developing and updating training regulations for the in-company training

Each training occupation specifies its own training regulations for the incompany training. In 2019, out of the 324 existing training regulations, four were updated, and three newly developed training regulations entered into force. Training regulations are comprised of the following: (a) title of the recognised training occupation; (b) duration of training (between two and three years); (c) training occupation profile (minimum expected requirements for learners' vocational knowledge, skills and competencies); (d) framework training curriculum (guide to structure the learning process in terms of time and content); (e) examination requirements.

The update of existing training regulations and the development of new ones follow a standardised procedure and should not take longer than one year.

The initiative to update and develop new training regulations is usually taken by trade associations, trade unions, the employers' umbrella organisations or the BIBB. Once a proposal is handed in, the responsible federal ministry, in consultation with the State governments, asks all parties involved for their opinion. In many cases, BIBB also provides its opinion, especially when larger scale revisions are considered, then the institute conducts research before the ministry takes its decision. The BIBB provides the platform for and moderates and coordinates the process. Due to continuous change in skills required on the labour market, training regulations are regularly updated and new ones defined.

The Federal Coordinating Committee on Training Regulations/Framework Curricula approves the training regulation and the school framework curriculum coordinated with it. The committee comprises representatives from the 16 Federal State ministries responsible for VET, the BMBF and the ministries responsible for the respective training regulations. Federal States directly adopt the framework curriculum or transform it into State-specific curricula for vocational schools. They are published in the Federal law gazette and enter into force at the beginning of the next training year.

The diagram that shows the procedure to develop and adjust training regulations in German dual training system is presented below:



# Summary and analysis of key features of Germany's industry-led VET system (in comparison with Denmark and Australia)

1. Industry and enterprises participate in (i) the central federal advisory level through participation in the BIBB's four-party board under the Federal Ministry of Education and Research (BMBF) and (ii) participation at the state level through participation in the State-level vocational training committees to advise the State government and the professional chambers with the very important role of assuming responsibility for vocational training in the industrial sector and region they represent including ensure the suitability of training centres; monitoring training in enterprises; advising apprentices, vocational trainers and enterprises; establishing and maintaining lists of training contracts; and organising exams. These roles are similar to that of (National) Trade Committees of Denmark but the National Trade Committees of Denmark is are at the central/federal level, whereas the Vocational Training Committees and Professional Chambers of the Federal Republic of Germany are at the State level.

2. In Australia and Denmark, industry and enterprises play a key role in updating and developing training programmes, training skills standards (through the responsibility of the National Trade Committees in the case of Denmark, or the AISC and IRC in the case of Australia), whereas in Germany the BIBB's fourparty board, consisting of representatives of employers, trade unions, Federal States and the Federal Government, is an executive body and acts as the statutory advisory organ of the Federal Government, conducting research and providing advice to the Federal Government in setting up training standards).

3. With regard to the training programme implementation: the industry/enterprise directly participates in training at the enterprise in dual training system and sets out regulations on training quality control in dual training.

4. With regard to the SSC structure/composition:

The Federal Republic of Germany does not have a model of national sector skills organization as in Denmark or Australia, but instead each state has only a Professional Chamber or where there is no Professional Chamber, there is a vocational training committee responsible for vocational training in the industrial sector and region they represent. Regarding the updating and development of training regulations in dual training, the enterprise/employer is only one of the four constituents in the BIBB's four-party board (consisting of representatives of employers, trade unions, Federal States and the Federal Government), conducting research and providing advice to the Federal Ministry of Education and Research (BMBF). BiBB can be seen as an "umbrella" body, which is the focal point to advise the Government on training regulations in dual training.

BiBB's operational funding comes from the state budget.

### COMPARATIVE ANALYSES OF THE SECTOR SKILLS ORGANIZATION MODEL OF THREE COUNTRIES: DENMARK, AUSTRALIA AND GERMANY

- In all three countries, the "industry" is the core of the VET system, leading and serving as the driving force for development in the VET system. The industry/enterprise participating at the "umbrella" organization level (In Denmark, it is called the Advisory Council for Initial Vocational Education and Training, in Australia it is AISC, and in Germany it is the BiBB) with the mandated tasks of gathering inputs and advising the Government on training occupations, skill standards, and providing VET policy advice. The industry/enterprise also participates in national industry councils (in Denmark, the National Trade Committees; in Australia, the Industry Reference Councils). Germany does not have a national SSC, but it does have State-level Vocational Training Committees to advise the State government, and also Professional Chambers that play a very important role in training as it participates in developing new training regulations and framework curricula....

- In all three countries, national occupational standards are developed as a basis for developing training programmes. These three countries have not carried out occupational skills assessment for workers according to the national skill standard levels as in Viet Nam, or South Korea and Japan.

- National curriculum/training programmes (Denmark), training packages (Australia) and training regulations (Germany) are proposed by the sector skills organizations, including regulations on assessment standards, testing of learning outcomes of learners.

- Denmark has local training committees in the national VET governance structure but in Australia only a few states have SSC at the state level (these states have their own mechanism for the state SSC but these councils are not part of the national VET structure). federal system architecture). Germany has Training Committees or Chambers at the state level.

- Legal and advisory responsibilities vary between Council levels and from country to country. In Australia, the AISC and the IRC both have advisory responsibilities, no legal liability; however in Denmark, the IVET Council and Local Training Committees have an advisory function, but the National Trade Committees, in addition to advisory role, also has legal functions such as allowing enterprises to train, regulating and implementing exams. In Germany, the BIBB's four-party board (consisting of representatives of employers) has an advisory role; Vocational Training Committees or Chambers in the states both advise and assume legal responsibility for allowing enterprises to train, setting out regulations on end-of-term exams...

- With regard to operational funding: The operational funds for the National Trade Committees of Denmark are on the basic of self-financing. Funds for the Industry Reference Council of Australia to develop the training packages and for the BiBB of the Federal Republic of Germany to be the focal point for developing the training package are covered by the state budget.

### II. An introduction of SSC models in Cambodia and Jordan

### 1. SSC Model in Cambodia:

Within the framework of the TVET development programme funded by ADB and AFD since 2014, Cambodia has established four SSCs in construction, mechanics (auto mechanics), electrical works, and manufacturing.

The SSC will be composed of industry associations and large employers. The Ministry of labour and Vocational Training will be guided to formulate operating procedures to direct the activities of SSC, and to establish a monitoring and evaluation framework, inclusive of indicators to measure the work of SSC. Engagement of industry associations and large employers as members of the SSC will be formalized through Memoranda of Agreement with the Ministry of labour and Vocational Training.

The functions of the SSC are as follows:

- Identify priority training occupations in the industry;
- Support to develop training packages;
- Review and/or approve competency standards;
- Send specialists to training courses to become assessors;
- Supporting excellent training institutions in the field of the industry;
- Review proposals for skills development funds;
- Conduct seminars and prepare annual reports.

The Project will make provision for a series of workshops for consultation and planning among representatives of SSC and key stakeholders. The programme will make provision for an honorarium paid to members of SSC upon service.

Cambodia's SSC model shows that the Cambodian Government has taken an interest in an "industry-led" approach to TVET development. The State management agency for TVET plays a key and central role in guiding and implementing SSC and the core component of SSC is enterprises. However, because the model is still in the pilot stage within the framework of an ODA project, it is not possible to draw much experience for Viet Nam.

#### 2. SSC Model in Jordan:

The establishment of the Sector Skills Council in Jordan was carried out within the framework of the project "Applying the G20 Training Strategy: A

Partnership of the ILO and the Russian Federation" (shortened as the G20 Training Strategy) implemented since 2018. The project has been implemented in five countries including Jordan, Armenia, Takistan, Kyzgysztan and Viet Nam. The project aims to support countries in the sectoral approach and focuses on establishing SSCs in TVET development.

Under the G20TS Project, the International Labour Organization (ILO), worked closely with the Jordan Chamber of Industry to establish the Cosmetics and Chemicals Industries Sector Skills Council and the Leather and Garments Sector Skills Council to establish.

According to its Terms of Reference, the National Sector Skills Council is a permanent employer-led body that promotes skills development in certain economic sector(s). This council will need to be recognized by law and serve as a mechanism for cooperation among stakeholders.

The Council is a tripartite body, ideally composed of (a) employers and representatives of employers' organisations, (b) governmental organisations, and (c) representatives of workers' organizations, as well as any other social partners relevant to the respective sector. Employers will have a majority on the Council. The number of members in the NSSC can be decided in consultation with sector stakeholders - possibly based on the size and characteristics of the sector.

The Council is responsible for:

- Developing occupational profiles and standards;
- Implementing labour market information system in related fields;
- Contributing in policy formulation;

- Recommending training courses and curricula according to needs to equip the workforce with the skills needed to secure decent employment opportunities.

Thus, similar to Cambodia, because the pilot project has recently been implemented in Jordan, it is not possible to draw much experience for Viet Nam.

### III. Summary of some international studies on SSC:

 The presentation on the concept of sector skills bodies at the ILO Regional Workshop Webinar "Promoting industry-led skills and TVET systems in Asia: The Role of Sector Skills Councils" date 29 September 2020 by Dr. Paul Comyn, ILO Senior Skills and Employability Specialist:

International experience shows that sectoral bodies can provide a wide range of services related to:

- Quantitative and/or qualitative labour market analysis;
- Skills needs forecasting;

- Skills / qualification standards and curriculum development;
- Policy advice on lifelong learning, TVET and skills issues;
- Partnerships between employers and institutions;
- Training provider networks;
- Careers guidance, promotion of TVET and skills development;
- Training and assessment services for workers and employers;

- Sectoral training funds;

- Managing government programmes.

Sectoral skills bodies have a long history in many countries but they vary according to:

(1) Coverage - industry scope, sectoral or transversal

(2) Focus - initial or continuing TVET or both

(3) Mandate - advisory, technical, legal responsibilities

(4) Members - bipartite, tripartite, multipartite, industry representation

(5) Structure - committees, working groups, councils, independent bodies, secretariats

(6) Funding - public, private, donor, levy

(7) Institutional relationships - roles and responsibilities

### Sector skills bodies: institutional structures

Sector skills bodies may have different legal structures as follows:

- Independent bodies registered as non-for profit organisations or under company law : 'training councils', 'training advisory boards', 'skills councils' with staff and a governing board; (South Africa, New Zealand).

- Committees within an industry association or employer's body 'training councils', 'training advisory boards', 'skills councils' with sector representatives and a shared private sector secretariat (Jordan, Netherlands).

- Committees and working groups within government entities 'training councils', 'training advisory boards', 'skills councils' with sector representatives and a shared public sector secretariat (Botswana, Bangladesh).

2. Indonesia Policy note in 2019 on Sector Skills Councils developed with the funding support of the government of Japan (ILO/Japan)

The sectoral dimension plays an important part in planning and delivering vocational education and training. Many countries have developed SSCs of one kind or another to contribute a sectoral 'voice' to education and training arrangements.

### Functions of SSCs

At the core of an SSCs role is specifying skill standards (often called occupational standards). However SSCs may undertake other functions in the area of skills training, education and workforce development, including:

• Monitoring skills shortages and advising on the quantity of training needed overall and in particular locations;

• Developing 'skills strategies' in partnership with government for dealing with persistent skills and manpower problems in their sectors;

• Helping to develop curricula for relevant vocational education and training in formal education;

• Undertaking promotional activities to encourage suitable people to enter careers in their sector;

• Accrediting training organizations which are recognized as providing good quality skills relevant to the sector;

• Determining methods of assessment for testing or validating skills;

• Approving frameworks requirements, duration); for apprenticeship (eg necessary training, experience, entry...)

• Awarding certificates for people who have undertaken recommended training, and for people who have completed recognized apprenticeships;

Relating to the function of specifying skill standards, skill standards form the basis for providers of education and training to design training programmes which lead to these skills, and to allow assessments of individual trainees to determine whether or not they are ready to perform the required activities at work. An SSC may need to commission experts to research and elaborate standards. But whoever develops standards will need to undertake extensive consultation with actual supervisors and jobholders to ensure that the standards are realistic and comprehensible. It is also important that the SSC itself discusses and approves the standards to ensure that they have the authority of leading people in the sector. An SSC does not necessarily design curricula or assessments, though this can

happen. These elements require expertise in teaching and testing which usually employers and trades unions do not have.

It is quite common for some SSCs to have more functions and powers than those in other sectors, depending on their stage of development and the nature of the sector.

### Composition and structure of SSCs

The core membership of SSCs is employers. It is they who recruit labour and who have to compete in domestic and international markets. It is they who know best what standards they expect from their workforce today, and how these may change in the future.

In most countries trade unions are also involved in SSCs. They also have a good understanding of what skills are needed in a sector, and the things that will attract or discourage workers to increase their skill levels. It will often be appropriate to include representatives from higher education and secondary level vocational education. They can advise on the practicalities of teaching and assessment in knowledge and skills relevant to the sector. Depending on the sector, relevant professional associations can be included in SSCs.

Finally, it will usually be useful to have a government representative (from the relevant ministry for the sector or the ministry which is responsible for training). It may be appropriate to designate government officials as 'observers' rather than full participants. This marks their status as people who receive advice from the SSC rather than being bound by its decisions.

Employer members should not be confined to human resource managers and specialists. It is important that at least some of the employers should be either chief executives or senior officers with direct experience of line management and the pressures of competition.

The chairman of the SSC might either be a leading recognized employer or perhaps a well respected academic from a relevant field in higher education.

The status of SSCs can vary. At one extreme they can be bodies created by legislation, whose functions and membership are established by law or by regulation by government. At the other extreme an SSC may be formed as a temporary measure to undertake a particular skills-related project – for example to help modernize training in a particular sector. In such cases members may simply be those people with expertise and interest who are prepared to volunteer.

In between these two extremes there are wide range of models, including:

• panels appointed by the Ministry of Education or Labour to advise them on skills issues;

• groupings of employers which undertake promotion of careers in their industries, and collaborate with education institutions to define skills. Once established they may form a company to enable the group to handle finance and enter into contracts;

• existing industry associations which take on the role of active skills development, forming special boards within their structure to focus on this issue;

• existing professional associations who already define skills standards for their membership and who take on the role of developing standards and career routes for occupations which are linked to their profession;

• ad-hoc meetings of stakeholders, usually convened by the government, to discuss various skills issues without fixed membership.

 Study on the Establishment of Sector Skills Councils - the document developed as part of the VET Toolbox project co-funded by the European Commission and the German Government (VET Toolbox)

A Sector Skills Council has three major functions:

• To get employers more involved in all aspects of skills development;

• To research and publish reliable and accurate labour market information about its sector;

• To support the development of qualifications and programmes that meet the needs of employers

Sector Skills Councils will take the lead role for developing, maintaining and up-dating national occupational standards and have a major role to play in supporting the development and implementation of apprenticeships. How these core functions are fulfilled will depend on the challenges and opportunities presented in different economic sectors. Sector Skills Councils might decide to initiate additional services and functions, but each should be clear about its central purposes. There are other functions that Sector Skills Councils might develop. These include:

• Technical advice and support to employers to introduce and develop workbased training and assessment solutions;

• Promotion of sectors to young people and job-seekers; to explain the occupations and opportunities within a sector to attract people to jobs and training opportunities;
• Membership and accreditation.

As Sector Skills Councils evolve, there will be opportunities to introduce new services: much will depend on the dynamics of individual sectors, the enthusiasm and support of employers. Relevant stakeholders that should be encouraged to support the Sector Skills Council and see it is an ally and partner in the continuing reform of TVET include: Statutory Agencies and Bodies with TVET functions and responsibilities; Training Providers; Higher Education Institutions; Funding Partners; Workers.

## PART II: CURRENT STATUS ON THE PILOT ESTABLISHMENT AND OPERATION OF SSC IN VIET NAM

# I. Overview of research and promulgation of regulations, guidelines and contents related to SSC

- Aspects related to SSC have been mentioned in Viet Nam for quite a while, and have been actively discussed in the VET system since the late 1990s. In particular, the "engagement with enterprises" component of the ADB-funded "Occupational Skills Strengthening in Viet Nam" Project funded by ADB (VTEP 1999-2009) has embedded contents on the formulation of SSCs. However, the knowledge and contents of the SSCs has been limited only to seminars, training events for selected managers, TVET institutes benefiting from the Project delivered by Australian and British experts and there have been initiatives taken to form SSCs at school/local level in support of cooperation between TVET institutes and enterprises. Based on Project activities, assessing occupational skills and developing national occupational skills standards has been incorporated into the Law on Vocational Training and the Law on Employment.

- The phrase "sectoral council" was mentioned in Decision No. 1982/QD-TTg on "Approving the Viet Nam National Qualifications Framework" of the Prime Minister on October 18, 2016 (which is an administrative document, not a legal document). Article 2 - Organization of implementation, Point 6 on Responsibilities of professional associations and representatives of manufacturing and services industries of the Decision states: "Participate in sectoral councils, industry councils to propose requirements for qualifications, propose learning outcomes and accompanying evidence for each training field and discipline".

- Since 2016, the SSC model has been piloted in a number of ODA-funded projects with support from Germany, Australia and Denmark and the Russian Federation (ILO Initiative).

- The first time the "sector skills council" was included in a legal document was the Labour Code of 2019 (reserves a separate Chapter on the development of TVET and occupational skills, which for the first time stipulates that the state shall adopt a policy to encourage employers to provide vocational training and develop occupational skills for their own employees and for the society through "joining the sector skills council". Up to now, there is no legal document specifying regulations on sector skills council.

- The VET development strategy for the 2021-2030 period, with a vision to 2045, has identified the solution "Pilot setting up a number of sector skill councils for key (groups of) industries in the 2021-2025 period, on the basis of assessment and reflections of which to expand to others in the 2026-2030 period".

# II. Summary of SSC pilot models that have been under implementation in Viet Nam:

1. Tourism and Hospitality SSC in Viet Nam Model

a) The process of formation and evolution

Within the framework of the "Hospitality Operations Training in Viet Nam" Project supported by the Government of Luxembourg, the Viet Nam Tourism Certification Board (VTCB) was established by the Director General of Viet Nam National Administration of Tourism (VNAT) under Decision No. 103/QD-TCDL dated April 24, 2003, with the position, functions, duties, powers, organizational structure, and mode of operation specified in the Charter of VTCB issued by the Director General of Viet Nam National Administration of Tourism together with Decision No. 454/QD-TCDL, dated November 1, 2004.

Since its establishment until the end of 2006, VTCB has operated as an agency specializing in hospitality operations training, curriculum development, appraisal and testing, recognition and issuance of certificates to students of a number of tourism training schools. The operating budget mainly relies on funding from projects sponsored by Luxembourg, counterpart fund from the State budget and revenues from training, appraisal and certification support services. In theperiod, VTCB's training, assessment and certification was based on the curriculum for teaching four operational areas, namely: Receptionist, Service Housekeeping, Food Processing and Restaurant Operations. The procedures for registering to participate in the assessment to obtain a certificate from VTCB, the item bank were developed and applied nationwide. Assessment centres were established at four Tourism Operations Schools and some hotels. The skill level assessment was applied to students of tourism operations training institutions and employees working at hotels who had not had a gualification in tourism. VTCB Certificate was awarded to candidates who achieved the required results in the theoretical and practical assessments at the assessment centres. Trainees with VTCB Certificates have been recognized by employers in the hospitality industry and therefore enhanced their employability prospects.

The Luxembourg project finished at the end of 2006. From 2007 to 2010, VTCB received funding support from the EU project to maintain its operations, with the main task of operating the VTOS system (that is, approving standards, appraising and issuing certificates according to VTOS standards). After the EU project finished its phase 1, specifically from 2010 until now, VTCB has continued to maintain and operate the VTOS system on the basis of self-financing its operations with the main revenue coming from the appraisal and certification service for employees of tourism enterprises, albeit with a very limited number.

Since 2010, within the framework of the "Viet Nam Tourism Human Resource Development" Project and the "Environmentally and Socially Responsible Tourism Development Programme" Project, the European Union (EU) has continued to provide its support with an aim to develop and expand the scope of impact of VTCB, specifically through building a VTOS system to promote training in the workplace with the formulation of 13 basic VTOS standards along with learning support materials. The linkage of VTOS with VTCB has helped VTOS become a foundation for employees in tourism enterprises to achieve VTCB certification through assessment and recognition of existing knowledge and skills.

b) With regard to the organization and operation of the Viet Nam Tourism Certification Board (VTCB)

According to Decision No. 23/2014/QD-TTg of the Prime Minister, Viet Nam National Administration of Tourism is the standing body of the Viet Nam Tourism Certification Board (VTCB). According to the Decision to strengthen VTCB signed by the Director General of Viet Nam National Administration of Tourism on December 29, 2014, VTCB consists of 14 members including representatives from the Ministry of Culture, Sports and Tourism, the Ministry of Education and Training, Ministry of Labour, Invalids and Social Affairs (Occupational Skills Department of Directorate of Vocational Education and Training), Viet Nam National Administration of Tourism, Tourism Association and a number of tourism training institutions and tourism enterprises. VTCB is chaired by a Deputy Director General who is appointed by the decision of the Minister of Culture, Sports and Tourism. The working mechanism of VTCB is concurrent. The regular work of VTCB is carried out by the permanent unit, which is VTCB Office.

Currently, VTCB has been strengthened with 15 members. The composition of VTCB includes representatives of state management agencies related to the issuance of Tourism Operations Certificates (eight members), tourism/hospitality enterprises (three members), vocational training institutions (two members), Viet Nam Tourism Association (one member), Viet Nam Hospitality Association (one member).

The organizational structure, functions, duties and operation of VTCB are specified in its Charter.

c) Brief summary of the results achieved

In recent past, VTCB has focused on the following main work groups:

- Managing, operating and implementing the VTOS System;

- Accrediting Appraisal Centres;

- Managing the training of trainees;

- Approving documents on occupational skills standards (13 sets of occupational skills standards of the VTOS System).

d) Some emerging issues for VTCB

Firstly, operational resources are lacking and VTCB's legal status is unclear.

Currently, VTCB's revenue is limited and unstable because the projects have stopped funding. Although practice has proven that this system is necessary and makes an important contribution to the sustainable development of the tourism vocational training system and improving the service quality of the tourism industry towards regional and world standards, because the legal status of VTCB is not clear, the enterprises and employees participating in the system are still limited because of concerns about the legal position of the certificate issued by it.

Secondly, there is a lack of necessary mechanisms and conditions for its operation.

Thirdly, the legal corridor and the operational mechanisms are not clear yet.

The Mutual Recognition Arrangement on Tourism Professionals (MRA-TP) Agreement was fully signed on November 9, 2012 in Bangkok stating clearly at Section 1.10, Article 2 (Definition and Scope) that the composition of the National Tourism Professional Board (NTPB) should be composed of representatives of the public and private sectors, including academics and other relevant partners, decided/determined by the National Tourism Bodies of the ASEAN countries. Accordingly, in Note No. 182/HTQT dated December 22, 2014 of the Ministry of Culture, Sports and Tourism sent to the ASEAN Secretariat on the assignment of VTCB to perform the role of National Tourism Professional Board (NTPB) and Tourism Professional Certification Board (TPCB). Thus, the Ministry of Culture, Sports and Tourism on behalf of the Government of Viet Nam notified and registered with ASEAN on the appointment of an agency to implement the signed MRA-TP Agreement. Therefore, with the MRA-TP agreement, the functions and tasks of the Viet Nam National Administration of Tourism and based on the practical experience of other countries, VTCB should be supplemented with the NTPB's functions specified in the MRA-TP. In addition, according to the new regulations in Decree 31/2015/ND-CP dated March 24, 2015 of the Government, effective from May 15, 2015, detailing the implementation of a number of articles of the Employment Law on assessment and issuance of national occupational skills certificates, it is imperative that the current National Tourism Professional Board (NTPB) change its functions and tasks, especially with regard to the previous system of appraisal centres where the appraisers need to propose to the new competent authorities for recognition. The recognition or not has not been implemented, so, the operation of VTCB is currently facing many difficulties.

Moreover, currently, VTCB is using the occupational standards related to the tourism sector that have been developed and promulgated, namely the VTOS Standards. The new version of VTOS Standards has been built on the basis of harmonization with the issued ASEAN Occupational Standards. However, at present, these standards have not been recognized as national occupational skills standards because they have not been appraised and promulgated by the Ministry of Labour, Invalids and Social Affairs. Therefore, the use of standards in appraisal, assessment and certification will face the obstacle in a sense that the certificate is only recognized within the tourism industry but has not been recognized nationwide according to the new regulations.

Thus, the Viet Nam Tourism SSC under the name Viet Nam Tourism Certification Board (VTCB) has been established and operated for more than 18 years and has made significant contributions to the quality of human resources in Viet Nam's tourism industry. In the new context, with changes in regional integration, changes in the legal corridor, VTCB must make changes to adapt.

The current model of the Tourism Professional Certification Board, although somewhat having the primitive appearance of the SSC model, has not basically performed all the functions and tasks that an SSC needs to undertake. This may be because there is no specific mechanism for the operation of this structure.

Since 2018, Viet Nam's Ministry of Labour, Invalids and Social Affairs and the Australia's Department of Education and Training have signed a Memorandum of Understanding on cooperation in the field of VET, including defining contents to build a pilot Tourism and Hospitality SSC model in Viet Nam. To pilot the SSC model in Viet Nam, Australia will send volunteer experts to advise and provide technical support to implement SSC's activities. In November 2019, Tourism and Hospitality SSC was established with representatives of relevant parties. However, for various reasons, to date, this Council has not been active.

2. Sector Skills Council (SSC) in Agriculture Model

In response to the requirement to strengthen the quality of human resources in the agricultural sector, as proposed by the International labour Organization (ILO), the Ministry of labour, Invalids and Social Affairs has piloted the establishment of SSC in Agriculture (according to Decision 1717/QD- LDTBXH dated November 14, 2019 of the Minister of labour, Invalids and Social Affairs). The SSC has 18 members, including representatives of the Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development, the Ministry of labour - Invalids and Social Affairs, the Institute of Policy and Strategy for Agriculture and Rural Development, National Centre for Agricultural Extension, Viet Nam Food Association, representatives of seed and fertilizer enterprises, international and development partners.... The ILO provides technical assistance to the SSC, in particular advising on the approach, the steps to be taken and the SSC's initial activities. ILO only provide guidance and advises, not be involved in decision-making, which is decided and implemented by the SSC's members.

Below are the work items that the SSC has been implementing:

- Conducting research on the model of SSC in the G20 Training Strategy project countries.

- Conducting field study and situational assessment of occupational skills as a basis for the formulation of sector skills strategy for agriculture by 2030. (ILO sends strategic frameworks of countries to the SSC for reference).

- Drafting the agricultural sector skills strategy by 2030, with vision to 2045.

- Piloting the development of occupational skills standards in two priority occupations selected by the SSC.

- Formulate operating regulations of the SSC.

Difficulties and challenges:

- Some members did not attend the SSC's meetings on the regular basic, especially members from enterprises. The reasons is that the members were busy with their work at their agencies and enterprises ound that the SSC's activities is not much relevant to their business.

- The assignment of individuals to participate in the drafting of the sector skills strategy as well as some other research studies was not implemented as expected since members did not know the tasks and funding yet, which somehow affected the progress. Once the clarification was made, however, the work has become well coordinated.

- Although the SSC has operated, the official decision on the Council membership has not been issued, which is also the reason why the members' responsibilities to the Council are still loose, with a lack of commitment.

- Funding is only available for a number of clearly identified tasks, so other operational initiatives for the SSC are almost not implemented.

- Training has not been organized according to the occupational skills standards developed by the SSC, so it has not had any impact on changing occupational skills for employees.

Thus, the SSC was newly established and operated in a short time. The working mechanism of this SSC has not been clearly made, so its practical impact remains limited.

# 3. Advisory Committee for Logistics Training and Logistics Industry Reference Council models

## 3.1. Advisory Committee for Logistics Training

The Australian Government's Aus4Skills programme aims to support Viet Nam in accessing and using competent and skilled human resources to meet the needs of the labour market, contributing to its sustainable socio-economic development. The programme has been implemented since February 2016 with five components, of which the component "Promoting the participation of enterprises in the field of VET" has been implemented since April 2017 with the following main activities: Piloting, establishing and organizing the implementation of activities of the Advisory Committee for Logistics Training, supporting occupational standards and occupational skills standards for five occupations in the field of logistics; providing support to improve training capacity of participating schools and partners through pilot training activities; training courses to strengthen the capacity of teachers and administrators in Viet Nam and Australia; seminars, roundtables, enterprise visits, survey of the current situation related to logistics human resource training, activities of the Advisory Committee for Logistics Training; proposing issues pertinent to mechanisms and policies to link schools and enterprises; and rolling out the piloted model.

Under the original plan, SSC in logistics would be established similar to the Australian VET model. However, because the establishment of the Sector Council in Viet Nam is still not popular, it is necessary to study and consider more implications about the legal basis and authority to make decisions on the establishment of the sector council, so the parties agreed to establish the Advisory Committee for Logistics Training in the Programme (hereinafter referred to as the Advisory Committee).

The Advisory Committee for Logistics Training was launched in December 2017 on a voluntary basis of its members, with its Organization and Operation Charter. The Advisory Committee consists of 15 members including representatives of four parties with specific roles as follows:

- State management agencies in VET at central and local levels: Providing orientations in terms of guidelines and policies.

- Representatives of enterprises and business associations: Providing advice and professional inputs



- VCCI: Coordinating and supporting the activities of the Advisory Committee

- TVET institutes: Obtaining opinions, applying them in practice for reflections and adjustments

The functions of the Advisory Committee are as follows:

- Strengthen the promotion of VET through close cooperation activities between associations, enterprises, schools & management agencies.

- Review, comment on and approve occupational standards.

- Conduct consultations to enhance the quality of VET

- Propose changes in teaching materials in line with actual needs and in pursuit of international standards and qualifications.

- Connect the teaching and learning mechanism between schools and enterprises.

- Review and propose criteria to evaluate the quality of student training in order to create conditions for enterprises to recruit human resources with quality skills and knowledge.

The members of the Advisory Committee attend periodic meetings as required (every 3 months or as required) and actively participate in the running of the Committee. The members of the Advisory Committee work with a spirit of cooperation, professionalism and respect for one, appreciation of the roles and professional expertise of each member. Members also need to study the documents before each meeting as necessary and confirm the minutes of the meeting.

After three years of operation, at the Upskilling Viet Nam's Workforce event with the witness of the Directorate of Vocational Education and Training (DVET), the Advisory Committee has renamed itself to Logistics Industry Reference Council (LIRC).

## **3.2. Logistics Industry Reference Council:**

The Logistics Industry Reference Council (LIRC) operates in accordance with the Australian Transport and Logistics Industry Reference Committee model.

a) Membership and composition of LIRC

LIRC's current number is 18 members with the composition including:

- Representatives of state management agencies: Directorate of Vocational Education and Training (DVET) (representative of the VET management agency at the central level) and the Department of labour, Invalids and Social Affairs of Ho Chi Minh City. Ho Chi Minh City (representative of the local state management agency on TVET, where the main activities of piloting logistics training of the Aus4Skills Programme take place).

- Representative of the business community, employers and business associations: Viet Nam Chamber of Commerce and Industry (VCCI) branch in Ho Chi Minh City. This is also the entity that participates in the secretarial role and coordinates the main activities of LIRC.

- Representative of socio-professional organizations: Viet Nam Logistics Service Enterprise Association (VLA);

- Enterprise representatives: Some of Viet Nam's leading logistics enterprises in Ho Chi Minh City;

- Representatives of TVET institutes, research agencies: Representatives of five colleges (four in Ho Chi Minh City, including 1 private school; one in Dong Nai), one public secondary school (Ho Chi Minh City); Viet Nam Logistics Institute.

## b) Objectives of LIRC

Carry out the governance and supervision of relevant activities to ensure:

- Occupational standards and corresponding training packages that include core competencies and elective competencies tailored to industry requirements, reflect labour market outcomes and support labour mobility; - Enhance benefits for employers in the recruitment and selection process through training qualifications that ensure workers meet the requirements for knowledge and skills;

- Contribute to training a highly skilled, adaptive and competitive logistics workforce for Viet Nam;

- The competency-based logistics training programme developed by LIRC will support TVET institutes and other partners to match and respond to the needs of learners, schools and employers;

c) Functions of LIRC

LIRC undertakes the following basic functions:

- Strengthen the promotion of VET through close cooperation activities between associations, enterprises, schools and state management agencies;

- Develop, review, comment on and approve occupational standards;

- Develop forecasts of occupational skills and human resource development trends of the industry;

- Conduct consultations to enhance the quality of VET;

- Propose changes in teaching materials in line with actual needs and in pursuit of international standards and qualifications.

- Connect the teaching and learning mechanism between schools and enterprises.

- Review and propose criteria to evaluate the quality of student training in order to create conditions for enterprises to recruit human resources with quality skills and knowledge.

## d) Operating principles

LIRC operates on the basis of ensuring increased participation of enterprises in VET activities, promoting close coordination between enterprises and TVET institutes in Viet Nam, which is the foundation for strengthening occupational skills and productivity of the logistics workforce.

Propose to the Government on formulating policies and orientations to promote enterprises to participate in VET activities.

Develop a mechanism to ensure enterprise participation plays a central role in VET. This is the gateway for enterprises to give feedback to the Government on business trends and promote enterprises to participate in VET activities.

Assess and review industry skills requirements and determine occupational standards and training packages, with the main purpose of consulting and sharing on

the needs of skilled workers needed in the logistics industry based on the experience and expertise of its members.

Members participate in LIRC on a voluntary basis and their contribution to the thriving VET system is the cornerstone of a highly skilled and productive logistics workforce.

#### e) Roles and responsibilities of LIRC members

- Provide strategic advice and expertise related to the direction of industry development;

- Contribute to the action plan;

- Consult information, expertise, experience to address problems and provide practical solutions;

- Provide assessments and judgements on activities performed based on the quality control mechanism;

- Attend periodic meetings (every three months) or as required and actively participate in LIRC's work;

- Represent the interests of the logistics industry in Viet Nam;

- Have a close interest and work in the logistics industry;

- Be a strong advocate of LIRC activities;

- Remain committed to and actively participate in the development of VET.

LIRC members work with a spirit of cooperation, professionalism and respect for one another; appreciate the role and expertise of each member; express opinions and share advice at LIRC meetings.

Members also need to study the documents before each meeting as necessary and confirm the minutes of the meeting; undertake not to disclose confidential information or improperly use any information in LIRC meetings.

Diagram illustrating the participation of representatives of relevant stakeholders in the Logistics Industry Reference Council:

School: Implement regulations on VET; training students

School

Enterprise

Enterprises: Express demand for the trained workforce; make available the information on the industry development

State management

State

Association

VCCI: Connect



## g) Operating modality

LIRC's modality of operation is through periodic meetings of LIRC, in which members base on their positions and duties to provide information related to LIRC's activities. The official information of LIRC is the information that has been unanimously approved by the members of LIRC.

In addition, LIRC also participates in practical activities such as developing occupational skills forecasting reports; develop and survey occupational standards and occupational skills standards of priority training occupations selected by LIRC in accordance with the industry's development requirements; organize conferences, seminars, forums to share experiences and strengthen stakeholder engagement.

LIRC's activities are supported by the Viet Nam Chamber of Commerce and Industry branch in Ho Chi Minh City in the role of Secretariat as a service activity organizer for LIRC.

#### f) Key achievements

- Maintained continuous operation and organized 14 periodical meetings of the council with the active and full participation of members;

- Organized five seminars and three international conferences/forums on building human resources for the logistics industry;

- Organized six professional training courses for council members;

- Organized more than 20 visits to logistics service enterprises, manufacturing enterprises in need of logistics services, seaports and warehouses across the country to help schools and teachers gather practical observations;

- Developed and appraised occupational standards and occupational skills standards for nine job positions in the logistics industry

- Developed a report assessing the impact of the COVID-19 pandemic on the needs and skills of workers and human resource training activities in the logistics industry and VET activities.

- Proposed the issuance of the logistics training code to DVET

- The members of the council participated in and provided opinions at all conferences and seminars related to human resource development for the logistics industry.

- Developed the first report on forecasting skills of logistics industry, and occupational skills forecasts.

The results achieved by the Programme have initially contributed to promoting a trilateral coordination mechanism: State - School - Enterprises in developing and training various occupations in logistics industry. The Logistics Training Advisory Committee/Industry Skills Advisory Council has helped relevant agencies in the logistics industry to work together to clearly identify the skill needs of the industry while developing the Occupational Standards (Description of standards for positions and titles) and Occupational Skills Standards (the knowledge and skills needed to perform the job) to ensure industry uniformity and reliability. The programme has also shown that it is necessary to promote engagement activities with enterprises through the establishment of local Business Engagement Working Groups, expanding the establishment of Logistics Training Advisory Committees in other localities such as Hai Phong, Vung Tau and progressing to establish the Central Advisory Council on Logistics Industry.

4. A pilot model of local SSCs within the framework of the "Cooperation with Denmark" Programme:

The Ministry of Labour, Invalids and Social Affairs (DVET) and the Danish Ministry of Education have coordinated to implement the Project on Technical Support for VET in Viet Nam consisting of two phases: Phase 1, starting from January 2017 to March 2019 at four colleges; Phase 2 from June 2019 to August 2022 at 12 colleges. The core activity of the Project is to pilot the establishment of local SSCs following the Danish training model at the colleges participating in the Project. The local SSCs are established by each VET institution, including representatives from enterprises (local/regional labour markets), representatives of relevant stakeholders (sectoral organizations, local authorities), representatives of TVET institutes (managers, teachers, other staff if appropriate). The pilot results show that the local SSC is an effective platform to promote the linkage between TVET institutes and enterprises, at which TVET institutes should actively connect with enterprises. Cooperation activities among schools, enterprises, managers and other stakeholders revolve around the local SSC including discussions on short and long-term school/enterprise cooperation, discussion of skills needs and skill levels, developing training programmes that include the division of learning objectives between schools and enterprises, discussing when and how to implement an apprenticeship, as well as other general development issues at the local level. Project experience also shows that this model is effective if TVET institutes take initiative in connecting enterprises, inviting many enterprises to join the Council, focusing on planning, determining the right time for enterprises to arrange and be willing to participate and, most importantly, cooperation with enterprises based on the principle of mutual benefits.

## III. Current regulations on the process of developing national occupational skills standards, learning outcomes and VET training programmes in Viet Nam

#### - With regard to national occupational skills standard:

Article 29 of the Employment Law stipulates the purposes of assessment and issuance of national occupational skills certificates.

1. Assessment and grant of certificates of national occupational skills aim to recognize the levels of occupational skills of workers based on their qualifications.

2. Workers may participate in the assessment and be granted certificates of national occupational skills in order to improve their occupational capacity or seek appropriate employment or employment requiring such certificates.

Clause 1, Article 32 of the Employment Law stipulates as follows: National occupational skills standards shall be developed for each qualification level of occupational skills for each occupation and the national occupational skills qualification framework. The number of qualification levels of occupational skills depends on the complexity of each occupation.

National occupation skill qualification framework and national occupational skills standards are developed in accordance with the provisions of the Employment Law and detailed guidance in Circular No. 56/2015/TT-BLDTBXH guiding the development, appraisal and publication of the national occupational skills standards with provisions on the establishment and selection of organizations assisting organization to help develop national occupational skills standards, as follows: "1. Ministries, ministerial agencies, Governmental agencies (hereinafter referred to as presiding authority) shall take charge and develop the national occupational skill standards for each occupation within management. Presiding authority must establish or select an organization to advice and assist the development of the national occupational skills standard for each occupation

(hereinafter referred to as organization assisting the development of the occupational skills standard). 2. In case of establishing the organization assisting the development of the occupational skills standard, the established organization shall meet the following requirements: a) Participants include: representative of presiding authority; representative of the organization representing such professionals; representative of relevant professional associations; representative of the organization of the employer or enterprise employing the professionals; representative of vocational education institutions or education institutions that have the profession training. In the established organization assisting the development of the occupational skills standard, the number of members representing the professional associations, organization of the employer or enterprise must account for at least ½ members of the organization."

## - With regard to learning outcomes (training standards)

Clause 4, Article 34 of the Law on VET 2014 provides: The Heads of VET authorities in the central government shall regulate the minimum body of knowledge, requirements (learning outcomes) pertaining to qualifications of graduates of every VET level. TVET institutes shall base on learning outcomes to develop their training programmes.

The procedure of formulating learning outcomes specified in Circular No. 12/2017/TT-BLDTBXH dated April 20, 2017 of the Ministry of Labour, Invalids and Social Affairs stipulates the minimum amount of knowledge and competency requirements that learners must achieve upon graduation, for intermediate and college level training (learning outcomes), in which Article 10 stipulates the Drafting Committee for developing learning outcomes and Article 11 stipulates the Appraisal Council as follows:

# Article 10. Drafting Committee

1. The Drafting Committee shall be established by the Director General of Directorate of Vocational Education and Training (DVET) on the basis of the proposal on participating members from ministries, sectors, ministerial-level agencies, sub-national authorities, enterprises, economic groups, corporations and schools for each training discipline and occupation.

2. Number, composition, structure of the Drafting Committee

a) The number of members of the Drafting Committee shall be seven or nine, depending on the workload assigned.

b) The Drafting Committee consists of: Chairperson, Vice Chairperson, Secretary and members.

c) The structure of the Drafting Committee includes: experienced managers in the industry or occupation; teachers, lecturers, experts, business representatives.

3. Standards of the Drafting Committee

a) Having a university degree or higher.

*b)* Having at least five years of experience in directly teaching or operating in the field of training discipline or occupation.

c) Having a good reputation in the field of training discipline or occupation.

Article 11. Appraisal Council

1. The Appraisal Council shall be established by the Minister of Labour, Invalids and Social Affairs on the basis of the proposal on participating members from ministries, sectors, ministerial-level agencies, sub-national authorities, enterprises, economic groups, corporations and schools for each training discipline and occupation.

2. Number, composition, structure of the Appraisal Council

a) The number of members of the Appraisal Council shall be seven or nine, depending on the workload assigned.

*b)* The Appraisal Council consists of: Chairperson, Vice Chairperson, Secretary and members.

c) The structure of the Appraisal Council includes: managers in VET, teachers, lecturers, experts; experienced managers in the industry or occupation; business representatives.

3. Standards of the Appraisal Council

a) Having a university degree or higher.

b) Having at least five years of experience in directly teaching or operating in the field of the discipline or occupation that he or she participates in appraisal

c) Having a good reputation in the field of the discipline or occupation that he or she participates in appraisal.

As of December 2021, the Ministry of Labour, Invalids and Social Affairs has issued learning outcomes for intermediate and college qualifications for 300 training occupations.

Based on these learning outcomes, TVET institutes develop their training programmes. The procedure of developing, appraising and promulgating training programmes at intermediate and college levels is specified in Circular No. 03/2017/TT-BLDTBXH dated March 1, 2017 of the Ministry of Labour, Invalids and Social Affairs, in which Article 10 stipulates the Drafting Committee for developing

training programmes and Article 11 stipulates the Appraisal Council for training programmes as follows:

Article 10. Training Programme Drafting Committee

1. The Training Programme Drafting Committee for each training occupation shall be established by the school's principal to carry out the task of developing training programmes at intermediate and college levels for each training occupation.

2. The Training Programme Drafting Committee includes: chairperson, vice chairperson, secretary and members; the number and standard of members are decided by the school principal.

3. The members of the Training Programme Drafting Committee are those with university degrees or higher, knowledgeable and experienced in training programme development; have direct experience in teaching or in production, business or management activities in the field of the discipline or occupation for which the training programme needs to be developed.

4. The Training Programme Drafting Committee shall be responsible for the content and quality of the assigned training programme according to the regulations on training programme development.

Article 11. Training Programme Appraisal Council

1. The Training Programme Appraisal Council shall be established under the decision of the school principal.

2. The Training Programme Appraisal Council shall be responsible for providing professional advice to assist the school principal in appraising the training programme; comment, evaluate and assume responsibility for the quality of the training programme.

3. The composition of the Training Programme Appraisal Council includes educators, VET managers, scientific and technical personnel of enterprises and does not include members of the Training Programme Appraisal Council. The Training Programme Appraisal Council has at least one-third of its members who are teachers currently teaching at their respective training levels and occupations.

4. The Training Programme Appraisal Council has at least seven people including: Chairperson, vice chairperson, secretary and members, with at least two reviewers from another TVET institute and representatives of the state management agency on VET.

5. Criteria for members of the Training Programme Appraisal Council

a) Possessing a university degree or higher.

b) Having at least five years of experience in teaching or in production, business or management activities in the field of the discipline or occupation to be appraised.

c) TVET institutes are encouraged to invite reputed teachers and lecturers from foreign training institutions to participate in the Appraisal Council.

## IV. Lessons learned

Through studying the experiences of some countries and the practical status of piloting the SSC model in Viet Nam, a number of key principles related to the establishment of SSC can be drawn for reflections:

1. Countries should prioritize stakeholder coordination to close gaps between demand and supply of skills, between training institutions and employers at the sectoral and local levels.

2. The establishment of SSCs must come from the actual needs of industries because the SSCs will be representative of the industries and bring benefits to them. Normally, economic sectors that are developed, have a large number of employees and bring a lot of value to the economy will gain strong interest in investment and development.

3. Enterprises' participation in VET activities should be formal, systematic and comprehensive (that is, participating in all processes of VET activities from participating in SSC to propose new training programmes, continuation or discontinuation of outdated programmes; participating in the development of skill standards, training programmes, training materials, teacher training and upgrading, to participating in training, testing and assessment... The premises for enterprises to fully participate in VET-related activities are solid legal frameworks and specific and feasible implementation guidelines, ensuring the harmonization of the interests of all the parties involved.

4. Sector Skills Councils in specific industries do not directly advise the Government, but the overall structure usually has an "umbrella" organization/council that is the focal point to advise the Government on policies, curriculum and training programmes and monitor the implementation of such policies and this "umbrella" organization is advised and supported by the SSC of each industry.

5. The core mandate of the SSC is to determine the nature of the skills an industry needs. Skills standards are the basis for training institutions to design training programmes and assess learners' readiness to meet requirements in the workplace. SSC can take on other functions in the areas of skills training, education and workforce development; however, it is common for SSC to

contribute at a macro level rather than advising and supporting specific enterprises or training institutions.

6. The core members of an SSC are enterprises since only those who work and succeed in a certain industry, are subject to competitive pressures of domestic and international markets and must comply with regulations for enterprises in the industry will be well placed to update the necessary skills for workers. An SSC consists of a group of official members and a network of other members engaged in its work.

7. SSC does not directly perform technical work or develop detailed skills standards, but instead requires support from a technical unit. However, SSC must discuss and approve standards on its own to ensure that they avail enough authority of those who have leadership roles in the industry. The SSC does not necessarily have to design curriculum or assessment (although it may be able to perform this task) because technical work requires specialized teaching and testing knowledge that enterprises and employers do not have.

8. Technical support to SSCs should also include resources, operational funding and tools necessary for sharing and communicating with each other internally and with relevant organizations. It is necessary to develop a specific and clear operating mechanism so that the relevant parties involved can clearly see their responsibilities and benefits (because the mechanism is not clear, the pilot Tourism-Hospitality SSC and the Agriculture SSC models sector have not achieved the expected results).

9. SSC must also create linkages with training institutions to ensure accurate information on the current and forecasted status of education and training activities.

10. The local SSC model as shown through the Denmark-supported project should be encouraged to replicate because it has proven to bring practical benefits to TVET institutes and enterprises, easy for TVET institutes to actively implement to enhance training quality of each corresponding TVET institute.

## PART III: RECOMMENDATIONS ON THE SSC MODEL FOR VIET NAM IN THE 2021-2025 PERIOD

### I. Recommendations:

The VET development strategy for the period 2021-2030, with a vision to 2045, has identified the solution "Pilot setting up a number of sector skill councils for key (groups of) industries in the 2021-2025 period, on the basis of assessment and reflections of which to expand to others in the 2026-2030 period". Drawing on the research results of international experience and practical context of Viet Nam within the scope of this study and the constraints imposed by current regulations, recommendations on pilot of the SSC model for Viet Nam are as follows:

(1) The Ministry of Labour, Invalids and Social Affairs should develop a Scheme for submission to the Government on piloting the SSC model or consider incorporating it as one of the key contents of the Scheme on Upskilling Viet Nam's Workforce, scheduled for submission to the Government in 2022. In the Scheme, it is necessary to identify objectives, implementation timeline, proposed model, organizational structure, functions and tasks according to a unified structure among councils, implementation resources, clearly state the institutional responsibilities of ministries, sectors and organizations involved. The pilot implementation results will provide a scientific and practical basis to officially stipulate the function, role, structure, composition... of the Council in legal documents. It is also necessary to study the establishment of SSC in a comprehensive and coherent manner, and in synchronization with other issues related to TVET as well as assessment and development of workers' skills, ensuring international integration and in line with the actual needs of Viet Nam's labour market.

## The SSC model is recommended as follows:

- The Ministry of Labour, Invalids and Social Affairs should pilot the establishment of one Vocational Education and Skills Development Advisory Council (Central-level Council) consisting of representatives from stakeholders in the system including ministries, sectors, VCCI, and employers/enterprises, TVET institutes, professional associations, TVET associations, trade unions, which is mandated to advise MOLISA on all policy aspects governing VET and skills development including recommending the development of new training programmes/TVET qualifications, propose cessation or continuation of training programmes; supervise the existing programmes (Only set up this umbrella Council to provide overall advice for all sectors, not a Council for each sector).

- Each group of key industries and occupations with high labour demand should establish an SSC of its own. The specialized management ministry will decide on the pilot establishment of a number of SSCs for groups of industries and occupations. The objective of the establishment of the Sector Council is to create a mechanism for cooperation in skills development in a specific economic sector. The Council will identify and/or analyse skills needs and contribute to the workforce preparation training for the sector.

- The Vocational Education and Skills Development Advisory Council is consulted by industry-specific SSCs in carrying out their responsibilities.

- The Ministry of Labour, Invalids and Social Affairs (DVET) will be the focal agency to monitor the implementation of the Scheme, and will therefore be the focal point to coordinate with relevant ministries and agencies to coordinate the activities of the Councils during the pilot period; develop operational guidelines, consolidate funding needs; evaluate and monitor the process of implementing activities within the scope of the Scheme.

- SSC membership includes the following:

+ The founding members include mainly representatives from sectorspecific enterprises and industry associations, in addition to training institutions, development partners and representatives of the state management agency on VET. Members are selected on the basis of nominations and recommendations as per guidance. Guidelines will be developed on procedures, methods, and criteria for guiding nomination.

- The membership structure includes: Chairperson of the Council, Vice Chairperson of the Council, Secretary nominated from the members at the annual meeting, for a term of two to three years. Special committees/working groups established by the Council to carry out specific tasks will include members from outside the SSC.

- Regarding the criteria for selecting members to participate in SSC, it is necessary to develop selection criteria in which attention should be paid to selecting enthusiastic individuals from reputable organizations and enterprises, who are willing to contribute ideas and consensus, wish to promote the strengthening of the quality of human resources in Viet Nam. In particular, the roles and attitudes of members from enterprises (leading industry enterprises) play a very important role in determining the quality of SSC's operations. The skills and experience of the Secretariat, which is responsible for coordinating the activities and promoting the cooperation of stakeholders on the council, should also be emphasized.

- Functions of SSCs should include advising the specialized management ministry and the Vocational Education and Skills Development Advisory Council on training needs, occupational skills standards, vocational training programmes and policies related to TVET and occupational skills development in the Ministry's remit.

- Tasks of SSCs should including the following:

+ Identify priority training programmes in the industry; identify new training disciplines and occupations and discontinue obsolete/outdated ones, monitor skill development in the labour market and on that basis propose changes and adjustments to existing training programmes;

+ Develop and propose skill standards for submission to the specialized management ministry for approval according to the procedure and framework prescribed by the Ministry of Labour, Invalids and Social Affairs to ensure compliance with current regulations in the Employment Law (the Employment Law stipulates the ministries and ministry-equivalent agencies and those attached to the Government shall assume the prime responsibility for developing national occupational skills standards for each occupation in their remit).

+ Organize research and analysis on the influence of the labour market on skill demand; produce forecasts of future skills needs.

+ Act as a bridge to promote linkage between TVET institutes and enterprises, ensuring a balance between training supply and labour market demand, connecting supply and demand for skilled workforce.

+ Provide policy advice including for initial training and continuing training

+ Nominate experts to join the technical team to perform SSC's professional duties

+ Deliver seminars, workshops, conferences and work plan activities according to the annual programme

In the pilot implementation Scheme, it is proposed to allow each specialized management ministry to have the right to decide on and supplement functions for the SSC. Additional functions such as regulations on the in-company training part include the eligibility criteria for the enterprise to participate in training, quality control in the joint training delivery between the enterprise and the training institution (as in the dual training model of the Federal Republic of Germany or Denmark). The actual implementation process will provide a scientific and practical basis for the establishment and operation of SSC in the future.

- The Ministry of Labour, Invalids and Social Affairs will coordinate with specialized management ministries, professional associations, enterprises, and other stakeholders to develop operational guidelines and uniform working regulations for the SSC, including objectives, functions, membership structure, premises, working regulations including meetings, work plan and monitoring and evaluation framework. The working regulations also clearly state the governing scope and applicability; working regime, tasks and powers of Council members; working relationships, administrative work... They will also develop criteria for selecting the Chairperson of the Council to ensure its effective operations. In addition, in order to effectively implement the above contents, it is necessary to develop an action programme or a coordination mechanism between specialized management ministries and the Ministry of Labour, Invalids and Social Affairs on related issues.

- Meetings of the SSCs:

Meetings will be held when members convene to discuss and address issues of common interest. The meeting will provide recommendations, directions and specific actions. The meeting will be held according to the agreed agenda. Prior to the meeting, the minutes of the previous meeting and the issues to be studied must be sent to the members along with the agenda beforehand.

The meetings take place at least every quarter, chaired by the Chairperson or Vice-Chairperson (if the former is absent), the number of members attending must be greater than half of the members of the Council. The meeting takes place at the premises of specialized management ministry or at another venue. The secretary records the minutes of the meeting and sends the draft to the members for comments before becoming final. The agreed meeting minutes will be sent to the clerical unit of the Vocational Education and Skills Development Advisory Council and the Ministry of Labour, Invalids and Social Affairs.

- Each SSC will develop an annual work-plan that clearly states the purpose, requirements, operational contents, operating budget and organization of implementation. The plans and expected quality of activities should be realistic and substantive, ensuring the harmonization of interests and concerns of all stakeholders involved.

- Each SSC will be allocated a working office by the specialized management ministry. In case such ministries cannot arrange offices, the Council can rent a place to operate.

- Operating funds of the Vocational Education and Skills Development Advisory Council (the "umbrella" Council) and SSCs established by specialised management ministries (line ministries) will come from state budget and from other lawfully mobilized funding sources.

During the pilot period, funds will be allocated from recurrent expenditures for the implementation of the Vocational Education Development Strategy for the 2021 - 2030 period, with a vision to 2045 and other related programmes and projects/Schemes. The operating budget of each SSC is based on the action plan of each such Council. Regulations on the content of spending norms will be guided in detail.

(2) In terms of the approach to the establishment of the SSC of the specialized management ministries, the above Scheme should determine the approach that is to build on and benefit from the existing structure from the existing industry associations and professional associations that have currently undertaken the roles of vocational training and skills development.

(3) It is also suggested to continue coordinating with international partners such as GIZ, Denmark, Australia, ILO... to bring about synergy in supporting the implementation of the Scheme.

(4) During the process of studying and formulating the Scheme, the Ministry of Labour, Invalids and Social Affairs needs to closely coordinate with line (specialised management) ministries, specialized associations, VCCI, and enterprises to select pilot industries for the establishment of SSC and define specific objectives and pilot model. Special attention should also be paid to studying and discussing carefully the tasks of the SSC, the operating mechanism, and clearly delineating the responsibilities of relevant line ministries, sectors, agencies and units in the implementation of the Scheme.

(5) During the pilot period, it is necessary to have close guidance from the state management agencies so that the relevant stakeholders understand their rights and responsibilities when participating as a member of SSC as well as the benefits to the parties therein. It is also necessary to ensure the participation of DVET representatives in the Council to capture information in a timely manner.

## II. Key determinants for the successful piloting:

There are many factors that determine the success of pilot implementation. Key considerations include the following:

- The Scheme to be submitted to the Government for approval should be carefully prepared, ensuring that it provides adequate scientific and practical groundings, including adequate research on international and domestic experiences. The development of the SSC model should be based on the overall orientation of TVET development and the national occupational skills assessment. SSC's activities are truly meaningful, making positive and effective contributions to TVET and occupational skills development.

- Clearly define the legal position, tasks, operating mechanism, and funding sources for SSC's operations. In the pilot phase, the State pays due attention to investment so that SSC can well perform its functions and tasks.

- Mobilize the participation of relevant stakeholders, including line ministries, sectors, employers, industry and professional associations, TVET institutes, research agencies, development partners.

- State management agencies should be open-minded and respectful of the opinions from enterprises and employers.

- Enhance awareness raising activities on the role of enterprises/employers in TVET development; clarify the rights and interests of the parties involved (enterprises, industry/professional associations, TVET institutes...), thereby calling for the genuine participation and contribution of financial and human resources of enterprises and employers.

# III. Suggested contents for further research to accommodate the development and implementation of the pilot model

Lessons learned and recommendations in this Consulting Report have been made on the basis of desk review conducted in a relatively short time (about three months) with limited research scope. The lessons learned certainly would be more comprehensive and the recommendations more relevant and feasible if the scope of research were broader and the study duration was longer.

In order to have more scientific and practical basis for determining the SSC pilot model in Viet Nam going forward, the research team suggests the following issues continue to be studied:

- The role of the industry in TVET and skills development in a number of countries that are implementing national occupational skills assessment systems such as Japan, South Korea and a number of other countries that have been developing and operating SSC models such as UK, Netherlands, India, Singapore...

- More in-depth research on the implementation results and lessons learned from the implementation of pilot SSC models in Viet Nam in the past period (to draw more lessons on the mechanism, structure, operational methods of the SSCs);

- The scope of "industry", how to define "industry" in order to clearly define the mission and tasks of the SSC;

- Criteria and methods of selecting industries and occupations for pilot implementation;

- Specific criteria for selecting members to join the SSC, criteria for selecting enterprises to participate in SSC (for example, those that use lots of labour, balancing between domestic and FDI sectors...). The criteria that need to be measurable and assessable; research on participation responsibilities, commitments, benefits...;

- Operating regulations of SSCs;

- Comparative research on models of dual training, job-based training;

- Criteria to evaluate the effectiveness of cooperation between TVET institutes and enterprises;

- Policies for enterprises participating in VET delivery, policies on using SSC's operational results (for example, skill-linked remuneration policy, annual skills assessment to upgrade enterprises...).

# ANNEX 1: INDUSTRY REFERENCE COMMITTEES (IRCS) IN AUSTRALIA

- Aerospace
- Aged Services
- Agriculture and Production Horticulture
- Ambulance and Paramedic
- Amenity Horticulture, Landscaping, Conservation and Land Management
- Animal Care and Management
- Aquaculture and Wild Catch
- Automotive Allied
- Automotive Heavy Vehicle
- Automotive Light Vehicle
- Automotive Strategic
- Automotive Vehicle Body Repair
- Aviation
- Business Services
- Children's Education and Care
- Civil Infrastructure
- Client Services
- Coal Mining
- Community Sector and Development
- Complementary Health
- Construction, Plumbing and Services
- Correctional Services
- Culture and Related Industries
- Dental
- Direct Client Care and Support
- Disability Support
- Drilling
- Education
- Electricity Supply Generation

- Electricity Supply Transmission, Distribution and Rail
- Electrotechnology
- Enrolled Nursing
- Extractive
- Financial Services
- First Aid
- Food, Beverage and Pharmaceutical
- Forest Management and Harvesting
- Furnishing
- Gas
- Information and Communications Technology
- Local Government
- Manufacturing and Engineering
- Maritime
- Meat
- Metalliferous Mining
- Naval Shipbuilding
- Personal Services
- Pharmaceutical Manufacturing
- Printing and Graphic Arts
- Process Manufacturing, Recreational Vehicle and labouratory
- Property Services
- Public Safety
- Public Sector
- Pulp and Paper Manufacturing
- Racing
- Rail
- Sport and Recreation
- Sustainability

- Technician Support Services
- Textile, Clothing and Footwear
- Timber and Wood Processing
- Timber Building Solutions
- Tourism, Travel and Hospitality
- Transport and Logistics
- Water
- Wholesale and Retail

# REFERENCES

1. ADB. (2019). Report and Recommendation of the President to the Board of Directors Project Number: 50394-002 May 2019 Proposed Loan Kingdom of Cambodia: Skills for Competitiveness Project.

2. labour Code 2019.

3. BIBB. (2013). Training regulations and how they come about.

4. CEDEFOP. (2020). Spotlight on VET DENMARK

5. Enabel and British Council (2020). The Establishment of Sector Skills Councils Co-funded by the European Union. A Handbook and Guide + online animation.

6. ILO/Japan Multi-bilateral Programme (2020). Policy note (Indonesia). Sector skills Council.

7. ILO GENEVA. (2018). The involvement of employer organisations in the governance of skills system: a literature review December 2018.

8. Law on Vocational Education 2014.

9. Employment Law 2015

10. Paul Comyn. (2020). An Introduction to Sector Skills Bodies Senior Skills.

10. Phạm Thị Minh Hien. (2019). Key features of Germany's dual VET system and its success factors. Article published in the labour and Social Affairs Journal.

11. Training materials for would-be managers at the Department level of the Directorate of Vocational Education and Training (DVET) in 2021 (funded by GIZ)

12. Documents of pilot projects on the SSC model in Viet Nam.

13. Terms of Reference for the SSC model of Jordan.

14. <u>https://www.ilo.org/skills/projects/g20ts/jordan/WCMS\_694955/lang--</u> en/index.htm

15. <u>https://www.ilo.org/skills/projects/g20ts/jordan/WCMS\_649875/lang--</u> <u>ru/index.htm</u>

16. <u>http://tvetsdp.ntb.gov.kh/project-description-2/</u>

17. https://www.myskills.gov.au/media/1834/back-2-basics-edition-5.pdf

18.

https://www.dualvet.eu/docs/productos/1\_The%20Dual%20VET%20system.pdf

19. https://www.aisc.net.au/

https://www.apprenticeship-toolbox.eu/?id=5:stakeholder-cooperation-in

20. https://www.studyaustralia.gov.au/english/australian-education/vocational-education

- 21. https://www.govet.international/en/54880.php
- 22. https://www.bibb.de/en/12303.php