Imprint

Publisher:

Vietnamese Ministry of Labour – Invalids and Social Affairs (MoLISA)
German Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development (BMZ)

Author: Deutsche Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit (GIZ) GmbH

Editors: Deutsche Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit (GIZ) GmbH,
Programme Reform of TVET Viet Nam in Cooperation with Sectoral Department,
Division Economic Development and Employment, Section TVET and Labour Market

Design: Mariette Junk, Berlin

Photos: Nguyen Cong Trang, Hanoi
Ralf Bäcker, Berlin
Nguyen Viet Hung, Hanoi
Bui Hong Thang, Hanoi

Place: Hanoi, Viet Nam
Date of Publication: October 2012

Legal notice
This documentation provides an overview about the inputs and discussions at the Regional TVET Conference in Viet Nam, summarizes their results and gives an orientation for the way forward.
Content

Recommendations for TVET Quality Breakthrough .................................8

Summary Report .................................................................................................. 19

Preface ......................................................................................................................... 22

I Introduction ............................................................................................................. 24

Context ......................................................................................................................... 24

Summary of the Regional TVET Conference in Viet Nam ................................. 26

II Conference Opening Session ............................................................................. 27

Opening Speeches and Welcome Address .............................................................. 27

Opening Input Session ............................................................................................. 32

III Conference Topics – Keynotes and Working Sessions ................................. 40

Occupational Standards .......................................................................................... 40

Cooperation with the Business Community ......................................................... 48

TVET Financing ........................................................................................................ 56

TVET Teaching Staff ................................................................................................. 62

III Conference Outcomes - Conclusions, Recommendations and the Way Ahead ......75

References ................................................................................................................. 83

Conference Programme ........................................................................................... 87
RECOMMENDATIONS FOR TVET QUALITY BREAKTHROUGH
Regional TVET Conference in Viet Nam 2012
Recommendations for TVET Quality Breakthrough

As a result of the Regional TVET Conference in Viet Nam and for the next steps of TVET reform in Viet Nam and across the region, the Conference

Recalls
- The Viet Nam – Germany Strategic Partnership Agreement 2011
- The ASEAN Leaders’ Statement on Human Resources and Skills Development for Economic Recovery and Sustainable Growth 2010

Reconfirms
- The key role of demand-oriented high quality TVET for national socio-economic development and ASEAN regional integration in particular with respect to the establishment of the ASEAN free labour market starting in 2015
- The great potential and significance of regional networking and cooperation for achieving greater demand-orientation and higher quality of TVET in the ASEAN region in the context of ASEAN Integration.
- Germany as an established strategic partner in reforming TVET towards high-quality and demand orientation for Viet Nam and across the ASEAN region and, in this context, German support for TVET development through bilateral and regional programmes and projects
Conference Recommendations

1. Viet Nam

The Vietnamese Government confirms that the quality of human resources is a Strategic Breakthrough (SEDS 2011-2020) for becoming an industrialized country by 2020. TVET reform is pivotal for improving the quality of human resources. Viet Nam prioritizes the TVET Quality Breakthrough within Vietnam’s TVET reform process (TVET Development Strategy 2011-2020) in order to provide the skilled labour force needed for becoming an industrialized country. In order to achieve the TVET Quality Breakthrough Viet Nam ought to

  - continuing the successful cooperation with BMZ and its implementing organizations (GIZ and KfW) based upon agreed principles, priorities and procedures, with details to be further discussed and further agreed (e.g. TVET System Advisory with respect to requested support to amendment of Vietnamese Law on Vocational Training)
- further exchange, network and develop a cooperation mechanism in TVET with countries in the ASEAN Region in order to share experiences and learning with regard to TVET reform and particularly TVET Quality Breakthrough
2. ASEAN Integration and Regional TVET Networking

Raising the quality of human resources is a key factor and major challenge for ASEAN Integration. Accordingly, TVET is a priority reform issue across the ASEAN region. All countries in the region also possess valuable experiences in their efforts to develop high-quality and demand-orientated TVET. Across the ASEAN region it is therefore important to

• continue efforts of TVET development towards improved demand-orientation and quality breakthrough, also by drawing on experiences of Germany, which will continue its support for TVET programmes in the region.

• further exchange, network and develop a cooperation mechanism in TVET with countries and other TVET stakeholders in the ASEAN Region in order to share experiences and learning with regard to TVET reform, including

  • Establishing a Vocational Training Association of ASEAN countries integrating associations for vocational training of the countries in the region into a network, e.g. through regular conferences, also with the support of Germany and the European Association of Institutes for Vocational Training.

  • holding further Regional TVET Conferences to share experiences on TVET reform and ensure their close with related regional platforms on TVET and human resource development

3. Conference Topics

The Conference confirmed the 4 core topics addressed as major drivers for improving demand-orientation of TVET and achieving the TVET Quality Breakthrough. These topics therefore require due attention as integral part of TVET development processes across the region.
OCCUPATIONAL STANDARDS

Occupational standards (OS) play an important role in achieving the TVET Quality Breakthrough. OS function as key points of reference for specifying the outcome and outcome quality which TVET geared at training people for a particular occupation needs to meet. OS form the starting point for developing demand-oriented TVET-programmes, and also the end point of TVET-delivery as a reference for assessment and certification. At the same time, without the necessary conditions (e.g. competent TVET Teachers, strong involvement of the Business Community, sustainable TVET Financing) to provide demand-oriented high-quality TVET in place, OS will achieve no effect on TVET Quality Breakthrough. In order to develop OS to take on their role as key reference point for demand-oriented high-quality TVET

- identify core measures to successfully tackle challenges of changing TVET systems from input-based to outcome-based TVET delivery (assessment & certification of skills based on OS), including the issue of how to “transfer” OS into TVET standards and consequently TVET offers
- establish legal conditions and implement feasible approaches for successfully bringing the business community to take on the leading role in OS setting
- build-up capacities of institutions and personnel tasked with administering a system of OS setting, assessment and certification
- share experiences on OS with countries across the ASEAN region and developed countries of the world regarding the above topics
- ensure the mutual recognition of skills of laborers in the ASEAN Region based on occupational standards, (Vice-Minister Phi – Concluding Speech) e.g. through
  - evaluating existing OS in ASEAN countries with view to their compatibility
• developing a common terminology and definitions (e.g. “occupational standards” vs. “occupational skills standards”) across the region
• piloting mutual recognition and exchange on lessons learned

COOPERATION WITH THE BUSINESS COMMUNITY
Without the Business Community, the TVET Quality Breakthrough will not be achieved. Strengthening the cooperation with and involvement of the Business Community (enterprises, business associations, and other representative bodies of the Business Community) in TVET is a key success factor for improving the demand orientation of TVET. To achieve the strengthening and involvement of the Business Community in TVET:
• increase roles and responsibilities of enterprises and of representing organizations of enterprises within the TVET System, including
  • developing policies to establish a leading role of the Business Community in Occupational Standard setting and Assessment and Certification
  • piloting promising cooperative modes of training delivery and upscale successfully piloted approaches which engage the business community actively in result-oriented collaboration in TVET based on equal partnership, mutual interests and benefits
  • draw on experiences and good practice examples of Germany on how to successfully involve the Business Community in TVET, especially in the area of cooperative training, and, in Viet Nam, for this purpose work closely with German enterprises
  • network with ASEAN countries for exchange of experiences on the above and further topics, such as, for instance, feasible forms of internship and apprenticeship as integrated elements of TVET

TVET TEACHERS
Competent and motivated TVET teaching staff (teachers, instructors and trainers) form the backbone of any TVET Quality Breakthrough – in Viet Nam, in other ASEAN countries and in countries around the world. In order to improve the competences and motivation of TVET Teachers needed for TVET Quality Breakthrough
• implement adequate measures to raise the status / reputation of TVET teaching staff in society and to create a motivating environment / frame conditions (e.g. reasonable level of pay, career path, awareness raising).
• develop and agree upon a TVET teacher occupational standard (for different core categories of TVET teaching staff) which reflects the actual requirements related to performing duties and tasks of a TVET Teacher in accordance with objective of demand-oriented quality TVET
• conceptualize, pilot and exchange lessons learned on models for development of “integrated” teachers being capable of delivering both theoretical education and practical training in an integrated manner
• secure opportunities to develop and retain practical skills of TVET teaching staff, such as work experience placements in companies and other forms of cooperation between TVET and industry (increases expertise of teachers, plus facilitates cooperation between TVET institutes and companies benefiting both)
• apart from enhancing academic TVET Teacher education specifically focus also on developing and organizing non-academic pathways for becoming a TVET teacher, in particular also the reduce the number of TVET Teachers lacking practical occupational competencies. In this context also create incentives for skilled workers to become involved in TVET, including by offering qualification paths for becoming certified TVET Teachers.
• share experiences and cooperate in TVET teacher training among the countries of the ASEAN Region, also drawing on German support

FINANCING OF TVET
Sustainable Financing of TVET is a key issue for the TVET Quality Breakthrough. Sustainable Financing of TVET comprises, most importantly, a solid information basis, sufficient fund generation and efficient administration and allocation of funds. Performance – and outcome based TVET financing are important for influencing TVET quality. Accordingly to make TVET Financing more sustainable, there is a need for further intensifying the exchange on respective existing lessons learned in ASEAN countries, including exchange on
• financial requirements (development and operational costs) for demand-oriented TVET and ways of how to estimate / calculate them differentiated to occupational fields, core occupations and different modes of TVET delivery as well as opportunities and limitations of controlling / containing them as reliable basis for sustainable financial management
• introducing and implementing National TVET (Training) Funds as independent institutions with a sound legal basis, in particular with regard to:
• sources (state, enterprise) and composition of funds in the initial phase of setting up National TVET Funds Enterprises
• motivating enterprises to contribute to National TVET Fund
• ensuring efficient utilization of funds with regard to TVET Quality Breakthrough
• allocation mechanisms and stakeholders facilitating effective use of resources and increasing TVET quality as well as reflecting financial requirements (e.g. allocation based on performance / quality criteria, securing timely allocation of funds etc.)
Scope

The Recommendations for TVET Quality Breakthrough are based on the Concluding Statements of MoLISA Viceminister Nguyen Ngoc Phi and German Ambassador Jutta Frasch as well as on inputs, discussions and results of respective Thematic Plenary Sessions and Working Groups.

Towards more demand-orientation and higher quality of TVET, the Recommendations for TVET Quality Breakthrough can be applied by each individual ASEAN country. The application of the Recommendations will depend on the specific socio-economic needs and conditions, development strategies and constitutional provisions, as well as available resources in a given country and in the ASEAN region as a whole.

The Recommendations for TVET Quality Breakthrough finally can also be applied by relevant regional bodies and networking initiatives. In this context, it is suggested that the next Regional TVET Conference in Indonesia follows up on the actions taken also on the basis of the Recommendations for TVET Quality Breakthrough and on the results thus achieved.
SUMMARY REPORT
# Abbreviations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ASEAN</td>
<td>Association of Southeast Asian Nations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BMZ</td>
<td>Bundesministerium für wirtschaftliche Zusammenarbeit und Entwicklung - German Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BNSP</td>
<td>Badan Nasional Sertifikasi Profesi - national autonomous body responsible for assessment and certification in Vocational Training, Indonesia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CNC</td>
<td>Computerized numerical control</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EU</td>
<td>European Union</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GDVT</td>
<td>General Department of Vocational Training, Viet Nam</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GIZ</td>
<td>Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit (GIZ) GmbH</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HRD</td>
<td>Human Resource Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HRDF</td>
<td>Human Resource Development Fund</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ILO</td>
<td>International Labour Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IT</td>
<td>Information Technology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KfW</td>
<td>Kreditanstalt für Wiederaufbau</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MoLISA</td>
<td>Ministry of Labour – Invalids and Social Affairs, Viet Nam</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MoMT</td>
<td>Ministry of Manpower and Transmigration, Indonesia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NOS</td>
<td>National Occupational Standards</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OECD</td>
<td>Organization of Economic Cooperation and Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OS</td>
<td>Occupational Standard</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RCP</td>
<td>Regional Cooperation Platform</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TVET</td>
<td>Technical and Vocational Education and Training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TI</td>
<td>Teaching Industry</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Preface

Dear Reader

On behalf of the Vietnamese Ministry of Labour, Invalids and Social Affairs (MoLISA), the German Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development (BMZ) and the joint Steering Committee, we are pleased to share this summary report with you on the Regional TVET Conference held in Hanoi, Vietnam, on 10/11 October 2012.

The conference was attended by about 300 participants from 14 countries, comprising high-ranking decision-makers and TVET experts from Vietnam and the ASEAN region, regional and international organisations, international donors and their implementing agencies, as well as the business community and research institutions. This reflects the importance and high level of interest that exists in the overarching topic addressed by the Regional TVET Conference, namely how to increase the quality and demand orientation of TVET to secure a “TVET Quality Breakthrough”, and in particular with regard to ASEAN integration. As the conference clearly showed, the selected topics of Occupational Standards, Cooperation with the Business Community, TVET Teaching Staff and Financing TVET addressed by the conference are all highly relevant with regard to achieving a TVET Quality Breakthrough, not just as topics in their own right but also as they are closely interlinked. It was a great pleasure to experience the broad and in-depth exchange of ideas on the conference topics stimulated by the keynote inputs and in the working sessions. We consider the outcomes of the conference, e.g. the stimulation of enhanced networking, insights into the various topics from different perspectives, the recommendations and initiative of establishing an ASEAN TVET association, as very valuable for the TVET reform process in Vietnam and other ASEAN countries. In view of the need to continue working on core topics for achieving a TVET Quality Breakthrough
in the context of ASEAN integration, we would like to encourage all participants to make use of the momentum generated by this conference by continuing the dialogue and cooperation and by implementing suitable follow-up measures. In this regard, we would like to support the proposal of considering follow-up TVET conferences, for example. We also enjoyed the productive and pleasant atmosphere which prevailed throughout the conference.

We would like to thank our distinguished speakers for sharing their highly valuable insights as well as all the participants for their interest and active participation, both of whom contributed significantly to making this event a success. Last but not least, we would like to convey our sincere thanks and appreciation to the Vietnamese Deputy Prime Minister, His Excellency Nguyen Thien Nhan, for attending the TVET Conference as our guest of honour.

Hoping that you enjoy reading this summary report and remain

Yours sincerely

Nguyen Ngoc Phi
Vice Minister
Vietnamese Ministry of Labour - Invalids and Social Affairs
(Conference Steering Committee Co-Chair)

Dr. Horst Sommer
Priority Area Coordinator TVET
Vietnamese – German Development Cooperation in TVET
(Conference Steering Committee Co-Chair)
I Introduction

Context

A skilled and qualified workforce is needed for further economic and social development in the countries of the ASEAN Community. Moreover, ASEAN countries are facing new regional challenges, e.g., the establishment of a common regional labour market by 2015. Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) has an important role to play in this context and is therefore high on the political agenda. Accordingly, the 2010-2015 ASEAN Labour Ministers’ Work Programme highlights the priority of improving the quality and capacity of human resources in the region with respect to the importance of human resources and skills development in raising productivity and accelerating economic development and sustainable growth. Against this background, government representatives of ASEAN member countries agreed in October 2010 in the “ASEAN Leaders’ Statement on HRD and Skills Development for Economic Recovery and Sustainable Growth” to foster technical cooperation and capacity-building activities. In this statement, ASEAN leaders call for “the promotion of vocational training and workforce learning for the purpose of improving the employability and upgrading the skills of the workforce.”

Vietnam, like other countries in the region, is in the process of reforming its TVET system to meet the demands of the labour market and society in the national and regional context. This is a prominent feature of the 2011-2020 Vietnamese Socio-Economic Development Strategy where developing human resources - “especially high-quality human resources” - is defined as a strategic breakthrough for the country towards becoming an industrialised country. Hence, achieving a TVET Quality Breakthrough represents a main strategic goal and is fundamental to creating a common labour market in ASEAN. In accordance with this, the 2011-2020 Viet-
namese TVET Development Strategy aims to “improve the quality and expand the scale of vocational training . . . meeting the demands of sectors and occupations needing highly skilled manpower, in-country and for the export of labour.” By 2020, vocational training should meet labour market demands in terms of quantity, quality, occupational structure and training qualifications, whilst also contributing to increasing income, reducing poverty sustainably and ensuring social security. The training quality in some occupations should reach the level of that in developed countries in the ASEAN region and the rest of the world.

Germany has a long tradition of development cooperation with Asian countries in the field of TVET, especially with Vietnam. The new Education Strategy - “Ten Objectives for More Education” - of the Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development (BMZ) is the first integrated strategy to address all areas and forms of education. The strategy’s vision is lifelong learning from early childhood education to primary and secondary education, vocational and higher education as well as adult education. Based on that vision, the BMZ pursues a holistic approach to providing support for education, taking a people-centred approach that includes all stakeholders and strengthens the entire education system, rather than just individual sectors. The BMZ also supports inclusive education that addresses all the population, especially marginalised groups. Moreover, the strategy gives priority to fostering gender equality in education. The BMZ is eager to foster high-quality education programmes and it aims to further enhance the effectiveness of its work. In its education work, the Ministry also attaches major importance to conducting a dialogue with all stakeholders. The BMZ Education Strategy tasks Germany with the further expansion of technical and vocational education and training.

TVET was confirmed as a top priority for Vietnamese-German Development Co-operation by Vietnamese Prime Minister Nguyen Tan Dung and German Chancellor Angela Merkel in the Vietnamese-German strategic partnership agreement of October 2011.
Summary of the Regional TVET Conference in Viet Nam

The Regional TVET Conference held in Hanoi, Vietnam, on 10/11 October 2012 was jointly organised by the Vietnamese Ministry of Labour, Invalids and Social Affairs (MoLISA) and the German Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development (BMZ). This event marked the anniversary of the Vietnamese-German strategic partnership and also reflected the importance of TVET in German Development Cooperation across the region.

The central focus and overarching theme of the Regional TVET Conference was how to increase the quality and demand orientation of TVET to secure a “TVET Quality Breakthrough” in the context of ASEAN regional integration. The conference addressed the chosen topics of Occupational Standards, Cooperation with the Business Community, TVET Teaching Staff and TVET Financing. All of these topics are highly relevant with regard to achieving a TVET Quality Breakthrough, not just as topics in their own right but also as they are closely interlinked.

The conference was opened jointly by the MoLISA Minister, Mdm Pham Thi Hai Chuyen, and BMZ State Secretary, Mr. Hans-Jürgen Beerfeltz. The Deputy Prime Minister, H. E. Nguyen Thien Nhan, was a guest of honour and delivered a welcome address on behalf of the Vietnamese Government.

The conference was attended by approximately 300 participants from 14 countries, comprising high-ranking decision-makers and TVET experts from Vietnam and the ASEAN region, regional and international organisations, international donors and their implementing agencies, as well as the business community and research institutions.

In line with the key conference objectives, the main outcomes were as follows:

- A broad sharing of experience and learning from good practice in Vietnam, other countries in the region and internationally, thus generating additional and deeper insights into the core conference topics from different perspectives
- The stimulation of enhanced regional TVET networking and a continuous dialogue regarding TVET reform processes focusing on improving demand orientation and quality
- Recommendations for raising the quality and demand orientation of TVET in Vietnam and other ASEAN countries to secure a TVET Quality Breakthrough in the context of ASEAN integration
II Conference Opening Session

Opening Speeches and Welcome Address

The Regional TVET Conference was opened jointly by MoLISA Minister Mdm. Pham Thi Hai Chuyen and BMZ State Secretary Mr. Hans-Jürgen Beerfeltz. The Deputy Prime Minister H. E. Nguyen Thien Nhan was a guest of honour and delivered a welcome address on behalf of the Vietnamese Government.

Welcome Address by the Deputy Prime Minister,
H. E. Nguyen Thien Nhan

In his welcome address, the Deputy Prime Minister, H. E. Nguyen Thien Nhan, began by expressing his sincerest greetings to the participants of the Regional TVET Conference in Vietnam.

His Excellency highlighted the importance of high-quality human resources with regard to regional and international integration and the competitiveness of economies and for social development. In this context, he referred to the Vietnamese Socio-Economic Development Strategy for the period 2011-2020, where high-quality human resources are one of three breakthrough solutions. The Deputy Prime Minister also emphasised that the reform and improvement of the quality of education and training provided, including TVET, to meet the demands of industrialisation and modernisation in the context of international integration and social development are given special attention by the Vietnamese Government. In this context, he also referred to demand-driven TVET as a widely embraced trend and to the importance of implementing an effective training approach and opportunities for life-long learning, job mobility and adaptability.
The Deputy Prime Minister emphasised that - in parallel to mobilising its domestic resources - Vietnam needs to strengthen its cooperation with countries of the ASEAN region and the world’s developed countries, in particular with the Federal Republic of Germany, to achieve the goals of modernising and reforming TVET. With regard to Germany, he referred to the country’s rich experience and great success in TVET, and in particular in cooperation with businesses.

With regard to areas and principles of cooperation, he touched on several issues including his concern that Vietnam and Germany as well as countries in the region should cooperate on improving TVET quality standards, with a particular focus on staff training and improving the quality of TVET teaching staff. His Excellency explained that this represents an obstacle for Vietnam and that this is where Germany especially has a great deal of experience to offer. He referred to another field of cooperation: the development and provision of TVET courses in modern industrial occupations where there are high skills requirements and levels of quality in accordance with regional and international standards and where Vietnam therefore needs the relevant human resources for its process of industrialisation and modernisation in the context of international integration and competition. With regard to how to ensure effective cooperation, His Excellency emphasised that no country in the world has been successful in “exporting” its training model to another and that Vietnam probably cannot “import” wholesale a training model from another country. In conclusion, he stated the need for an exchange of ideas to share the experience of the different countries and to discuss the advantages and disadvantages of different TVET models, in particular the model of training together with businesses. Referring to the context of integration, the Deputy Prime Minister focused on the issue of the free movement of labour in regional and international labour markets. He referred to the statement by ASEAN leaders on the creation of an ASEAN Community which concludes with the mutual recognition of the occupational skills of workers of countries in the community. He emphasised that the issue is whether ASEAN countries can develop an appropriate policy framework to establish mutual recognition of occupational skills of countries and how to achieve this. This prompted the Deputy Prime Minister to ask whether cooperation and the joint development of common training standards is possible and he said that he was looking forward to sharing his and participants’ views on this.

The Deputy Prime Minister concluded his remarks by expressing his best wishes to the distinguished participants for good health and happiness and for a successful conference.

Opening Speech by MoLISA Minister, Pham Thi Hai Chuyen

In her opening speech, Minister Pham Thi Hai Chuyen first warmly welcomed the participants of the TVET conference. She highlighted the strategic importance of developing human resources in terms of high-quality personnel and
TVET with regard to socio-economic development, as defined in the Socio-Economic Development Strategy (SEDS) for the period 2011-2020 and its underlying strategies.

The Minister explained that socio-economic development demands of society and the goals of redefining the economic structure and upgrading the growth model to achieve an improvement in quality are important factors which impact on TVET and call for a reform of TVET. Minister Chuyen emphasised that Vietnam has affirmed an approach to education and training including TVET which is radical and provides for comprehensive reform in order to meet the development demands of society and to improve quality to achieve standardisation, modernisation, socialisation, democratisation and international integration. An overarching goal with regard to reforming TVET is to secure a breakthrough in TVET quality.

The MoLISA Minister emphasised that Vietnam needs the cooperation and support of other countries and international organisations, in particular Germany and the ASEAN countries, to secure such a Quality Breakthrough. She listed the main areas of cooperation as:

- Improving management capacity and policy and planning capacity in TVET for Vietnam, including the sharing of experience and support for the refinement of TVET legislation and related legal documents
- Attracting sources of ODA among donors for the development of TVET, including focusing efforts to establish high-quality TVET institutions to bring a number of institutions up to regional and international standard
- Engaging in high-quality cooperation for TVET with businesses, primarily FDI businesses.

On behalf of senior ministers and officials at MoLISA, Minister Chuyen there-
fore expressed a desire for further effective and all-round cooperation in the field of TVET with countries in the ASEAN region and Germany. She also thanked the delegates for their cooperation and in particular expressed her sincere thanks for the effective cooperation with Germany and the BMZ in supporting the improvement of TVET in Vietnam.

**Opening Speech by BMZ State Secretary, Hans-Jürgen Beerfeltz**

In his opening speech, State Secretary Hans-Jürgen Beerfeltz expressed his pleasure and great honour in welcoming so many distinguished delegates from the entire region and from Germany.

He highlighted the close friendship between Vietnam and Germany and the fact that Vietnam is one of Germany’s most important partners, as reflected, for example, in the strategic partnership agreement signed by German Chancellor Angela Merkel and the Prime Minister of Vietnam, Nguyen Tan Dung, in October 2011.

Mr. Beerfeltz emphasised that the overall purpose of development assistance is to enable partner countries to successfully shape their economic, social and political development in a globalised world. He explained that – in line with this objective – Germany, together with its development cooperation partners, aims to:

- Fight the causes of poverty instead of merely treating the symptoms
- Pursue a development policy which promotes productive forces and creates new opportunities
- Pursue a development policy that takes people from welfare to work, brings families into sustainable structures for the future and helps talented young people to pursue promising careers

The State Secretary emphasised that Germany believes that education and TVET are crucial in achieving these aims and that education and training is the central task of the 21st century.

He explained that BMZ’s integrated education strategy comprehensively covers the entire educational spectrum and upholds the principle of lifelong learning; it is therefore the solid foundation on which all education and TVET measures undertaken by the BMZ are built. The State Secretary also emphasised the need for more and better TVET as an own means contribution to socio-economic development.

Mr. Beerfeltz highlighted that the TVET conference reflects the great importance of TVET in cooperation between Vietnam and Germany and in cooperation with the region. He also informed participants that TVET is a focal area for
Vietnamese-German bilateral development cooperation and that with its education strategy and involvement in Vietnam and the entire region BMZ aims to upgrade TVET structures. In this context, the key success factors of Germany’s TVET system are used as a point of reference:

- Close cooperation with public and private stakeholders, in particular the involvement of the business community
- Learning in actual working environments in companies
- Widespread acceptance of standards (by the business community, individuals, TVET providers, etc.)
- Qualified TVET staff
- Direct input by TVET research and consultancy institutions

Mr. Beerfeltz stressed that Germany places commitment and respectful relationships with partner countries at the very heart of development cooperation. People in developing countries are not just seen as recipients of aid but as key actors who can promote their own development. Hence, the BMZ also regards its involvement in TVET as a means for promoting social development.

He confirmed the importance of securing a TVET Quality Breakthrough and tackling the four related core topics being addressed during the TVET conference; he also referred to the huge potential that all the core topics held for the future of TVET.

Concluding his remarks, Mr. Beerfeltz expressed his sincere thanks to everyone who had helped to make this great event possible. He also hoped that all the participants would find the conference interesting and be inspired by the discussions and the opportunity to work together on developing solutions and forward-looking approaches. Last but not least, he emphasised that he is looking forward to continuing the close cooperation in the future and for the future.
Opening Input Session

The opening input session was chaired by MoLISA Vice Minister, Nguyen Ngoc Phi.

The three opening input speeches covered the prospects for TVET development in Vietnam, BMZ support and cooperation for TVET system development in Vietnam and the prospects for TVET in context of the ASEAN Community.

2011–2020 TVET Development Strategy in Vietnam and Opportunities for Cooperation between Vietnam, Germany and other Countries in the Region

Dr. Nguyen Tien Dung
Director General, General Department of Vocational Training,
Ministry of Labour, Invalids and Social Affairs, Viet Nam

Dr. Nguyen Tien Dung focused in his speech on the core issues of the 2011-2020 Vietnamese TVET Development Strategy as well as on aspects of the cooperation between Vietnam and Germany and other countries in the region.

Setting the context, Dr. Dung started by outlining the main socio-economic aspects affecting TVET in Vietnam. With regard to the international context, he highlighted, for example, the role of skilled human resources as a key success factor for the competitiveness of a country in the context of global and regional integration, the increasing importance of labour mobility and of demand-driven TVET as an effective means internationally for creating a highly skilled workforce based on socio-economic demand. Reflecting on the local context, he elaborated on the goal of the Vietnamese Socio-Economic Development Strategy to become a modernisation-led industrial country by 2020. Dr. Dung highlighted human resources
development as one of three strategic breakthrough solutions in which TVET has an extremely important role in contributing to improving the competitiveness of human resources and the socio-economic development of Vietnam. He informed participants that the core of the relevant Strategy on Development of Human Resources of Vietnam for 2011-2020 is about improving the quality of TVET and that the state has decided on a “fundamental and comprehensive reform of education” including TVET.

The strategic framework for reforming TVET in Vietnam is set by the 2011–2020 TVET Development Strategy and has the following overall objective: “By 2020, vocational training will meet the demands of the labour market in terms of quantity, quality, structure of training occupations and levels; the training quality of some occupations will be at the level of that of the world’s developed countries … improve income, reduce poverty sustainably and ensure social security”.

Dr. Dung explained that despite the encouraging achievements resulting from the ongoing TVET reform process TVET in Vietnam is still facing a number of challenges. In this regard, he referred to the general lack of skilled labour and the relatively low quality and low productivity of labour, the fact that the shift from supply-driven to demand-driven TVET based on the needs of society and the labour market has been relatively slow (e. g. with the quality of training not yet meeting the demands of the labour market in terms of occupational skills and soft skills such as industrial working and capacity for teamwork), the lack of TVET teachers of sufficient quantity and quality and the fact that there is as yet no close link between businesses and TVET institutions.

Dr. Dung explained that in order to achieve strategic TVET objectives and tackle these challenges the Vietnamese Government has laid down 9 concurrent groups of solutions, with the establishment of a national occupational skills framework as the central solution, as well as “Developing vocational teachers and managers” and
“Reforming the state management of vocational training” as breakthrough solutions. These solutions also include “Quality control and assurance in TVET”, “Linking up TVET with labour market and business involvement”, “Awareness-raising about TVET development” and “Strengthening of international cooperation in TVET”.

He emphasised that Vietnam has strengthened its international and regional cooperation to facilitate achieving the TVET reform goals, selecting countries which are successful in TVET as strategic partners. One of these strategic partners is Germany. Dr. Dung explained that within the context of bilateral Vietnamese-German cooperation in the field of TVET several projects have been implemented since 2006 focusing on a TVET System Advisory Project related to the overall TVET reform process, the training of management staff and professionals employed by the TVET authorities, the development of TVET courses at the international level (including availability of equipment) in selected priority occupations as well as TVET teacher training. He valued the cooperation with Germany as it had proved to be very effective, contributing to strengthening structures and building capacity towards improving the demand orientation and quality of the TVET system in Vietnam. Examples of cooperation with other countries in the region referred to by Dr. Dung include the assessment and recognition of occupational skills among Vietnam and ASEAN countries for the formation of an ASEAN Community by 2015.

**BMZ Support for TVET System Development in Vietnam**

**Dr. Horst Sommer**

**BMZ Priority Coordinator TVET in Vietnam**

Dr. Sommer began his opening address by reconfirming the key role of demand-driven TVET for social and economic development as well as ASEAN integration as outlined by the previous speakers.

He then gave examples of key reference points for Vietnamese-German Cooperation in TVET, such as Vietnamese development strategies and policies defining “High-quality human resources” (especially skilled workers) as a key factor, the 2011-2020 Vietnamese TVET Strategy, BMZ’s integrated Education Strategy, the Vietnamese-German Strategic Partnership Agreement (Hanoi Declaration) from October 2011 and the inter-governmental agreements defining TVET as a priority area for Vietnamese-German development cooperation.

Dr. Sommer explained that the key objective of the “Programme Reform of TVET in Vietnam” is to improve the demand orientation and quality of TVET along two dimensions of improving opportunities for gainful employment for individuals and at the same time increasing the availability of a skilled workforce in Vietnam. Thus, the bilateral cooperation programme is contributing to social and economic development in Vietnam.
The implementing partners referred to by Dr. Sommer are the BMZ and its implementing agencies GIZ and KfW, MoLISA and its GDVT and selected TVET institutions (criteria-based selection) and other public and private partners (such as the Vietnamese Chamber of Commerce and Industry, the Vietnamese Vocational Training Association as well as Vietnamese and German businesses).

He emphasised that main guiding principles of cooperation include (a) building up capacities for the change process in TVET at all levels (i.e. a multi-level approach), (b) facilitating individuals, organisations and networks with a view to improving the quality of TVET, (c) creating a close partnership between all partners for cooperating towards a common goal and (d) basing this partnership on ownership, commitment and respectful relationships.

The main areas of activity covered by the “Programme Reform of TVET in Vietnam” outlined by Dr. Sommer include developing TVET teaching staff, improving management capacity, involving the business community in TVET, providing tools and equipment and developing demand-driven TVET courses in selected core industrial occupations. He explained that these activities contribute to improving the relevance and quality of TVET courses, the reform of core TVET system elements and ultimately to the implementation of the 2011-2020 Vietnamese TVET Development Strategy.

As to support for implementing these activities, Dr. Sommer referred to an interlinked Technical Cooperation (through GIZ) and Financial Cooperation (through KfW), close cooperation with regional cooperation programmes supported by BMZ and drawing on the key success factors of German TVET.

After sharing his experience of implementing these measures in an exemplary manner, he outlined the future potential for Vietnamese-German cooperation in TVET comprising (a) the development of a LILAMA2 College Centre of Excel-
lence to international standard, (b) creating tangible good practice examples of cooperative training in Vietnam (e.g. with German companies in Vietnam), (c) a TVET System Advisory Project, e.g. for refining TVET legislation, strengthening cooperation with the business community and TVET teacher training, and (d) the integration of “Green Skills” requirements into TVET (referring to the Vietnamese “Green Growth” strategy).

Dr. Sommer concluded his opening address by reconfirming the importance of job specifications/occupational standards set by industry, cooperation with the business community at different levels, the availability of skilled TVET teaching staff and sustainable TVET financing as key factors for a TVET Quality Breakthrough.

Opportunities and Challenges for TVET in the ASEAN Community

Mr. Oeun Tep,
Deputy Director General, General Department of TVET, Ministry of Labour and Vocational Training, Cambodia, and representative of the current chair of the ASEAN Senior Labour Officials Meeting (SLOM)

Mr. Oeun Tep, gave an overview of the key aspects of human resources and skills development in the ASEAN context.

Starting with a reference to the ASEAN Charter, he quoted the basic principle as being “…to develop human resources through closer cooperation in education and life-long learning, and in science and technology, for the empowerment of the peoples of ASEAN and for the strengthening of the ASEAN Community”. Other key reference points in Mr. Oeun Tep’s presentation were the ASEAN Social Cultural Community (ASCC) blueprint, the ASEAN Economic Community (AEC) blueprint and the ASEAN Leadership Statement on Human Resources
and Skills Development for Economic Recovery and Sustainable Growth, all of which included major statements on Human Resources and Skills Development from an ASEAN perspective.

The key objectives of the 2009–2015 ASCC blueprint - which reflects ASEAN’s social agenda and is focused on poverty eradication and human development - include investing in human resources development with the focus on enhancing and improving the capacity of ASEAN human resources through strategic programmes and on developing a qualified, skilled and well-prepared ASEAN labour force that would benefit from as well as cope with the challenges of regional integration.

With regard to the AEC blueprint, Mr. Oeun Tep highlighted the “Free Flow of Skilled Labour” as one of the five core elements under a “Single Market and Production Base”.

Referring to the ASEAN Leaders’ Statement on Human Resources and Skills Development for Economic Recovery and Sustainable Growth which focuses on enhancing the quality and skills of workers in all ASEAN Member States, he summarised the key issues as:

- Promoting vocational training and workforce learning for the purpose of improving the employability and upgrading the skills of the workforce
- Developing national skills frameworks in ASEAN member states through the sharing of experience and best practice as an important strategy for strengthening human resource development and management and for enabling member states to raise their respective levels of skills standards, as an incremental approach towards an ASEAN skills recognition framework
- Encouraging the participation of the private sector in conducting skills competitions, such as the ASEAN Skills Competition, to support ASEAN
workforce development and to achieve the regional standard of competency

- Fostering entrepreneurship and innovation of the workforce, particularly in Small and Medium Enterprises, in order to promote economic and employment growth
- Encouraging better access to skills training for vulnerable and marginalised groups in society and workers in the informal economy
- Encouraging research and the sharing of experience in human resource development and training policies between ASEAN and its dialogue partners

In the final part of his presentation, Mr. Oeun Tep summarised the actions being taken to realise the ASEAN Leaders’ Statement including:

- Establishing a distinctively ASEAN forum in the form of an annual Human Resources Conference (with 3 conferences having already taken place) for government officials and HR practitioners from all ASEAN member countries to learn and share best HR practice with each other
- Providing networking opportunities among HR practitioners in ASEAN towards the development of a strong ASEAN HR community
- All ASEAN member states should develop their respective national skills qualification frameworks in preparation for discussing a regional skills recognition framework
- National skills qualification frameworks should be developed and vigorously implemented in consultation with TVET institutions, industry and social partners in ASEAN member states
- ASEAN member states should work towards improving the comparability of national skills standards
- ASEAN member states should continue to assess and improve the quality of human resources and education, including TVET and skills training, in the region to match labour market demands and technological advancement
- The relevant ASEAN sectoral bodies in charge of education, market access, labour and immigration should consider forming a forum of experts to share information and dialogue to improve understanding of the strategies and constraints of each sector pertaining to the mobility of skilled labour
- ASEAN member states should continue to cooperate closely with relevant international organisations, tripartite partners and other relevant parties in implementing these recommendations
III Conference Topics – Keynotes and Working Sessions

Occupational Standards

Background

Occupational standards (OS) are a core topic due to their pre-eminent role as the focal point of reference for demand quality TVET delivery as well as for acceptable and comparable TVET qualifications - especially in the context of ASEAN integration and labour mobility.

Major TVET goals include training a skilled, versatile workforce for the business sector and at the same time providing graduates with employable TVET qualifications, thus enabling them to find gainful employment – and in the context of labour mobility not necessarily in the country where their education and training took place. In this regard, occupational standards play a central role by defining the typical characteristics of an occupation from the perspective of performing this occupation in the world of work under actual typical working conditions. This definition includes, for example, the main duties and tasks and typical tools and equipment used for performing them as well as the main occupational skills required and the appropriate knowledge and attitude for employment. Occupational standards are therefore a focal point of reference which specifies the outcome and outcome quality that TVET which is geared to training people for a particular occupation needs to meet. Leading on from that, occupational standards are the starting point for developing demand-driven TVET programmes as well as the end point for TVET delivery as a reference for assessment and certification.
In contrast to occupational standards as outcome standards, TVET delivery standards - such as the standards for TVET teaching staff, learning infrastructure, etc. - are focused on the input and process quality of TVET delivery. They can be characterised as secondary or derived standards because the overarching reference for TVET delivery is the outcome quality as defined in the occupational standards.

Plenary Session

Occupational Standards – A Key Factor in TVET Reform under the Aspect of ASEAN Integration

Prof. Dr. Duong Duc Lan
Deputy Director General of GDVT, MoLISA

Prof. Dr. Duong Duc Lan opened his presentation describing occupational standards (OS) as a key factor for TVET reform under the aspect of ASEAN integration. Accordingly, he went on to discuss the following three main issues, (1) ASEAN integration of skills development, (2) occupational standards - a key in TVET reform and (3) occupational standards development in Viet Nam.

First, the ASEAN goal is to create a single market and production base which is stable, prosperous, highly competitive and economically integrated. This entails effective facilitation of trade and investment including free flow of goods, services and investment, as well as freer movement of skilled labour. To reach this goal all ASEAN member states should develop their own national skills standards and should also work together towards improving the comparability of national skill standards among countries in the region.

Prof. Dr. Lan secondly pointed out that there are many solutions for TVET reform, but only one key factor: occupational standards. Through occupational
standards one can identify all needed information for TVET, e.g. the management, the learning and teaching methodology, the curricular. Occupational standards, according to the ILO definition, describe the knowledge, skills and attitudes that a person needs in order to carry out a particular job or activity at the level of performance required. For all stakeholders, like the government, employers, training institutions and trade unions, several benefits result from these occupational standards. For the government the benefits for example are to be able to assess the competencies of migrant workers leaving or arriving in a country. The employer can benefit from the specified training requirements to TVET providers as well as the specified skills requirements to agencies supplying labour from within the country or another country. The benefits of occupational standards for the training institutions can be the focused development of a curriculum, teaching, learning and assessment resources, the assistance in the design of buildings and equipment or the identification of materials and equipment for effective training. The trade unions’ may benefit for instance by being able to better identify the skills needed by their members and organize training programs for their members.

OS development in Viet Nam is based on the needs of the industry. Several principles and criteria lead to the development of occupational standards. At the beginning of the development stands the setup of an Occupational Standards Committee. Through several steps of analysing the tasks and occupations a draft of occupational standards is developed. The final step is to approve and issue the occupational standards. Since 2008 173 sets of occupational standards were developed and 123 set were issued. The goal for 202 is to develop and issue 400 occupational standards sets.
Development of Competency Standard and the Implementation – Indonesia Experience

I Gusti Putu Laksaguna
Inspector general of the Ministry of Tourism and Creative Economy, Republic of Indonesia

In his presentation Mr. Putu shared experiences in the development and implementation of competency standards in Indonesia.

He pointed out that there have been two phases in the development of competency standards; the first phase 1999-2004 and the second phase 2005-now. Accordingly, the initial development of competency standards began around 1999 in Indonesia with assistance from the Government of Australia under the Indonesia-Australia Partnership for Skills Development (IAPSD) project. The focus of the project was the development and implementation of a competency-based training system. During the first phase, laws and regulations were issued that had significant impact on the adoption and implementation of competency standards. For example the Manpower Law No.13, 2003 covered (i) the right of workers to obtain recognition of his/her competency; (ii) the recognition of a worker’s competency by competency certification; and (iii) the establishment of BNSP as an independent body to implement competency certification.

The competency standards were developed taking several steps, starting with from industry inputs and the setup of a task force (including all stakeholders like the industry, academicals, ministries). This task force was then tasked with the research, adoption and adaption as well as the verification of a draft of the OS. The final approval was done by the Ministry of Manpower and Transmigration.

The model utilized for competency standards was the Regional Model of Competency Standard (RMCS) format. This format provides stakeholders with a de-
gree of flexibility in the use of the competency standards to better meet their individual needs. The RMCS format shows the title of the standard written in terms of a performance, with the elements indicating the steps in the process, and performance criteria indicating the work instructions covering every step of the production process. These components of RMCSs align with the structure of the curriculum which state sequentially - the topic of the module, the learning outcome, and criteria for evaluation. The idea of this approach is that the alignment (or linking) between, on the one hand the job analysis, tasks and task elements, and performance criteria, and on the other hand, the competency based curriculum and the assessment criteria, ensures training meets industry needs.

In the second phase the BNSP was established under MOMT to ensure the quality of vocational skills testing.

International Experiences in Occupational Standards Development and Implementation

Dr. Michaela Baur
Acting Head, Department Sustainable Economic Development / Head, Competence Center TVET & Labour Market, GIZ Eschborn, Germany

Drawing on international experiences and arguing from the German perspective, embedded in the German attitude to TVET and based on experiences of development cooperation with many partner countries in the field of TVET, Dr. Baur outlined main lessons learned and provided recommendations with regard to the development and implementation of occupational standards.

Laying the groundwork for her argument, Dr Baur defined occupational standards among other things as describing the skills, knowledge and understanding required to perform competently in the workplace. Furthermore, occupational standards differ from but also need to be closely connected to TVET delivery
standards. For, whereas occupational standards define the expected TVET outcome from an employers’ perspective, TVET delivery standards (input / process oriented) facilitate the achievement of this expected TVET outcome through demand-oriented TVET delivery. Finally, there exists a wide variety of occupational standard formats and development methods. Since 10-15 years the development of occupational standards is a worldwide trend with 142 countries being in different stages of OS development and implementation.

Consequently, Dr. Baur introduced the main ‘lessons learnt’ of occupational standard development and implementation in five theses.

(1) The very common strategy of “borrow-adapt-adopt” is, at first glance, faster, easier and cheaper, but the development is in the end based on countries’ specifics. In this context, it is important that ownership is in the respective country and that national capacities are built up.

(2) The whole issue is more than the sum of its parts. Many occupational standards are fragmented into too many pieces, therefore the attitude, the pride, the responsibility and the overview of a profession can get lost.

(3) The level of unitisation has to be in line with the ways of work-organization and division labour in a given country. In this context, the understanding of a profound occupation, which enables to fulfil a certain number of concrete jobs, asks for a broader understanding of occupational standards.

(4) The development of occupational standards is not the end of the story, but the beginning. Occupational standards are not (yet) curricula, they need to be transferred into curricula. The implementation of occupational standards after all requires competent teachers and an appropriate infrastructure.

(5) Occupational standards may be the interface to the labour market, but should not be the only one. There are many topics which need attention
with respect to TVET Quality Breakthrough, such as cooperation with the business community and qualified TVET teachers.

Dr. Baur finished her presentation by recommending, with regard to OS development and implementation, among other things to: “Learn from other countries, but make sure, that occupational standards fit to YOUR country.” And “Better have a less perfect, but “living” system with ownership of all stakeholders.”

**Working sessions**

Two of the working sessions dealt with the core conference topic of “Occupational Standards”.

**Working Session 1: “Occupational Standards – Key Reference Point for Demand-driven TVET”**.

Starter input at this working session comprised “The harmonisation and transfer from occupational standards to TVET standards” and “The role of the National Training Council in occupation standards setting – experiences from the Lao PDR”.

Key highlights from this working session shared in the plenary sessions were:

1. **Experience**
   - How to harmonise between national and regional qualification frameworks: the mutual recognition of qualifications in GMS countries (with the support of ADB) obtained good results
   - Top-down and bottom-up approaches have been tested (in Lao PDR and Thailand); both have pros and cons
   - In Indonesia, there was an interesting example of a sector-specific approach (tourism)
Harmonisation is complicated because of the different definitions (skills, competencies, etc.)

2. Key highlights
- Common definitions (e.g., language, “currency”) are needed in order to harmonise
- CBT and Dual TVET can be combined (if TVET reform is flexible)
- Forms of partnership between public and private sectors at all levels and in all procedures is a key factor
- Modular curricula are easier to update

Working Session 2: “Involving the Business Community in Occupational Standards Setting, Assessment and Certification in Asia”.

Starter input for this working session comprised “Occupational standards as a basis for the certification of the existing workforce” and “The Indonesian experience and lessons learned in examining/assessing against occupational standards”.

Key highlights from this working session shared in the plenary sessions were:
- The lack of a legal framework and awareness
- National Occupational Skills Standards (NOSS) are nation-specific
- Diverse terminology may lead to confusion
- Thus, a “translation language” for comparability & recognition is necessary
- Converting NOSS into company OSS, especially for SMEs, should be supported
- Incentive system to be created and maintained
- Capacity-building for practitioners and managers to create national capacity is important
Cooperation with the Business Community

Background

The state alone is no longer able to tackle the numerous challenges relating to achieving ambitious TVET reform and development goals. Therefore, the active involvement of other TVET stakeholders, particularly the business community, is vital and is receiving growing attention.

Cooperation with the business community – comprising individuals, public and private companies and their representative bodies – includes several fields and has many positive effects. Due to the importance of occupational standards as an outcome (quality) requirement for TVET delivery from the employers’ perspective, the development of occupational standards is a field where the involvement of the business sector in a leading role is essential. Another important field of cooperation is TVET provision based on cooperative modes of delivery. In these modes of delivery, parts of an agreed TVET programme - typically training in practical skills - are completed in a company. Ideally, this is organised in the form of work placements and work process integrated learning. The benefits of such an approach range from increased demand orientation and increased cost effectiveness (as investment in workshops in TVET institutes and the related operational costs can be reduced) to familiarising learners with the real world of work and bringing them and potential employers into contact with each other. Other fields of cooperation include the involvement of the business sector in the development of TVET teaching staff.

The key issue with regard to a working results-oriented collaboration is how to engage the business community actively in TVET. Approaches that have proved successful in this regard focus on equal partnership and persuasion based on mu-
tual interests and benefits. This includes involving business sectors as appropriate in TVET policy and strategy development as well.

**Keynote inputs**

**Key Success Factors in German TVET – Cooperation with the Business Community**

**Prof. Friedrich Hubert Esser**  
**President of the German Federal Institute for Vocational Education and Training (BIBB)**

In his presentation, Prof. Esser described the German Dual TVET System and its five key features as “success factors” in the TVET system in Germany. The German TVET system is an integral part of the social market economy which provides the framework for competition and economic stability as well as securing social balance and fairness of participation. According to Professor Esser’s presentation, the key success factors in the German TVET system are: (1) cooperation with the business community, (2) workplace learning, (3) a widespread acceptance of standards, (4) the training of TVET staff and (5) institution-based research and consultation.

The innovative strength of the German TVET system is an institution-based dialogue between the state, the business community and civil society through which a consensus on occupational standards is reached. While three quarters of initial TVET in Germany takes place within companies, supplemented by college-based provision, the state and trade and industry also contribute their own share of TVET finance and work together to secure standards for the examination and certification of the skills acquired. The example of Germany shows that active learning within the real work process is a rapid and reliable method of having a sustainable influence on work and learning behaviours. However, qualifications need to be comparable. Accepted occupational stan-
Standards form the basis for a high degree of mobility of skilled workers and enable companies to conduct efficient human resources recruitment. TVET teachers and company-based trainers need to be in possession of extensive theoretical and practical knowledge. It is important for them to have a rich pedagogical and didactic skill set at their disposal and at the same time be able to offer in-depth insights into the real world of work. Educational and labour market research provide an important impetus for short-term and long-term developments in TVET and labour market policy.

Increasing the Involvement of the Business Sector in TVET – Objectives, Approaches and Benefits

Dr. Le Van Hien
Director, LILAMA 2 Technical and Technology College, Vietnam

Dr. Hien analysed the current situation of TVET delivery in Vietnam and observed that the existing TVET system fails to meet the demands and expectations of the business sector due to inadequate curricula and training equipment as well as insufficient practical knowledge on the part of TVET teachers. Hence, TVET institutions often are unable to provide the types of skills that are needed in the workplace. Companies often need to retrain newly recruited graduates of TVET institutions. Dr. Hien then gave the main reasons for closer cooperation with the business community in TVET. He stated that such cooperation will be essential to secure the target TVET Quality Breakthrough based on the objectives (1) that learners will attain the knowledge and skills to meet the requirements of the real world of work and (2) that the business community will obtain a high-quality workforce in accordance with its demands.

According to Dr. Hien, the business community is to play an important role in ensuring a Quality Breakthrough in the following areas: (1) development of cur-
ricula and training materials (2) upgrading of TVET training staff, (3) selection of equipment and (4) assessment of TVET outcomes.

With regard to workshop layout, Dr. Hien explained the “Three Layer Concept” with the training provided increasingly based on workplace practice, in which Layer 1 equips learners with basic generic skills, Layer 2 with specific trade-relevant skills, while Layer 3 focuses on complex skills in a real or simulated workplace environment. This training is complemented by work placements. In future, the scope of practical training in the workplace offered by the business community is to be further increased as a pilot program of actual dual training.

Key Factors for Cooperating with Businesses in TVET Delivery

Mr. Yussof Md. Sahir
Managing Director, German-Malaysian Institute (GMI), Malaysia

In his presentation, Mr. Yussof explained the rationale of the National Dual Training System in Malaysia which was implemented in 2005 in response to Vision 2020 and related macro-economic reforms. Based on this, Malaysia intends to achieve the status of a developed high-income country by the year 2020. Special reference was made to the New Economic Model that is to make Malaysia more competitive as well as market and investor-friendly. On top of this, the increasing demand for highly skilled workers needs to be met. By 2020, Malaysia expects 40% of employees to become skilled by attending TVET courses (2010: 28%). Aside from the quantity aspect, higher qualifications need to reflect the ongoing change in technology. Recent TVET policy guidelines were outlined in the 10th Malaysia Plan for 2011-2015 and place the emphasis on (1) improving the perception of TVET and attracting more trainees, (2) upgrading and harmonising TVET curriculum quality in line with industry requirements, (3) developing highly effective instructors and (4) streamlining delivery of TVET. Initia-
tives taken by the government include the establishment of the National Dual Training System (NDTS) focusing on industry-oriented training that combines workplace training under actual work conditions and institutional training. Mr. Yusoff further described the role and contribution of industry as a key factor in the Malaysian TVET system. As illustrated in his presentation, a considerable number of national and international businesses participate in the NDTS.

Institutions, such as the German-Malaysian Institute (GMI), were established in order to provide the skilled labour required to meet the growth targets for human and economic planning. The GMI prepares its trainees in industry-related technology-based occupations as part of their pre-employment qualification before entering the job market in fields related to manufacturing, ICT services and the processing industry. Companies related to industries including oil and gas, semiconductors, automotive, food and beverages and engineering design recruit GMI students annually. To finish, Mr. Yusoff provided a few typical examples of practical training projects realised at GMI in close cooperation with industry.

**Working sessions**

Two of the working sessions dealt with the core conference topic: “Cooperation with the Business Community”.

**Working Session 3: “Enabling Framework for the Collaboration of TVET Stakeholders”**.

Starter inputs in this working session comprised: “Teaching industry – strengthening partnership with industry in Indonesia” and “Increasing involvement of the business community in TVET – objectives, challenges and opportunities from the business perspective”.

Key highlights from this working session shared in the plenary summary sessions were:

1. **Challenges faced**
   - The age/skills of the target group are not adequate for acceptance as a trainee by the business sector
   - Companies often need to retrain graduates of TVET institutions as they do not have sufficient workplace-relevant skills
   - Income generated by TVET colleges by cooperating with the business sector is often deducted from the allocated budget

2. **Findings**:
   - Occupational standards need to be developed with business sector involvement
   - Training curricula should be developed in cooperation with businesses (e.g. modules of in-company training)
• Incentives for in-company training could be:
  ▪ Tax reductions
  ▪ Refunding companies for the cost of training out of the national training fund (if such a fund exists)
  ▪ Allowances for trainees during in-company training paid (in part) by the government

**Working Session 4: “Cooperative Modes of TVET Delivery”**.

Starter inputs at this working session comprised: “Vietnamese approach to strengthening collaboration of TVET stakeholders” and “College/business cooperation – the Lao-German Technical College experience”.

Key highlights from this working session shared in the plenary summary sessions were:

1. **Experience**
   - The cooperation between TVET institutions and social partners, especially the business community, was established to the mutual benefit of all stakeholders while also taking social responsibility into account
   - The involvement of the business community in TVET includes:
     ▪ Signing training and joint-training contracts (in Vietnam)
     ▪ Providing training for teaching personnel (in Vietnam and Lao PDR)
     ▪ Providing training equipment (in Vietnam)
     ▪ Providing financial support for training institutions/apprentices (in Vietnam and Lao PDR)
     ▪ Applying the dual training system (being piloted in Vietnam and Laos)
     ▪ Receiving students for work placements
     ▪ Providing work opportunities for graduates
2. Lessons learned

- There is no way that TVET can be developed without the involvement of the business community
- Businesses need to play a more active role in TVET
- To enhance cooperation among stakeholders in TVET, it is necessary to define the position, role, duties, responsibilities and benefits of each stakeholder based on their involvement
- The German Dual TVET System is a very good model; however, this model need to be transferred in an adapted form based on national conditions and specific sectors/occupations
TVET Financing

Background

Sustainable TVET financing is generally an important factor in a functioning TVET system. There is in particular a direct relationship between securing sufficient financial resources, e.g. for skilled TVET teaching staff, TVET learning infrastructure, etc. and the outcome quality TVET is expected to provide in accordance with the occupational standards. Increasing outcome quality normally implies increasing the financial requirements. In Vietnam and other ASEAN countries, a growth in financial requirements has also resulted from expanding TVET systems due to population growth and the increasing demand for a skilled workforce.

Against the background of growing competition for limited public financial resources, increasing financial requirements for expanding the quantity and improving the quality of TVET based on demand mean that securing sustainable TVET finance constitutes a major challenge and key issue in TVET-related development efforts. In this regard, dealing with the financial requirements for demand-oriented TVET is an important issue. It includes, for example, information on actual costs and major cost drivers as well as containing costs as far as is feasible. Another main issue is mobilising funding sources in addition to public funding, with the main focus on financial contributions from companies and trainees (and/or their parents) as TVET stakeholders and beneficiaries. A third major issue is administration and the allocation of funds with the focus on transparency and accountability as well as efficiency and effectiveness, for example, through performance-based allocation mechanisms.
Working Sessions

Working Session 5: “Sustainable TVET Finance”.
Starter inputs in this working session comprised: “Approaches in TVET finance in Vietnam”, “Experiences from the Human Resource Development Fund in Malaysia” and “Strengthening stakeholder engagement in TVET based on cost-benefit analysis”.

Approaches in TVET Finance in Vietnam
Mr Nguyen Chien Thang
Deputy Director, Department of Planning and Finance, GDVT/MoLISA

Mr. Thang started by providing an overview on the current state of the TVET finance system in Vietnam. It was calculated that the public budget is still the main source of finance for the TVET system, covering approx. 60% of overall expenditure with an increasing share reserved for TVET within the overall budget for education. Nevertheless, Mr. Thang pointed out that public funds on their own are insufficient to satisfy the financial requirements of the Vietnamese TVET sector which is looking to increase the quantity and improve the quality of training delivery. Furthermore, the allocation of public funds to TVET providers has so far been mainly input-based – in other words, factors such as training facilities, staffing, etc., are financed according to enrolment figures only, regardless of the outcome of training in terms of quality and suitability for the labour market. This system lacks incentives for TVET providers to improve the quality of training. Public funds are allocated without clear prioritisation and without differentiation between the occupations, although costs arising for the courses may differ.

Mr. Thang therefore presented a range of proposals for reforming the TVET finance mechanisms in Vietnam. A core element of the strategy is strengthening the
diversification of funding sources. In particular, the business sector – the stakeholder currently with the lowest financial contribution (~5%) – is to participate more in financing TVET in the future. TVET institutions are also expected to generate more of their own revenue. However, the government will certainly maintain its leading role in the financing of TVET. Revenue from tuition fees paid by individuals is not to be increased for social reasons. Furthermore, Mr. Thang observed the need to improve financial planning in TVET and to allocate funds based on outcomes. The financial requirements for TVET delivery should be calculated separately for each occupation and training level. The necessary overall expenditure can then be realistically calculated for a mid-term view of 3-5 years. The government will focus on financing TVET in occupations which are a high priority for the socio-economic development of Vietnam while also taking social aspects into consideration, such as support for poor regions. More of an outcome-based finance system is to be established e.g. through the purchase (“commissioning”) of vocational training services and by implementing bidding mechanisms.

Experience from the Human Resource Development Fund in Malaysia

Ms Wan Yon Shahima
Deputy CEO, Human Resource Development Council, Malaysia

Ms. Wan Yon Shahima presented the experience gained by the Malaysian Human Resource Development Fund (HRDF), an internationally recognised “good practice” example for training funds. She first introduced the legislative framework and organisational background of the HRDF, first introducing the HRD Council, a multi-stakeholder body established via the Malaysian Human Resources Development Act in 1992 which administers the HRDF. The legal basis for the training fund itself is the Pembangunan Sumber Manusia Berhad (PSMB) Act from 2001. Key objectives are to encourage employers to engage in the training of their workers and thus increase overall productivity and com-
petitiveness of the country’s economy. The working principle of the HRDF is (a) collecting an “HRD levy” from businesses and (b) disbursing funds in diverse training schemes through a levy-grant system. There are currently 7 schemes for continuously retraining the existing workforce and 4 schemes aimed at providing initial training (i.e. for the supply of skilled workers). These schemes promote, for example, the purchase of training equipment by companies or the implementation of apprenticeship programmes. Others enable several employers to obtain refunds if they jointly commission an external training institution to conduct training for their employees. Schemes promoting special target groups, emerging industrial sectors or entrepreneurs (i.e. SMEs) are also financed by the HRDF. 2 training schemes are specifically dedicated to supporting training in IT.

At the moment, the manufacturing and service sector contributes to the fund, with 21-23 defined sub-sectors each participating. Businesses in these sectors pay an HRD levy of 0.5% - 1% of the wages, depending on the size of the company (measured by the number of employees and paid-up capital). Small companies with fewer than 10 employees are in principle exempt from paying the levy. For companies in the manufacturing sector with fewer than 50 employees and capital below RM 2.5 million, participation in the scheme is optional; otherwise, the levy is mandatory. Altogether, over 13,000 employers with more than 2.2 million employees have registered so far.

Four strategic thrusts were defined for the HRDF: (1) increasing the number of workers under the fund, (2) strengthening the skills and competitiveness of the Malaysian workforce, (3) shaping a “supportive ecosystem” for learning and (4) providing in-depth training for SMEs. Ms. Wan Yon Shahima outlined the most recent measures taken to reach these targets. To increase the number of employees covered by the HRDF, for example, it is planned to expand the PSMB Act by adding further sub-sectors and make registration mandatory for smaller companies as well in the future.
Strengthening Stakeholders’ Involvement in TVET based on Cost–Benefit Analysis

Mr Horst Schwörer
Head of Sector and Policy Division Urban Development, KfW Entwicklungsbank

Mr Clemens Aipperspach
Managing Director, PLANCO Consulting GmbH, Germany

Mr. Aipperspach began by summarising the situation with regard to sources of finance in the Vietnamese TVET system. He stated the importance of business sector participation and described how in-company training is both an employment-relevant and cost-efficient method for delivering training. However, in Vietnam high training costs and unclear benefits are often used as an argument by employers for not increasing their training activities. At the same time, the costs and benefits of in-company training are in fact largely unknown.

Based on this understanding, Mr. Aipperspach outlined the approach of cost-benefit analysis. He observed that this instrument can help in entering into discussions with the business sector and overcoming negative prejudices on the part of employers. It may stimulate businesses to become more involved in TVET delivery by demonstrating both the monetary and non-monetary benefits. In the exemplary survey conducted, five companies in different industrial sectors were interviewed. All of them provide in-company training through workplace placements in welding, mechanics, and/or electrics. The analysis led to the result that the quantifiable (i.e. financial) benefits of work placements were mostly equal or greater than the costs involved. Furthermore, two types of businesses could be identified that might be attracted by cost-benefit analysis and motivated to increase their training activities:

1. Businesses interested in inexpensive short-term workers can be provided with proof that the quantifiable benefits of in-company training
exceed the related costs. Therefore, these businesses may offer more work placements but they will probably not improve the quality of the training.

2. Businesses interested in the long-term HRD of their staff. For them, the analysis process may create awareness about the positive impact of in-company training for later recruitment. Here, it can be helpful to identify even those benefits that are difficult to quantify. Cost-benefit analysis may prompt these businesses to make the effort to improve training quality.

At the end of the presentation, the opportunities and limitations of the instrument were briefly described. It was concluded that cost-benefit analysis in itself is not sufficient to increase company involvement in TVET in the short term but can support stakeholder dialogue at different levels and make companies think. Mr. Aipperspach therefore recommended that such analyses continue on a larger scale, e.g. by cross-checking the exemplary results of the initial survey.

Key highlights from this working session shared in the plenary summary sessions were:

1. Key issues/proposals for the way forward:
   - General
     - Country-specific context (e.g. political dynamics/will, society) have to be taken into consideration in all efforts made in support of the sustainable financing of TVET
     - It is important to engage in continuous awareness-raising/participative processes among all stakeholders
   - Fund generation
     - The state budget is the main source of finance in many Asian countries
In most cases, public funds are “not sufficient”
- Effectiveness/efficiency of utilisation is also important
- Businesses contribute little and need to be further motivated

Administration/allocation of funds
- Allocation mechanisms generally require the involvement of funding stakeholders
- TVET funds (e.g., Malaysia): an independent institution and sound legal basis are crucial

2. Considerations from Vietnam
- To secure a TVET Quality Breakthrough, what percentage of GDP should be spent on TVET? Experience from other countries on this issue?
- Experience gained in other countries for calculating the cost of one training discipline and of a group of training disciplines
- How is the budget to be used effectively based on TVET outcomes?
- How is finance to be generated for a TVET Fund? Should initial funding be granted from the state budget or contributions from businesses? The experience of HRDF in Malaysia is important.

TVET Teaching Staff

Background

In Vietnam, other ASEAN countries and beyond, skilled and motivated TVET teaching staff (i.e., teachers, instructors, and trainers) are widely regarded as one of the most important success factors in achieving the goal of improving the quality and demand orientation of TVET. Therefore, developing such skilled teaching staff is often included in TVET strategies as a strategic goal and is a form of intervention with major leverage potential (i.e., a “breakthrough solution”).

The point of reference for developing TVET teachers and trainers are the respective occupational requirements as specified in occupational standards for TVET teachers and trainers. An analysis of the occupational requirements reveals a significant difference between TVET teachers and trainers compared to other teachers. The job descriptions (or profiles) for TVET teachers and trainers are extremely demanding. They include on the one hand a whole range of in-depth “hands-on” practical skills and occupational theory required for performing the occupation they practise. In addition, competence in general pedagogy and an occupation-specific specialisation in didactics and teaching & learning methods and methodologies are also required.

The development of skilled TVET teachers and trainers needs to take account of the required number of TVET teaching staff (quantity) as well as the necess-
REGIONAL TVET CONFERENCE 2012 IN VIETNAM – DOCUMENTATION
sary job requirements and level (quality). Another important issue is the award-
ing of formal certificates required for teaching/training learners enrolled in
TVET programmes at different TVET levels. Approaches for the development
of skilled TVET teaching staff need to address on the one hand existing staff,
by providing adequate measures for upgrading and further developing them
(i. e. in-service training); on the other hand, efficient and effective solutions
for the initial or pre-service training of TVET teaching staff are also needed.

Keynote inputs

The topic for the second day of the conference was “TVET teachers – key
for TVET Quality Breakthrough” and input was provided in three keynote
inputs.

TVET Teacher Education in Vietnam – Vision to 2020

Assoc. Professor Dr. Cao Van Sam
Deputy General Director of GDVT

Assoc. Prof. Sam’s contribution related to one of the breakthrough solutions
for 2011 to 2020 and in particular to the development of TVET teachers
and vocational managers. In the international context of globalisation, this
is associated with more in-depth and broader integration into production,
academic practice and the labour market. Rationalisation measures in agri-
culture free up human resources for the further industrialisation and mod-
erisation of the economy and provide for international development and
integration into the ASEAN region in terms of production, academic prac-
tice, technology and the labour market.

By 2020, vocational training is to be aligned to the requirements of the la-
bour market, in particular in terms of quantity, quality and the relevant oc-
cupational structures and qualifications. The quality of selected training areas has to reach the level of that of ASEAN countries and other countries of the world. This will in turn achieve an improvement in national competitiveness, increased income for the workforce and a lasting reduction in poverty and lasting social security. It will require a gradual increase in trained employees by 40% by 2015 and 55% by 2020.

In order to achieve this, a sufficient number of trained TVET teachers will be needed who are available in accordance with the required occupational structure for the various levels. The teachers should have both teaching and occupational skills. The curricula required to achieve this are designed on a modular basis, aim to provide an integrated teacher training programme and are comparable at the national, regional and international level. Teachers will be trained in Vietnam and abroad, and the national standards as laid down in the regulations in Circular No. 30/2010/TT-BLDTBXH are to be observed. Engineers, high-achieving employees and practitioners with occupational skills and experience are to be recruited as teachers, and the training and continuing occupational development of teachers are to be based on key areas. Teacher training institutions are to be expanded, and the development of the necessary curricula and international partnerships will be focal points of the work. To improve their skills in line with the requirements of the economy, teachers will have to undertake an industry placement every two years and occupational training every two to five years to increase their practical capability in technologies and training methods. Teachers are to learn to use their own initiative for the continuous improvement of their training activities under the supervision of the directors of vocational training institutions, and the necessary social provisions are to be created.
TVET Teachers as the Backbone for TVET Quality Breakthrough

Prof. Dr. Shyamal Majumdar
Head of the UNESCO-UNEVOC International Centre, Bonn, Germany

Prof. Dr. Shyamal Majumdar started out with emphasizing that “Teachers matter and matter most” with Teacher Education being a priority of priorities of UNESCO. Then he singled out training for TVET teachers as the weak link in the vocational education system. There is a distinct lack of quality and quantity of teachers, and training is noticeably not demand-driven in line with the needs of the economy, but based instead on the courses run by the vocational training institutions. A further weak point is the large gender divide among TVET Teachers. Finally, there is a lack of an enabling environment for TVET Teachers. In some cases the institutions have outdated facilities and poor infrastructure. Also, teachers are mostly badly paid and have few opportunities for promotion. According to Prof. Shyamal, this is significant also in relation to the motivation of TVET Teachers. To provide training at high-quality, TVET Teachers will need golden hands and minds, but also hearts.

Prof. Dr. Majumdar explained in his address how a circular flow demonstrates how the quality of teacher training relates to the quality of the TVET system. A common definition of standards which describes the skills of TVET teachers is assumed. Following on from that, the circular flow is completed with the ability to attract the best candidates, teacher training and professional development, the functions of the management of institutions right through to support. An illustration was provided of a work-based TVET system in the form of five pillars which relates in particular to teacher training and focuses on the demand orientation of the economy.

Concluding his address, Prof. Majumdar stated: “We need a new type of TVET teacher and a new strategy to meet the challenges.”

A Practical and Future-oriented Approach to Innovative Vocational Teacher Training

Assoc. Professor Dr. Numyoot Songthanapitak, Rajamangala University of Technology, Phanyaburi, Thailand

Professor Dr. Numyoot Songthanapitak based his speech on the need for change in vocational teacher training. He assumed there would be sustained economic growth and the associated rapid socio-economic development in the ASEAN region and reasoned from this that TVET systems must respond. At the same time, TVET teachers must be prepared to act as change managers in order to shape this change. The regional cooperation platform for vocational teacher training came about through universities in China, Indonesia, Laos, Malaysia, Thailand and Vietnam as part of this development of ASEAN states. The joint enhance-
ment and improvement of TVET teacher training through joint activities and by sharing experience has served to support the process of reforming TVET in the countries concerned. The main concern is considered to be improving practical occupational skills and real working experience. The following solutions were suggested:

- Developing training pathways for practitioners, technicians and engineers to train as TVET teachers
- Introducing dual study programmes for TVET teachers
- Organising work experience placements in companies – including tailor-made programmes

In essence, the outcomes and projected requirements to come out of his speech were as follows. In order to sustain the experience-sharing process between partner institutions, the capacity to develop together needs to be created. This should be aimed at the adaptation and development of joint curricula to support the process of reform. Furthermore, the didactics for higher education and cooperation with companies as well as an expansion of the regional platforms for cooperation should be enhanced through exchanges with German universities.

**Expert Panel Discussion and Q&A Plenary**

Following on from the keynote inputs, selected key issues relating to the development of TVET teaching staff were addressed in an expert panel discussion followed by a Q&A plenary session. The panel comprised Assoc. Prof. Cao Van Sam (Deputy Director General, GDVT/MoLISA, Vietnam), Prof. Dr. Shyamal Majumdar (Head of UNESCO-UNEVOC), Associate Prof. Numyoot Songthana-pitak (President, Rajamangala University of Technology Thanyaburi, Thailand), Prof. Dr. Antonius Lipsmeier (Karlsruhe Institute of Technology, Germany), Dr.
Mochamad Bruri Triyono (Director, Faculty of Technology, State University of Yogyakarta, Indonesia), Dr. Bernhard Beckmann (Director, European Association of Vocational and Social Education, Germany) and Assoc. Prof. Bui The Dung (TVET Expert, Vietnam). In the first round of exchanges, each of the panelists was given a particular question to address by the conference moderators. The panelists then took questions from the floor.

**Questions by moderators to panelists**

*Question to Prof. Lipsmeier about the reasons for the shortage of TVET teachers in Vietnam and the difficulties - even in Germany - of recruiting enough TVET teachers:*

In his response to the question, Prof. Dr. Lipsmeier cited 3 main reasons.

Generally, teachers - and especially TVET teachers - are poorly paid compared to other jobs in the economy which require the same or similar qualifications. Therefore, an attractive salary for TVET teachers is a must (including an increase in salary if deemed necessary in order to be attractive compared to other job opportunities), especially for the Vietnamese Government. However, financial incentives alone will not be enough. Even the good salary a TVET teacher in Germany receives is not enough to reduce the shortage. Therefore, other solutions are needed.

TVET teachers are also granted relatively low prestige and status in society and in the education system, especially in Asian countries such as Japan, Korea and Vietnam. There are historical and cultural reasons for this. In Europe, Austria is a country where TVET enjoys high prestige compared to general education and where students from TVET institutions can enter university relatively easily. Hence, this is a country which is of interest to us and from which we need to learn. UNESCO also has an appropriate strategy to represent TVET clearly in general education to help make TVET more attractive.

The core curricula for TVET teacher training and teaching practice for teachers of industrial occupations include the major subjects of engineering science, mathematics, chemistry and physics and cover a range of basic science, complex theory and hands-on application. Such courses are perceived as somewhat demanding, requiring a great deal of study. Hence, some students may not want to attend such courses and prefer to choose easier ones.

*Question to Assoc. Prof. Dung about different curricular concepts in TVET teacher education at universities and colleges*

Prof. Dung elaborated on the major differences between the different concepts in TVET teacher education at vocational colleges and at universities. While accord-
ing to Prof. Dung universities follow a scientific logic with a cognitive focus based on vocational subjects or disciplines, vocational colleges follow an occupational and/or work activity logic with psychomotor learning based on the respective training occupation. Another difference is the proportion of theory and practice as well as the nature of the practical work covered. Typically, the proportion of practice is much higher in TVET teacher training programmes at vocational colleges than at universities. In addition, practical work at vocational colleges includes hand-on practical skills training in workshops (being closer to the reality of work) whereas practical work at universities is mostly focused on lab tasks.

As a result of these differences in concepts, TVET teachers graduating from universities are more knowledge-oriented whereas TVET teachers graduating from vocational colleges are more occupation-oriented. However, typically both types of graduates lack industrial experience.

Question to Dr. Mochamad Bruri Triyono for an in-depth explanation of the relevance of social and personal skills for TVET teachers:

Dr. Mochamad Bruri Triyono explained that in Indonesia, TVET teachers need to have a skill set comprising four main skills: pedagogic, personal, professional and social skills. Social skills refer to effective interaction and communication between TVET teachers and TVET students, other teachers, students’ parents and the community. It is therefore highly relevant and important.

Question to Assoc. Prof. Numyoot Songthanapitak about integrating the real work experience into TVET teacher education and training:

Prof. Numyoot Songthanapitak explained that his university has a policy of first starting with engineering programs with hands-on experience, secondly introducing science technology and its application and thirdly adding courses to
develop students as entrepreneurs. The programme includes integrated learning and industry work placements. Students spend 1/8 of the programme working in industry to accumulate industry experience on the production line. By end of the programme, the company assesses the performance of a student’s assignment based on what he or she gained during the process. This model increases the potential of a student’s employability by up to 100%.

He also highlighted the need to increase salaries and incentives for TVET teachers to attract and retain excellent TVET teachers and the need for good engineers to provide a transfer of knowledge as theory teachers in the TVET system.

Question to Dr. Bernhard Beckmann regarding recruiting and training practitioners as TVET teaching staff:

Dr. Beckmann underlined the fact that recruiting qualified TVET trainers and teachers is crucial for a TVET Quality Breakthrough. However, teachers graduating from universities are often not sufficiently qualified to meet the complete range of requirements relating to the duties and tasks of a TVET teacher providing demand-driven TVET. In particular, they typically do not have (enough) relevant industry experience in the particular occupational field in which they teach. Placing teachers in businesses for a certain time as is planned in Vietnam is an interesting idea but a systematic model needs to be developed first. An option that has proved to be successful is to recruit engineers and practitioners with industrial work experience and to train them to be TVET teachers and instructors/trainers.

Question to Prof. Dr. Majumdar about advanced pedagogy:

In his answer, Prof. Dr. Majumdar focused on the importance of generic skills in light of the dynamic and fast-changing world of work. Such generic skills
include, for example, basic time management, world of work culture and a capacity for critical thinking, problem-solving, creativity and innovation. Even more important are adaptive skills which are crucial, for example, for coping with fast changing technology. Instead of focusing on the specific details of a particular product or technology which will become outdated very quickly, Prof. Majumdar sees a concentration on generic principles - in terms of cluster skills - as a solution. With these skills, adaptation to technological change is much easier and it can also help a person to change from one occupation to another. In conclusion, generic skills should be an integral part of TVET staff development in an approach titled advanced pedagogy.

Question to Assoc. Prof. Cao Van Sam about the responsibilities of the directors of TVET institutions with regard to the development of TVET teachers and providing autonomy for TVET institutions:

Prof. Sam explained that TVET institutions have to compete with each other mainly on training quality. He quoted the undisputed fact that the quality of TVET teachers is one of the most important elements for creating good quality TVET delivery at a TVET institution. Beyond passion, teachers need to have creativity. In this regard, directors and management boards of TVET institutions play a central role by creating a stimulating and motivating environment. Therefore, empowering TVET institutions by giving them more operational autonomy is very important and Vietnam has been doing this in recent years. Prof. Sam explained that in the context of decentralisation and giving operational autonomy to TVET institutions, respective governing bodies provide the standards and policies not only for TVET teachers but also in many other aspects. It is then the responsibility of the directors and management boards of TVET institutions to promote the quality of their TVET institution and their teachers. In addition, the teachers themselves also need to use their own initiative to improve their capabilities.
Questions from participants

Do vocational training instructors need qualifications at university and diploma level, or do they only need qualifications at the various skill levels accompanied by training in pedagogy, social skills and management capacity?

Prof. Dr. Lipsmeier:
TVET teachers need a scientific background and that is produced by university education. Therefore, they need to have a university qualification. But in addition TVET teachers definitely also need practical skills and industrial experience.

Assoc. Prof. Dung:
There are different types of teachers in TVET with different functions, such as teaching theory or practical training in the lab or hands-on practical skills training in workshops. TVET teaching staff need qualifications based on their job profile, their duties and functions. TVET staff who teach theory and practice integrated need, for example, a bachelors degree, while for trainers and instructors this is not compulsory. For practical and hands-on training, practitioners with industrial work experience - at master craftsman level, for example - are highly suitable. It is important to open up learning pathways to develop all kinds of TVET teaching staff.

Prof. Dr. Majumdar
TVET teachers should not only know about theory but they also need to be aware and have an understanding of the operational level and the reality of the world of work. With this combination of knowledge and experience, they will not be shy or embarrassed when delivering teaching or training. To achieve this, we need to improve TVET teacher training, encourage innovation and come up with programme components that do not as yet exist in university but are helpful for TVET teachers in training them to an adequate standard and in enabling them to have more confidence in their teaching.

TVET teachers are required to have a great deal of technical knowledge, skills and pedagogy. Can we consider recruiting engineers, skilled workers and excellent TVET graduates, then equip them appropriately through further training courses? Instead of recruiting one person with “two skills”, can we recruit two available persons? Is that possible?

Assoc. Prof. Songthanapitak
In principle, it is possible to recruit excellent TVET graduates and then provide them with relevant further training so that they are capable of working as a TVET trainer.
**Dr. Beckmann**

It requires the active participation of the business community. However, government policies are often not sufficient. Leaders of companies need to be convinced to get involved in TVET delivery and to assign experienced and highly skilled workers who are able and willing to transfer their knowledge and skills to TVET trainees as in-company trainers. For these trainers, we can provide short courses, e.g. on pedagogy and other required aspects, to enable them to fulfil their function as in-company trainers.

**Dr. Mochamad Bruri Triyono**

In Indonesia engineers do not want to be teachers, and it is very difficult to recruit engineers and prepare them to be TVET teachers. However, in some specific fields such as agriculture and mining, there is a programme that allows engineers who want to be TVET teachers to be recruited and provided with one academic year’s training. In this programme, 20% of their time is spent on technical skills and 80% is used for pedagogical training.
III Conference Outcomes -
Conclusions, Recommendations
and the Way Ahead

Introductory remarks

As the recommendations of the TVET conference and lessons learned are fed back into the TVET reform process in ASEAN countries, TVET systems will be further improved. Societies as well as business sectors will benefit from these improvements. Enhanced regional TVET networking will facilitate a continuous exchange of experience and lessons learned. This will help ASEAN countries to successfully tackle challenges arising throughout their TVET reforms and the process of ASEAN integration.

Participants’ feedback

In the wrap-up session on the first conference day, participants shared their positive feedback about the conference. Participants who were interviewed stated that they had different individual priority interests in the conference topics, either occupational standards or cooperating with the business community. However, the participants agreed that all the conference topics were very relevant and that the conference had offered very interesting and sophisticated technical content. They shared the view that the conference provided a great deal of valuable knowledge and experience from other countries through the speakers’ presentations and in the sharing and discussions that took place among participants from ASEAN countries and Germany. Participants expressed the belief that – based on the conference outcomes – the joint efforts of ASEAN countries with support
from Germany will continue and that based on that TVET will continue to be developed and strengthened to meet the demands of ASEAN countries in the context of integration.

In addition, participants also expressed the view that the conference was well prepared and professionally organised, and that the chairs, speakers and moderators were excellent.

Statement by Prof. Dr. Kongsy Sengmany, Deputy Minister for Education and Sports, Lao PDR

In his statement, Professor Dr. Kongsy Sengmany, Deputy Minister for Education and Sports in the Lao PDR, emphasised that this particular TVET conference is highly important and relevant for the Lao PDR because his country is extremely interested in best practice and the experience of developing TVET at a dynamic and challenging time. In this regard, he touched on the commitment to meet the “Education for All Goals” by 2015, to promote learning and life skills as well as training skilled workers to contribute to achieving his country’s goal of leaving behind LDC status by 2020.

Professor Dr. Kongsy highlighted and appreciated the long tradition of fruitful cooperation with Germany, especially in the field of TVET, which he described as a good practice example of successful cooperation. He also gave a brief overview of the TVET reform process in the Lao PDR, highlighting the great political importance of developing human resources and TVET for the government and outlining the major challenges and the emphasis on improving the quality and effectiveness of education and training, particularly in the TVET sector. In this regard, Professor Dr. Kongsy referred to the four breakthroughs in critical issues required for TVET reform, namely responding to the National Socio-Economic Development Plan and ASEAN integration, providing access to TVET especially for people in rural and remote areas, raising the image of TVET and developing and upgrading the capacity of the framework for ensuring quality and effectiveness at all levels of education and training.

Professor Dr. Kongsy also expressed his appreciation for this type of TVET conference as a platform for sharing multinational experiences between ASEAN countries and Germany. Prof. Kongsy emphasised his opinion that the outcomes of the conference are very fruitful and encouraging, e.g. contributing to a closer cooperation and facilitating the process of ASEAN integration.

The Deputy Minister also formulated recommendations to facilitate cooperation (a) by conducting similar TVET conferences in the future and extending a warm invitation to stage one of the next TVET conferences in the Lao PDR, (b) by establishing a task force to follow up on valuable input, discussion results and
Regional TVET Conference 2012 in Vietnam – Documentation
recommendations, e. g. to identify common interests in preparing forthcoming events with reference to the forthcoming regional integration and cooperation, and (c) creating and maintaining a website which could, for example, be branded “ASEAN–German Dialogue on TVET Development”.

Professor Dr. Kongsy concluded his statement by expressing his sincere thanks to the organisers, all the supporters, speakers and participating countries for contributing to a meaningful and outstanding TVET conference.

Conference Summary Statements

Summary Statement by Ms. Jutta Frasch, German Ambassador to Vietnam

In her summary statement, Ms. Jutta Frasch, on behalf of the German government and BMZ State Secretary Mr. Hans-Jürgen Beerfeltz, first expressed her sincere thanks to the Government of Vietnam and MoLISA for co-organising the TVET conference together with BMZ.

She appreciated the fact that the timing of the TVET conference was fitting, in light of the pledge by ASEAN member states to establish a common market of goods, capital and services by 2015. In this regard, she emphasised the importance of fostering mobility of labour and - related to that - of demand-driven TVET for training skilled labourers.

Sharing experience and success stories as well as lessons learned was described by Ms. Frasch as one of the major achievements of the TVET conference. She also stated that the conference had clearly shown that TVET needs to be demand-driven and based on a close partnership with the business community. In this context, Ms Frasch referred to the German example as good practice to learn
from, highlighting the appreciation skilled workers enjoy in German society and the key success factors of the German Dual TVET System, particularly the enormous effort and active role of the business community in developing occupational profiles and in TVET delivery through the provision of learning opportunities integrated into the systematic work process. She emphasised the multiple gains generated by the active involvement of the business community in TVET for learners, businesses and the government.

With regard to the outcomes of the TVET conference, the German Ambassador also cited a number of other aspects. She stated that the one-and-a-half days of high quality input and stimulating discussion on the key topic of “TVET Quality Breakthrough” have received in-depth and broad public attention, which will also create expectations in terms of how the outcomes are followed up. Ms. Frasch also pointed out that the conference emphasised the importance and benefits of regional networking and cooperation. She shared her view of being impressed by the huge interest shown in the conference with distinguished participants from numerous countries and encouraged all participants to continue with and extend their sharing and cooperation.

The Ambassador also explained that Germany attaches great importance to the success of the economic integration of the ASEAN region. She therefore assured the conference of Germany’s continued support for TVET programmes in the region in order to make this happen, again in this context emphasising close cooperation with the business community as a key success factor.

Concluding her summary statement, Ms. Frasch expressed special thanks to the organisers, MOLISA and BMZ, and also to the organising team of GIZ, MoLISA and GDVT for all their efforts in undertaking the dedicated planning and preparatory work that made this TVET conference stimulating, action and outcome-focused and an enjoyable experience for all. She also noted her appreciation
of the quality of the presentations and input, whether as opening or keynote inputs, input for the working sessions or contributions to panel discussions and plenary sessions, all of which further enhanced the reflections in the background papers prepared as a stimulating input to the conference.

**Summary Statement by Mr. Nguyen Ngoc Phi, Vice Minister of MoLISA, Vietnam**

In his summary speech, MoLISA Vice Minister Phi stated that, after a day and a half of actively participating in the enthusiastic sharing of experience and participants’ discussions in plenary sessions as well as the five parallel working sessions, the joint TVET Conference had achieved positive results. He mentioned that it was the first time such a Regional TVET Conference had been organised, but it had nonetheless attracted nearly 300 participants from Germany, Vietnam and other countries in ASEAN and the region, comprising representatives from various ministries, government agencies, businesses and their representative bodies, associations and TVET institutions.

On behalf of senior ministers and officials at MoLISA, Vice Minister Phi respectfully thanked the Deputy Prime Minister of the Vietnamese Government as the conference’s guest of honour, the participants for their attendance and active participation and the numerous journalists attending and reporting on the conference. He also expressed his sincere thanks to the BMZ for the support given to the conference as co-organisers and to the joint conference team from MoLISA, GDVT and GIZ for their hard work and commitment in preparing and staging the TVET conference.

Vice Minister Phi highlighted the common view that had become evident in the conference that highly skilled and multi-skilled human resources are the key to the success of economies in the current competitive context and to social development. He emphasised the importance of achieving a TVET Quality Breakthrough in the effort to reform TVET systems to secure better demand orientation and quality. The Vice Minister also referred to the shared awareness in the region regarding the opportunities and challenges relating to TVET and the need to continue the sharing that had been initiated by the conference and to strengthen cooperation to improve TVET in each country. In this regard, he listed a number of core issues that would be relevant in future.

Firstly, Vice Minister Phi referred to the confirmation by the Vietnamese Government that the quality of human resources represents a strategic breakthrough and that TVETs plays an important role in improving the quality of human resources. He stressed that Vietnam needs to cooperate and learn from the experience of developed countries, especially from Germany, in order to make this breakthrough. He informed participants that the German and the Vietnamese
Governments have reached a consensus on continuing their cooperation in reforming the TVET system in Vietnam including refining Vietnamese TVET legislation in the spirit of accessing the positive experience and success factors in Germany that are appropriate to improving the situation in Vietnam. In this context, he also underlined the importance of continuous support through a TVET System Advisory Project, not only for Vietnam but also as a lesson learned for other countries.

Vice Minister Phi also stated that to secure the TVET Quality Breakthrough cooperation will be needed to develop occupational standards that will allow workers’ skills to be recognised in ASEAN as well as cooperation in TVET teacher development among the countries. He shared his view that cooperation with the business community, one of the success factors of the German Dual TVET System, is an effective mechanism for which the Conference has provided a great deal of input. He underlined the fact that cooperation between TVET institutions and businesses needs to be strengthened further. Referring to Vietnam, he recommended that the focus should first be on enhancing cooperation with German businesses in the joint training of workers in forms of cooperative TVET delivery in Vietnam and then extending this good practice to cooperating with more Vietnamese businesses.

Vice Minister Phi also pointed out that appropriate policies are needed which increase the roles and responsibilities of businesses and their representative bodies as stakeholders in TVET at policy and operational levels, e. g. in developing occupational standards, participating in TVET delivery and in the assessment of TVET student outcomes. He also referred to the message from representatives of participating countries that governments need to set up mechanisms and policies to attract the cooperation of FDI businesses including investment in their TVET system over the coming years.
With reference to the implementation of the ASEAN Leaders' Statement on Human Resources and Skills Development for Economic Recovery and Sustainable Growth” from October 2010, Deputy Minister Phi informed participants that in the context of the TVET conference representatives of ASEAN member countries reached a common understanding on a proposal to (i) establish an ASEAN Association for Vocational Training and that all conference participants should act as ambassadors linking up associations for vocational training; (ii) organise regular conferences of associations of vocational training in ASEAN member countries and their partners, and (iii) set up a network of associations for vocational training in ASEAN countries and their partners. He also informed participants that a proposal has been extended to Germany and the European Association of Institutes for Vocational Training to share their experience and lessons learned on the process of setting up their network and to provide support in setting up an ASEAN Association for Vocational Training.

Vice Minister Phi concluded his summary statement by stating that, although the conference has come to an end, the dialogue and cooperation in TVET will continue on into the future. On behalf of the Vietnamese Government, he expressed his sincere thanks for the effective cooperation with the German Government in the social-economic development of Vietnam in general and in the development of TVET in particular and to BMZ for its cooperation with and active support for MoLISA.

Last but not least, he wished the participants health and happiness and hoped that their successful involvement in the TVET conference would contribute to TVET development - as well as development overall - in their own countries.
References

1. Background Papers

General Technical Background Paper
on behalf of BMZ, Deutsche Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit (GIZ) GmbH
Vietnamese TVET Background Paper
General Department of Vocational Training/MoLISA

2. Input Presentations

Opening Session

Opening Statement
Minister Mdm Pham Thi Hai Chuyen
Ministry of Labour, Invalids and Social Affairs (MoLISA), Viet Nam

Opening Statement
State Secretary Hans-Jürgen Beerfeltz
German Federal Ministry of Economic Cooperation and Development (BMZ)

Welcome Address
Deputy Prime Minister Nguyen Thien Nhan
Socialist Republic of Viet Nam

TVET Development Strategy 2011-2020 in Viet Nam and Opportunities in Cooperation between Viet Nam - Germany and other countries in the region
Dr. Nguyen Tien Dung, Director General, General Department of Vocational Training (GDVT)/MoLISA, Viet Nam

BMZ Support in TVET System Development in Viet Nam
Dr. Horst Sommer, Priority Area Coordinator TVET. Viet Nam
Opportunities / Challenges for TVET in the ASEAN Community
Mr. Oeun Tep, Representative Current Chair of ASEAN Senior Labour Officials Meeting (SLOM),
Deputy Director General Department of TVET / Ministry of Labour and Vocational Training, Cambodia

Occupational Standards

Keynotes:
Occupational Standards – a Key in TVET Reform in Viet Nam in the Context of ASEAN Integration
Associate Prof. Dr. Duong Duc Lan, Deputy-Director General, General Department of Vocational Training (GDVT)/MoLISA, Viet Nam
Occupational Standard Development and Implementation – the Indonesian Experience
Inspector General I Gusti Putu Laksaguna, Ministry of Tourism and creative Economy, Indonesia
International Experience in Occupational Standard Development and Implementation
Dr. Michaela Baur, Acting Head, Department Sustainable Economic Development / Head, Competence Center TVET & Labour Market GIZ Eschborn, Germany

Working Session Inputs:
Harmonization and transfer from occupational standards to TVET standards
Mr. Nguyen Quang Viet, Director, Research Center for Skills Development and TVET Standards, National Institute for Vocational Training (NIVT), Viet Nam
Role of National Training Council in occupational standard and TVET standard setting – experiences from Lao PDR
Phouvieng Phoumilay, Deputy Director General, Technical and Vocational Education Department, Ministry of Education and Sports, Lao PDR
Occupational standards as basis for certification of existing workforce
Mr. Nguyen Chi Truong, Deputy Director, Skill Standard Department, General Department of Vocational Training (GDVT)/MoLISA, Viet Nam
Indonesian experiences and lessons learned in testing/assessment against occupational standards
Ms Ida Trisnasari, ASEAN Tourism Professional Monitoring Committee, Indonesia
Cooperation with Business Community

Keynotes:
Key Success Factors of German TVET - Cooperation with Business Community
Prof. Dr. Friedrich Hubert Esser, President, Federal Institute for Vocational Education and Training (BIBB), Germany
Increasing Involvement of the Business Community in TVET – Objectives, Approaches and Benefits
Dr. Le Van Hien, Director, LILAMA 2 Technical & Technology College, Viet Nam
Key Factors for Sustainable Cooperation with Enterprises in TVET Delivery – Malaysian Experiences
Mr. Yusoff Md. Sahir, Managing Director, German-Malaysian Institute (GMI), Malaysia

Working Session Inputs:
Teaching Industry – strengthening partnership with industry in Indonesia
Ir. Tjahjono Anang, Director, Technical and Vocational Education, Ministry of Education and Culture, Indonesia
Increasing Involvement of the Business Community in TVET – Objectives, Challenges and Opportunities from Enterprise perspective
Mr Dang Quoc Anh, Vice General Director, LILAMA 18, JOINT STOCK COMPANY, Viet Nam
Vietnamese approach to strengthen collaboration of TVET stakeholders
Assoc. Prof. Dr. Mac Van Tien, Director, National Institute for Vocational Training (NIVT), Viet Nam
School- enterprise cooperation—the Lao-German Technical School Experience
Mr Somlith Virivong, Director Lao-German Technical School, Lao PDR

TVET Financing

Working Session Inputs:
Approaches in TVET Financing in Viet Nam
Mr Nguyen Chien Thang, Deputy Head, Planning and Finance Department, General Department of Vocational Training (GDVT)/MoLISA, Viet Nam
Experiences from Human Resource Development Fund Malaysia
Ms Wan Yon Shahima, Deputy CEO, Human Resource Development Council, Malaysia
Strengthening Stakeholders Engagement in TVET based on Cost – Benefit Analysis
Mr. Horst Schwörer, Head of Division, Sector and Policy Division Urban Development, KfW Development Bank
Mr Clemens Aipperspach, TVET Financing Expert, Germany
TVET Teachers

Keynotes:

Training of TVET Teachers in Viet Nam – Vision to 2020
Associate Prof. Cao Van Sam, Deputy-Director General, General Department of Vocational Training (GDVT)/MoLISA, Viet Nam

TVET Teachers as Backbone for TVET Quality Breakthrough,
Prof. Dr. Shyamal Majumdar, Head, UNESCO-UNEVOC, Former Director General, Colombo Plan Staff College for Technician Education

Regional Cooperation in TVET Teacher Education and Training
Assoc. Prof. Dr. Numyoot Songthanapitak, President, Rajamangala University of Technology Thanyaburi (RMUTT), Thailand
## Conference Programme

### Tuesday - 9th of October 2012

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Event</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>08:00 – 22:00</td>
<td>Registration at Melia Hotel Function Room 5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19:00 – 21:00</td>
<td>Welcome Reception for Conference Participants Thang Long Ballroom, 7th Floor</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Wednesday - 10th of October 2012

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Event</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>07:15 – 08:15</td>
<td>Registration at Melia Hotel Foyer Grand Ballroom, Level 1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Opening Session**

Ceremonial Master: Mdm Le Kim Dung, Department of International Cooperation, Ministry of Labour, Invalids and Social Affairs (MoLISA), Viet Nam Grand Ballroom, Level 1

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Event</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>08:30 – 10:30</td>
<td>Opening Minister Mdm Pham Thi Hai Chuyen Ministry of Labour, Invalids and Social Affairs (MoLISA), Viet Nam State Secretary Hans-Jürgen Beerfeltz German Federal Ministry of Economic Cooperation and Development (BMZ) Welcome Deputy Prime Minister Nguyen Thien Nhan Socialist Republic of Viet Nam Conference Photo of High Ranking Delegates</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Opening Inputs**

Chaired by Vice Minister Nguyen Ngoc Phi Ministry of Labour, Invalids and Social Affairs (MoLISA), Viet Nam

- **TVET Development Strategy 2011-2020 in Viet Nam and Opportunities in Cooperation between Viet Nam - Germany and other countries in the region**
  - Dr. Nguyen Tien Dung, Director General, General Department of Vocational Training (GDVT)/MoLISA, Viet Nam

- **BMZ Support in TVET System Development in Viet Nam**
  - Dr. Horst Sommer, Priority Area Coordinator TVET, Viet Nam

- **Opportunities / Challenges for TVET in the ASEAN Community**
  - Mr. Oeun Tep, Representative Current Chair of ASEAN Senior Labour Officials Meeting (SLOM), Deputy Director General Department of TVET / Ministry of Labour and Vocational Training, Cambodia
## Conference Programme

### Plenary Session - Occupational Standards and Cooperation with the Business Community

**Moderators:** Mr Sreenivas Narayanan, Mr Joachim Döninghaus

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Activity</th>
<th>Location</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>10:30 – 11:00</td>
<td>Coffee / Tea Break</td>
<td>Foyer Grand Ballroom, Level 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11:00 – 12:00</td>
<td>Keynote Inputs - Occupational Standards</td>
<td>Grand Ballroom</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12:00 – 13:30</td>
<td>Lunch</td>
<td>Thang Long Room</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13:30 – 14:30</td>
<td>Keynote Inputs - Cooperation with the Business Community</td>
<td>Grand Ballroom</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14:30 – 14:45</td>
<td>Coffee / Tea Break</td>
<td>Foyer Function Rooms (upstairs)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Keynote Inputs - Occupational Standards

- **Occupational Standards – a Key in TVET Reform in Viet Nam in the Context of ASEAN Integration**
  - Associate Prof. Dr. Duong Duc Lan
  - Deputy-Director General, General Department of Vocational Training (GDVT)/MoLISA, Viet Nam

- **Occupational Standard Development and Implementation – the Indonesian Experience**
  - Inspector General I Gusti Putu Laksaguna
  - Ministry of Tourism and creative Economy, Indonesia

- **International Experience in Occupational Standard Development and Implementation**
  - Dr. Michaela Baur
  - Acting Head, Department Sustainable Economic Development / Head, Competence Center TVET & Labour Market GIZ Eschborn, Germany

### Keynote Inputs - Cooperation with the Business Community

- **Key Success Factors of German TVET - Cooperation with Business Community**
  - Prof. Dr. Friedrich Hubert Esser
  - President, Federal Institute for Vocational Education and Training (BIBB), Germany

- **Increasing Involvement of the Business Community in TVET – Objectives, Approaches and Benefits**
  - Dr. Le Van Hien
  - Director, LILAMA 2 Technical & Technology College, Viet Nam

- **Key Factors for Sustainable Cooperation with Enterprises in TVET Delivery – Malaysian Experiences**
  - Mr. Yusoff Md. Sahir
  - Managing Director, German-Malaysian Institute (GMI), Malaysia
### Conference Programme

**Regional TVET-Conference in Viet Nam - 10./11. October 2012**

**TVET Quality Breakthrough**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Parallel Working Sessions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 14:45–16:30 | Group 1 - Function Room 4, Level 2  
Occupational Standards – Key Reference Point for Demand-oriented TVET  
Facilitation team:  
Dr. Michaela Baur, Acting Head, Department Sustainable Economic Development / Head, Competence Center TVET & Labour Market GIZ Eschborn, Germany  
Mr. Nguyen Quang Viet, Director, Research Center for Skills Development and TVET Standards, National Institute for Vocational Training (NIVT), Viet Nam  
Inputs:  
Harmonization and transfer from occupational standards to TVET standards  
Mr. Nguyen Quang Viet  
Director, Research Center for Skills Development and TVET Standards, National Institute for Vocational Training (NIVT), Viet Nam  
Role of National Training Council in occupational standard and TVET standard setting – experiences from Lao PDR  
Phouveng Phounlay, Deputy Director General, Technical and Vocational Education Department, Ministry of Education and Sports, Lao PDR  
Group Discussion: Reflections and Exchange on Experiences, Lessons Learned and Outlook  |
|        | Group 2 - Function Room 7, Level 2  
Involving the Business Community in Occupational Standard Setting, Assessment and Certification in Asia  
Facilitation team:  
Dr. Harry Stolte, Teamleader, GIZ Human Capacity Development TVET / UNEVOC Centre Magdeburg, Germany  
Prof. Dr. Bui The Dung, TVET expert, Viet Nam  
Inputs:  
Occupational standards as basis for certification of existing workforce  
Mr. Nguyen Chi Truong, Deputy Director, Skill Standard Department, General Department of Vocational Training (GDVT)/MoLISA, Viet Nam  
Indonesian experiences and lessons learned in testing/assessment against occupational standards  
Ms Ida Trisnasari, ASEAN Tourism Professional Monitoring Committee, Indonesia  |
|        | Group 3 - Function Room 6, Level 2  
Enabling Framework for Collaboration of TVET Stakeholders  
Facilitation team:  
Dr. Gunnar Specht, TVET Expert, Germany  
Ms. Hoang Ngoc Cam Duong, Vietnamese Chamber of Commerce and Industry (VCCI), Viet Nam  
Inputs:  
Teaching Industry – strengthening partnership with industry in Indonesia  
Ir. Tjahjono Anang, Director, Technical and Vocational Education, Ministry of Education and Culture, Indonesia  
Increasing Involvement of the Business Community in TVET – Objectives, Challenges and Opportunities from Enterprise perspective  
Mr. Dang Quoc Anh, Vice General Director, LILAMA 18 JOINT STOCK COMPANY, Viet Nam  
Group Discussion: Reflections and Exchange on Experiences, Lessons Learned and Outlook  |
|        | Group 4 - GB Section 3, Level 1  
Cooperative modes of TVET delivery  
Facilitation team:  
Mr. Michael Wiechert, Head of Division, International Co-operation and Advisory Services, Federal Institute for Vocational Education and Training (BIBB), Germany  
Assoc. Prof. Dr. Mac Van Tien, Director, National Institute for Vocational Training (NIVT), Viet Nam  
Inputs:  
Vietnamese approach to strengthen collaboration of TVET stakeholders  
Assoc. Prof. Dr. Mac Van Tien, Director, National Institute for Vocational Training (NIVT), Viet Nam  
School-enterprise cooperation – the Lao-German Technical School Experience  
Mr. Somlith Virivong, Director Lao-German Technical School, Lao PDR  
Group Discussion: Reflections and Exchange on Experiences, Lessons Learned and Outlook  |
|        | Group 5 - Function Room 3, Level 2  
Sustainable TVET financing  
Facilitation team:  
Dr. Ruly Marianti, GIZ Senior Technical Advisor, Indonesian-German Programme Sustainable Economic Development – TVET, Indonesia  
Mr. Clemens Aipperspach, TVET Financing Expert, Germany  
Inputs:  
Approaches in TVET Financing in Viet Nam  
Mr. Nguyen Chien Thang, Deputy Head, Planning and Finance Department, General Department of Vocational Training (GDVT)/MoLISA, Viet Nam  
Experiences from Human Resource Development Fund Malaysia  
Ms. Wan Yon Shahima, Deputy CEO, Human Resource Development Council, Malaysia  
Strengthening Stakeholders Engagement in TVET based on Cost – Benefit Analysis  
Mr. Horst Schwörer, Head of Division, Sector and Policy Division Urban Development, KfW Development Bank  
Mr. Clemens Aipperspach, TVET Financing Expert, Germany  
Group Discussion: Reflections and Exchange on Experiences, Lessons Learned and Outlook  |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Event</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>16:30 – 17:00</td>
<td>Coffee / Tea Break</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Grand Ballroom Foyer, Level 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17:00 – 18:00</td>
<td>Summary Session</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Grand Ballroom</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18:30 – 20:00</td>
<td>Dinner</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Thang Long Room</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Thursday-11th of October 2012**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Event</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>08:30 – 09:00</td>
<td>Impressions from Day 1 and Introduction to 2nd Conference Day</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Grand Ballroom</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Plenary Session - TVET Teachers - Key for TVET Quality Breakthrough**

Moderators: Mr. Sreenivas Narayanan, Mr. Joachim Döninghaus

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Event</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>09:00 – 10:00</td>
<td>Keynote Inputs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Training of TVET Teachers in Viet Nam – Vision to 2020</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Associate Prof. Cao Van Sam,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Deputy-Director General General Department of Vocational Training (GDVT)/MoLISA, Viet Nam</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>TVET Teachers as Backbone for TVET Quality Breakthrough</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Prof. Dr. Shyamal Majumdar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Head, UNESCO-UNEVOC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Former Director General, Colombo Plan Staff College for Technician Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Regional Cooperation in TVET Teacher Education and Training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Assoc. Prof. Dr. Numyoot Songthanapatik</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>President, Rajamangala University of Technology Thanyaburi (RMUTT), Thailand</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Event</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>10:00 – 10:30</td>
<td>Coffee / Tea Break</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Foyer Grand Ballroom</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Conference Programme

**Regional TVET-Conference in Viet Nam - 10./11. October 2012**
**TVET Quality Breakthrough**

### 10:30 – 11:30
**Expert Panel Discussion and Plenary Questions & Answers**
Grand Ballroom

- **Associate Prof. Cao Van Sam**  
  Deputy-Director General, General Department of Vocational Training (GDVT)/MoLISA, Viet Nam

- **Prof. Dr. Shyamal Majumdar**  
  Head of UNESCO-UNEVOC, Former Director General of the Colombo Plan Staff College for Technician Education

- **Assoc. Prof. Dr. Numyoot Songthanapitak**  
  President, Rajamangala University of Technology Thanyaburi (RMUTT), Thailand

- **Prof. Dr. Antonius Lipsmeier**  
  Karlsruhe Institute of Technology, Germany

- **Dr. Triyono Mochammad Bruri**  
  Director, Faculty of Technology, State University of Yogyakarta (UNY), Indonesia

- **Dr. Bernhard Beckmann**  
  Director, European Association of Vocational and Social Education, Germany

- **Asoc. Prof. Dr. Bui The Dung**  
  TVET Expert, Viet Nam

### 11:30 – 11:45
**Statement by Prof. Dr. Kongsy Sengmany, Vice Minister of Education and Sports, Lao PDR**
Grand Ballroom

### Conclusions, Recommendations and the Way Ahead
Moderators: Mr Sreenivas Narayanan, Mr Joachim Döninghaus
Grand Ballroom

### 11:45 – 12:20
**Summary Statements**

- **German Ambassor Mdm Jutta Frasch**  
  German Embassy, Hanoi

- **Vice Minister Mr Nguyen Ngoc Phi**  
  Ministry of Labour, Invalids and Social Affairs (MoLISA), Viet Nam

### 12:20 - 12:30
**Administrative Announcements**
### Conference Programme

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Event</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 12:30 – 14:00 | Lunch  
Grand Ballroom                                                |

#### Side Events e.g.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Event</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>10th -11th Oct, all day</td>
<td><strong>Photo Exhibition on TVET</strong> in Viet Nam at Melia Hotel</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| 11th Oct, from 8:00 | **DIDACTA-Exhibition at Melia Hotel**  
Exhibition of the Didacta Association of the German Education Industry and its affiliated members promoting the application of high-quality teaching and learning aids, furnishing and equipment designed to meet the unique needs of all learning environments.  |
| 11th Oct, from 14:30 | **Visit to Vocational College of Economics - Engineering Bac Ninh**  
Get first impressions on Vietnamese TVET institutions.  |
12:30 – 14:00 Lunch
Grand Ballroom

Side Events e.g.

10th - 11th Oct, all day
Photo Exhibition on TVET in Viet Nam at Melia Hotel

11th Oct, from 8:00
DIDACTA-Exhibition at Melia Hotel
Exhibition of the Didacta Association of the German Education Industry and its affiliated members promoting the development of teaching and learning aids, furnishing and equipment designed to meet the unique needs of all learning environments.

11th Oct, from 14:30
Visit to Vocational College of Economics - Engineering Bac Ninh
Get first impressions on Vietnamese TVET institutions.